

RARP Substation 255 Alternatives - Criteria Matrix			Article VII - Exhibit 3 Alternatives										IUSA Alternatives		Administrative Law Judge	Passero Alternative	NYS AG & Mkts	DPS Alternative
Category	Item	Criteria	1	2	3	4	5	6A	7 - Article VII Certified Site Alternative	7 - Conservation Easement Alternative	7 - Agricultural Mitigation Alternative	8	20	15	16	8A	9	
Real Estate	A.1	Project Considerations																
	A.1.a	Substation Fully Located on RG&E Property? (y/n)	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	
	A.1.b	Forested Clearing Needed for Substation (acres)	5.9	2.5	2.4	0.5	0.0	0.4	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	5.4	0.2	6.4	3.4	2.5	
	A.1.c	Total Transmission Centerline Length (miles)	8.0	4.5	3.9	3.8	3.7	5.7	3.8	3.6	3.6	4.0	4.2	5.0	4.0	3.8	3.8	
	A.1.d	Forested Clearing Needed for ROW (acres)	67.9	34.0	27.6	18.3	23.5	46.5	20.6	25.2	22.9	19.4	21.2	37.0	30.3	18.5	20.0	
	A.1.e	New Access Road Length (miles)	0.20	0.02	0.02	0.50	0.24	0.19	0.52	0.52	0.52	0.21	0.19	0.03	0.08	0.27	0.08	
	A.1.f	Forested Clearing Needed for Access Road (acres)	0.2	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.1	0.1	0.2	0.0	0.0	0.0	
	A.2	Land Area Needs																
	A.2.a	Properties Affected by Transmission Lines (#)	34	21	19	17	18	24	14	15	16	19	19	18	21	18	18	
	A.2.b	Total Land Needed for Transmission Line ROW (acres)	173	105	90	84	82	124	79	75	76	75	76	115	90	74	73	
	A.2.c	Total Land Needed for Substation (acres)	12	12	12	12	12	12	11	11	11	12	12	12	12	12	12	
	A.2.d	Properties Affected by Substation (#)	4	1	1	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	2	4	3	1	1	
	A.2.e	Clearing Needed for Substation and Access Roads (acres)	6.1	2.5	2.4	0.5	0.0	0.4	1.5	1.5	1.5	0.1	5.5	0.4	6.4	3.4	2.5	
	A.2.f	Total Area: Transmission Line ROW Corridor and Substation (acres)	185	117	102	96	94	136	90	86	87	87	88	127	102	86	85	
	A.3	Noise Receptors																
A.3.a	Residences Within 200' of Transmission Line ROW (#)	6	6	4	3	4	3	1	1	1	0	1	3	4	0	9		
A.3.b	Distance of Structures to Closest Residence (feet)	0	0	0	0	0	0	85	85	85	210	199	0	0	210	122		
A.3.c	Residences Within 200' of Proposed Substation (#)	0	2	1	0	0	0	2	2	2	0	0	0	0	0	0		
A.3.d	Distance of Substation to Closest Residence (feet)	778	0	128	1367	905	659	1584	1584	1584	867	496	630	664	645	341		
Land Use	B.1	Residences																
	B.1.a	Other Residences Within 200' - 300' of Additional T-line ROW (#)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	5	0	0	0	5	4	
	B.1.b	Other Residences Within 300' - 500' of Additional T-line ROW (#)	14	6	5	6	6	9	5	5	5	11	11	8	9	11	24	
	B.1.c	Substation: Single Property Owner? (y/n)	N	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y	Y	Y	
	B.1.d	Other Residences Within 200' - 300' of Substation (#)	0	0	1	0	0	0	2	2	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	
	B.1.e	Other Residences Within 300' - 500' of Substation (#)	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	8	
	B.2	Consistency with Comprehensive Plans - C = Conservation, A-C = Agricultural-Conservation, RC-R = Resource Conservation - Residential, RC-L = Resource Conservation - Limited Use																
	B.2.a	Future Land Use Map (Chili sites)	A-C	A-C	A-C	A-C	A-C	A-C	A-C	A-C	A-C	-	-	A-C	A-C	-	-	
	B.2.b	Generalized Land Use Map (Henrietta sites)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	RC-R	RC-L	-	-	RC-R	RC-L	
	B.2.c	Alternative Consistent with Town Comprehensive Plan? (y/n)	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Y	Y	
B.3	Recreation Lands Impacted																	
B.3.a	Public/Conservation Easement Lands Within 500' of T-line ROW (y/n)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		
B.3.b	Public/Conservation Easement Lands Within 500' of T-line ROW (acres)	27.4	28.9	30.5	8.8	38.5	27.4	0.1	41.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	38.4	29.3	0.1	0.1		
Permitting	C.2	Environmental Permits																
	C.2.a	Federal Wetlands Permit Required? (y/n)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
	C.2.b	Wild, Scenic and Recreational Rivers (y/n)	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	
	C.2.c	Section 10 Rivers Permit Required? (y/n)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
	C.2.d	Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan Required? (y/n)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
	C.2.e	SPDES General Permit Required? (y/n)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
	C.2.f	Consistency with Coastal Management Program and LWRP?	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	
	C.2.g	Floodplain Permit Required? (y/n)	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	
	Environmental	D.1	Water Resources															
D.1.a		USACE-Regulated Wetlands Impacted (acres)	50.5	22.4	18.1	9.6	13.4	38.5	7.8	12.4	12.2	11.2	9.9	25.9	17.7	11.2	9.7	
D.1.b		NYSDEC-Regulated Freshwater Wetlands Impacted (acres)	37.6	15.2	10.8	8.6	9.5	29.0	6.8	11.5	7.9	2.3	6.9	18.7	8.4	2.3	2.3	
D.1.c		NYSDEC-Regulated Freshwater Wetlands Adjacent Areas Impacted (acres)	10.9	7.4	7.9	6.2	5.4	9.1	6.1	7.7	6.9	0.8	4.4	9.1	7.7	0.8	0.8	
D.1.d		Current Wetland Delineation Available? (y/n)	N	N	Y	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	N	N	N	
D.1.e		Wetland Mitigation Needed By Row/in acres, assumes a 1.5:1 mitigation ratio	58.3	20.9	14.4	8.0	13.7	42.2	7.9	14.4	10.7	5.3	4.1	30.8	12.1	5.3	3.4	
D.1.f		Wetland Mitigation Needed By Access Road/in acres, assumes a 3:1 mitigation ratio	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	2.6	2.6	2.6	0.0	1.7	0.9	0.0	0.0	0.0	
D.1.g		Wetland Mitigation Needed By Substation/in acres, assumes a 3:1 mitigation ratio	5.0	12.0	11.6	3.8	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	3.0	0.1	12.7	0.0	0.0	0.0	
D.1.h		Protected Streams Crossed (#)	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
D.1.i		Navigable River (Genesee) Crossed? (y/n)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
D.1.j		Hydric Soils Crossed by T-Line ROW (acres)	75.8	48.3	37.9	32.2	27.7	58.9	29.0	26.9	30.4	27.0	30.7	50.2	41.1	26.7	30.6	
D.1.k		Hydric Soils Crossed by Substation and Access Roads (Acres)	0.2	7.2	10.9	0.3	0.1	0.2	6.0	6.0	6.0	5.5	11.0	3.3	12.3	1.7	11.2	
D.1.l		FEMA NFIP-100 Year Floodplains Crossed / Substation / Access Roads (acres)	50 / 0 / 0	33.5 / 3.8 / 0	26.9 / 11.2 / 0.1	25.5 / 1.7 / 0	16.6 / 0.1 / 0	44.2 / 0 / 0	19.2 / 0 / 1.2	16.6 / 0 / 1.2	18.7 / 0 / 1.2	16.4 / 0 / 0	18.7 / 0 / 0	41.5 / 0.8 / 0.7	29.1 / 12.0 / 0.3	16.4 / 0 / 0	19.5 / 0 / 0	
D.1.m		FEMA NFIP-500 Year Floodplains Crossed / Substation / Access Roads (acres)	3.4 / 0 / 0	1.3 / 0.1 / 0	1.6 / 0.1 / 0	4.5 / 0.4 / 0	1.4 / 0.1 / 0	2.2 / 0 / 0	3.1 / 0 / 0.4	3 / 0 / 0.4	3.56 / 0 / 0.4	4.0 / 0 / 0	2.9 / 0 / 0	2.3 / 1.1 / 0.4	1.4 / 0.0 / 0	4.0 / 0 / 0	3.0 / 0 / 0	
D.2		Agricultural Resource Considerations																
D.2.a		Total Area of Crop Field Management Units (CFMU) Crossed (acres)	728	633	531	554	492	672	530	495	530	212	168	580	531	194	177	
D.2.b		Impacts to NYS Ag & Mkts-Designated Agricultural District Lands (acres)	101	83	69	63	60	92	57	53	54	41	38	93	66	36	38	
D.2.c		Prime Agricultural Soils Crossed by T-Line ROW (acres)	101	67	60	65	58	70	59	55	59	55	63	77	59	54	57	
D.2.d		Prime Agricultural Soils Crossed by Substation and Access Roads (acres)	12	6	3	12	12	9	14	14	14	12	15	10	1	11	11	
D.2.e		Important Farmland Soils Crossed by T-Line ROW (acres)	45	13	9	7	12	28	8	8	8	11	4	10	4	12	4	
D.2.f	Important Farmland Soils Crossed by Substation and Access Roads (acres)	1	3	0	0	1	6	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0		
D.3	Cultural Resource Considerations																	
D.3.a	Location within Archaeological Sensitive Areas? (y/n)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		
D.3.b	Historic Structures Within One Mile of T-line ROW (#)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		
D.3.c	Historic Structures Within One Mile of Substation (#)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		
D.4	General Environmental Considerations																	
D.4.a	Invasive Species Survey Available (y/n)	N	N	N	Y	N	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	N	N	N		
D.4.b	T&E Species/Unique Habitat Data Available (y/n)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		
D.4.c	Potential Visual Impacts to Resources within Three Miles (#)	32	29	27	24	25	30	24	24	24	20	22	28	26	20	20		
Engineering	E.1	Transmission Line Route Mileage																
	E.1.a	Total 345 kV Circuit 40 Transmission Line Length (miles)	5.3	3.7	3.38	2.71	2.91	3.96	1.84	1.84	1.84	0.63	1.33	3.64	3.48	0.6	1.05	
	E.1.b	Total 115 kV Circuit 940 Transmission Line Length (miles)	2.4	0.59	0.27	0.67	0.37	1.49	1.55	1.44	1.44	2.99	2.39	0	0.24	2.78	2.16	
	E.1.c	Total 115 kV Circuit 941 Transmission Line Length (miles)	2.4	0.58	0.27	0.67	0.37	1.48	1.55	1.45	1.45	2.99	2.39	0	0.26	2.79	2.16	
	E.1.d	Total 115 kV Circuit 906 Transmission Line Length (miles)	-0.22	0.27	0.27	0	0.42	-0.22	0	0.42	-0.06	-0.66	0	0.41	-0.66	-0.66	-0.66	
	E.1.e	Total 345 kV NYPA Transmission Line Reroute Length (miles)	0.12	0.14	0.13	0.19	0.17	0.13	0.17	0.17	0.17	0.16	0.16	0.53	0.16	0.18	0.19	
	E.2	Substation Considerations																
	E.2.a	Proximity to Existing NYPA Transmission Lines (feet)	75	140	152	149	223	75	188	188	188	116	153	1245	130	240	111	
	E.2.b	Proximity to Existing Empire Gas Pipeline (feet)	297	490	376	375	147	0	114	114	114	42	78	1471	55	465	336	
	E.2.c	Site Elevation Range (feet above sea level)	556-591	523-571	522-532	520-544	523-554	567-593	525-544	525-545	525-544	554-589	535-560	526-535	524-525	546-565	536-576	
E.2.d	Current Availability of LIDAR? (y/n)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		
E.2.e	Current Availability of Buried Utilities Survey (y/n)	N	N	N	Y	N	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	N	N	N	N		
E.2.f	Suitable for Filling (y/n)	Y	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	N	Y		
E.3	Access Road Considerations																	
E.3.b	Conflicts with Other Existing Utilities (y/n)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		
Impact to Project Budget	F.1	Transmission Line Route Cost Impact																
	F.1.a	Transmission Line Route Cost Impact (\$1,000)	\$8,387	\$1,280	(\$245)	\$323	(\$4)	\$3,315	Base	\$248	(\$336)	(\$498)	(\$133)	\$9,984	\$713	(\$266)	(\$533)	
	F.1.b	TL ROW Wetland Mitigation Cost Impact (\$1,000)	\$4,535	\$1,165	\$581	\$9	\$521	\$3,079	Base	\$586	\$248	(\$238)	(\$348)	\$2,057	\$373	(\$238)	(\$408)	
	F.2	Access Road Route Cost Impact																
	F.2.a	Access Road Route Cost Impact (\$1,000)	(\$247)	(\$349)	(\$349)	\$133												