

under Chapter XVIII, Title 19 of NYCRR Part 900, §900-2.9 (Section 94-c of the New York State Executive Law).

Specifically, we are requesting your input on an inventory of **visually sensitive resources**, potential **visual simulation locations**, and sensitive **proposed land uses** within a five-mile radius of the Facility. In the attached letter and material with attachments at this link [2023-10-05 Visual Outreach for Stakeholders](#) we have provided information on recommended visual simulations and previously identified visual resources. **Your input is important to this process.** Your contributions should include historic and/or publicly accessible scenic locations that are important to you and the local community.

-
[If there are any issues accessing the above link, please reach out. If required, paper copies can be provided upon request. We ask that your responses be provided by November 5, 2023 so that we can ensure your input is included in the analysis.](#)

-
[Thank you in advance for your participation in this important outreach process and we look forward to receiving your input.](#)

-Kiva

-
[Kiva VanDerGeest, AICP](#)

[EDR Visualization Project Manager](#)

[217 Montgomery Street, Suite 1100, Syracuse, New York 13202](#)

[O: 315.471.0688 x654](#) www.edrdpc.com

[EDR a better environment](#)

-

From: [Kiva VanDerGeest](#)
To: [Joseph Wicks](#)
Cc: [Jim Cunningham](#); [John R. Langey](#); [Debbie](#); [John Laubscher](#); [John Lagorga](#); [Jennifer Marti](#); [Joseph Lewis](#); [Dave Jones](#); [TJ Stokes](#); [Robert](#); [Daniel Zvirzdin](#)
Subject: RE: Hoffman Falls Wind Project (ORES Matter No. 23-00038) - Visual Outreach
Date: Friday, October 6, 2023 2:14:00 PM

Supervisor Wicks –

I'd also like to thank you for your quick response to the Visual Outreach material. Again, your feedback is an important part of the process. Your response will be added to those received for the Visual Outreach and included in the Visual Impact Assessment.

Thank you –
Kiva

Kiva VanDerGeest, AICP
EDR Visualization Project Manager
217 Montgomery Street, Suite 1100, Syracuse, New York 13202
O: 315.471.0688 x654 www.edrdpc.com

EDR a **better** environment

From: Joseph Wicks <j.b.wicks@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, October 6, 2023 11:58 AM
To: Kiva VanDerGeest <kvandergeest@edrdpc.com>
Cc: Jim Cunningham <supervisornelsonjimc@gmail.com>; John R. Langey <jlangey@ccf-law.com>; Debbie <tnclerk1@windstream.net>; John Laubscher <jlaubsc@twcny.rr.com>; John Lagorga <John.Lagorga@ghd.com>; Jennifer Marti <4041jennifer@gmail.com>; Joseph Lewis <jlewis@suttoncos.com>; Dave Jones <dave.jones4879@gmail.com>; TJ Stokes <stokes.tj19@gmail.com>; Robert <robert.butterworth@ghd.com>; Daniel Zvirzdin <dzvirzdin@edrdpc.com>
Subject: Re: Hoffman Falls Wind Project (ORES Matter No. 23-00038) - Visual Outreach

[EXTERNAL SENDER]

Kiva,

I echo the same sentiments as Mr. Cunningham and also have a moratorium in place in the Town of Eaton. Are residents are very concerned about the view shed and the scale of the new windmills.

Thanks,

Joe Wicks

On Fri, Oct 6, 2023 at 11:55 AM Kiva VanDerGeest <kvandergeest@edrdpc.com> wrote:

Supervisor Cunningham –

Thank you for your quick response to the Visual Outreach material provided. This is an important part of the process and your response is appreciated.

The information you provided will be reviewed and incorporated into Visual Impact Assessment. An important part of a visual impact assessment is to identify sensitive areas and determine the foreseeable visual impact, as this outreach kicks-off the visual study I do not yet have information to provide in return. In the meantime I will share your email with the Liberty Renewables team so they can coordinate with you more directly.

Thank you –

Kiva

Kiva VanDerGeest, AICP

EDR Visualization Project Manager
217 Montgomery Street, Suite 1100, Syracuse, New York 13202
O: 315.471.0688 x654 www.edrdpc.com

EDR a **better** environment

From: Jim Cunningham <supervisornelsonjimc@gmail.com>

Sent: Thursday, October 5, 2023 7:45 PM

To: Kiva VanDerGeest <kvandergeest@edrdpc.com>

Cc: John R. Langey <jlangey@ccf-law.com>; Debbie <tnclerk1@windstream.net>; John Laubscher <jlaubsc@twcny.rr.com>; John Lagorga <John.Lagorga@ghd.com>; Jennifer Marti <4041jennifer@gmail.com>; Joseph Lewis <jlewis@suttoncos.com>; Dave Jones <dave.jones4879@gmail.com>; Joe Wicks <j.b.wicks@gmail.com>; TJ Stokes <stokes.tj19@gmail.com>; Robert <robert.butterworth@ghd.com>

Subject: Re: Hoffman Falls Wind Project (ORES Matter No. 23-00038) - Visual Outreach

[EXTERNAL SENDER]

Kiva,

Thank you for reaching out to the Town of Nelson as EDRs representative for the proposed project on behalf of your client Liberty Renewables, Inc.

Route 20 intersects east to west in the middle of the Town of Nelson. Route 20 is a scenic byway as established within our masterplan and our LUR. that protects the existing scenic viewscapes. Loss of this essential viewscape will have a negative impact on the Towns economic viability. Have you evaluated the viewscape economic loss to our Town? Please send me your evaluation of the economic loss to our Town as soon as possible.

How do you plan to address the visual viewscap issues as your project will definitely impact our designated RT 20 scenic byway?

The Town of Nelson established a wind energy moratorium. How will you address our moratorium?

The existing electrical transmission lines are not sufficiently sized to convey the energy being produced by your project. I understand that electrical storage will be part of your project. Is this true? What is the proposed location of the storage facility? How will your proposed storage area impact the Route 20 scenic byway within our Towns?

What is the proposed max height of the windmills your client is proposing? Have you developed a viewscape impact document and drawings for our Town to review? Will you please send that document and drawing(s) to me at your earliest convenience?

Can you please send me a copy of your agreement with Liberty Renewables, Inc. and a copy of your professional liability insurance policy covering this project.

Sincerely,

Jim Cunningham
Town of Nelson Supervisor
Madison County Board of Supervisors
Madison County Soil and Water Conservation district board of directors
NYS Conservation District Board of Directors
Madison County Solid Waste and Recycling Chairman
President Madison County Federation of Lakes

On Thu, Oct 5, 2023 at 1:12 PM Kiva VanDerGeest <kvandergeest@edrdpc.com> wrote:

Dear Project Stakeholder,

This email is in regards to the Hoffman Falls Wind Project (Facility) which is proposed to be located in the Towns of Eaton, Fenner, Nelson, and Smithfield, Madison County, New York. On behalf of the Applicant (Liberty Renewables, Inc.), we are reaching out to you to request your input on the development of the visual impact assessment which will be included in the review under Chapter XVIII, Title 19 of NYCRR Part 900, §900-2.9 (Section 94-c of the New York State Executive Law).

Specifically, we are requesting your input on an inventory of **visually sensitive resources**, potential **visual simulation locations**, and sensitive **proposed land uses** within a five-mile radius of the Facility. In the attached letter and material with attachments at this link [2023-10-05 Visual Outreach for Stakeholders we have provided information on recommended visual simulations and previously identified visual resources. **Your input is important to this process.**](#) Your contributions should include historic and/or publicly accessible scenic locations that are important to you and the local community.

If there are any issues accessing the above link, please reach out. If required, paper copies can be provided upon request. We ask that your responses be provided by **November 5, 2023** so that we can ensure your input is included in the analysis.

Thank you in advance for your participation in this important outreach process and we look forward to receiving your input.

-Kiva

[Kiva VanDerGeest, AICP](#)

[EDR Visualization Project Manager](#)

[217 Montgomery Street, Suite 1100, Syracuse, New York 13202](#)

[O: 315.471.0688 x654 **www.edrdpc.com**](#)

[EDR a better environment](#)

--

Joseph B. Wicks, MBA

Supervisor, Town of Eaton NY

j.b.wicks@gmail.com

townofeatonny@gmail.com

315.601.4057

From: [Kiva VanDerGeest](#)
To: [Donna Burdick](#)
Cc: [Daniel Zvirzdin](#)
Subject: RE: Hoffman Falls Wind Project (ORES Matter No. 23-00038) - Visual Outreach
Date: Thursday, November 30, 2023 1:50:00 PM
Attachments: [~WRD2366.jpg](#)
[image001.png](#)

Hi Donna Burdick –

Apologies for the long delay. Your response to this outreach is an important part of our process and greatly appreciated.

From my understanding this Project has not been delayed. However, there is a chance you received mailings related to another portion of this Project analysis or other Projects that are proposed in the region.

As you likely saw, a number of maps were included in the Visual Outreach document including an illustration of the proposed wind turbine locations. It is my understanding that the landowners on which Hoffman Falls occurs are also a participating landowner in this Project.

Thank you again for your feedback –
Kiva

Kiva VanDerGeest, AICP

EDR Visualization Project Manager
217 Montgomery Street, Suite 1100, Syracuse, New York 13202
O: 315.471.0688 x654 www.edrdpc.com

EDR a **better** environment

From: Donna Burdick <dburdick@stny.rr.com>
Sent: Friday, November 3, 2023 11:11 AM
To: Kiva VanDerGeest <kvandergeest@edrdpc.com>
Subject: Re: Hoffman Falls Wind Project (ORES Matter No. 23-00038) - Visual Outreach

[EXTERNAL SENDER]

Hello Kiva

I guess I'm especially confused because I thought that I had replied to other e-mails from your organization at some point last year about this same subject. Was the project, at that time, delayed?

The reason I'm mentioning this is that I actually don't understand WHY the project has been given the name of Hoffman's Falls? Is it because the "FACILITY" that you refer to is going to be located very near the Falls?

If I knew the answers to the above, I might better be able to respond concerning **visually sensitive resources**.

Thank you.

Donna D. Burdick
Smithfield Town Historian
110 Crescent Drive
Kirkwood, NY 13795
607-775-3103
dburdick@stny.rr.com

On 10/5/2023 1:12 PM, Kiva VanDerGeest wrote:

Dear Project Stakeholder,

This email is in regards to the Hoffman Falls Wind Project (Facility) which is proposed to be located in the Towns of Eaton, Fenner, Nelson, and Smithfield, Madison County, New York. On behalf of the Applicant (Liberty Renewables, Inc.), we are reaching out to you to request your input on the development of the visual impact assessment which will be included in the review under Chapter XVIII, Title 19 of NYCRR Part 900, §900-2.9 (Section 94-c of the New York State Executive Law).

Specifically, we are requesting your input on an inventory of **visually sensitive resources**, potential **visual simulation locations**, and sensitive **proposed land uses** within a five-mile radius of the Facility. In the attached letter and material with attachments at this link [2023-10-05 Visual Outreach for Stakeholders](#) we have provided information on recommended visual simulations and previously identified visual resources. **Your input is important to this process.** Your contributions should include historic and/or publicly accessible scenic locations that are important to you and the local community.

If there are any issues accessing the above link, please reach out. If required, paper copies can be provided upon request. We ask that your responses be provided by **November 5, 2023** so that we can ensure your input is included in the analysis.

Thank you in advance for your participation in this important outreach process and we look forward to receiving your input.

-Kiva

Kiva VanDerGeest, AICP
EDR Visualization Project Manager
217 Montgomery Street, Suite 1100, Syracuse, New York 13202
O: 315.471.0688 x654 www.edrdpc.com
EDR a better environment



Virus-free. www.avast.com

From: [Kolankowski, Thaddeus \(ORES\)](#)
To: [Kiva VanDerGeest](#)
Cc: [Primeau, Kristy \(ORES\)](#); [Betsworth, Jennifer \(ORES\)](#)
Subject: RE: Hoffman Falls Wind Project (ORES Matter No. 23-00038) - Visual Outreach
Date: Monday, October 30, 2023 12:56:36 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

[EXTERNAL SENDER]

Dear Kiva,

Thank you for sending ORES the VIA Information Request for the Hoffman Falls Wind Project. Based on our review of the material dated 10/5/2023, we offer the following comments and/or requests for the Application submission.

To help the Office assess a selection of important or representative viewpoints, please provide updated GIS shapefiles and a KMZ google earth file to correspond with Figure 2 Potential Visibility and Viewpoint Locations for the wind turbines. Please include the proposed turbine locations, proposed location of the O&M building/point of interconnection, turbine visibility, 5 mile study area boundary, viewpoint (VP) locations, and all visual resources labeled as identified on Table 1 Inventory of Aesthetic Resources.

An analysis of cumulative impacts should include the cumulative visual impacts of the various structures proposed for the wind energy facility and an analysis of the cumulative visual impacts of the project together with existing wind facilities and the proposed Oxbow Hill Solar project. (see <https://ccrenew.com/projects/oxbow/>)

Please update the Attachments with the following information:

1. General/Attachment A Figures
 - a. Provide an ID label for each turbine location on 1:24000 mapping.
 - b. Include the alignments of any proposed overhead transmission lines and the location/fencing line for the point of interconnection (POI) and substation facilities on all 1:24000 mapping.
2. Attachment C - Visually Sensitive Resources
 - a. Line-of-sight (LOS) analysis should be completed for VSR's to confirm partial visibility as listed in Attachment C: Visually Sensitive Resources, including additional VSR's as suggested below.
 - b. Provide a column identifying visibility based on LOS analysis on Attachment C
 - c. National Register Eligible (NRE) properties should be included in addition to NRL properties as they are given the same amount of protection under state and federal law. A list of eligible resources is available from SHPO's database – there are a number of eligible individual resources and historic districts in the study area. Newly identified NRE properties can be added to the listing after the Historic Resources Survey occurs.
 - d. Under Figure 2, Sheet 4: please change the label from “National Historic Site” to “State Historic Site.” This is a combined category on Attachment C but the only relevant resource is a State Historic Site.

- e. Include cemeteries as local resources.
- f. Oneida Indian Nation (OIN) lands should be included as VSR's. There is a Smithfield parcel that is in close proximity to the turbines. We also note that the entirety of the Towns of Fenner and Smithfield are within the boundary of the Oneida Reservation.

3. Attachment D - Viewpoint Photo Selection and orientation:

- a. Additional photos should be provided along Route 20/Main Street in the Village of Morrisville and at high points approaching the Village from the east and west along Route 20
- b. VP 25 Additional photo oriented North-northwest to North
- c. VP 26 Additional photo oriented North to North-northeast
- d. VP 41 Additional photo oriented North-northwest to Northwest
- e. VP 42 Additional photo looking Northwest
- f. Additional photos of proposed POI and substation facilities

4. Photo-simulations

- a. Note that leaf-on photos are required and at a minimum 2 year growth are required for visual simulations and that leaf-on photos are required for any photo-simulations where existing vegetation is relied on for screening
- b. Additional photo-simulations should be prepared for views along Route 20, at a minimum to include east and west Village approaches to Cazenovia and Morrisville, and Village of Morrisville near the old County Courthouse
- c. VP 25 photo-simulation should be oriented North-northwest to North
- d. VP 26 photo-simulation should be oriented North to North-northeast
- e. VP 41 provide photo-simulation, should also be prepared looking North-northwest to Northwest
- f. VP 42 Provide photo-simulation, should also be prepared looking Northwest
- g. VP 50 Provide photo-simulation
- h. VP 58 Provide photo-simulation
- i. VP 63 photo-simulation should be oriented towards the proposed wind farm

Please share any available Visual Impact Consultation feedback provided by OPRHP/SHPO, APA, DEC, Madison County, towns, villages, community members, etc.

Thank you,

Ted

From: Kiva VanDerGeest <kvandergeest@edrdpc.com>

Sent: Thursday, October 5, 2023 1:12 PM

Subject: Hoffman Falls Wind Project (ORES Matter No. 23-00038) - Visual Outreach

You don't often get email from kvandergeest@edrdpc.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Dear Project Stakeholder,

This email is in regards to the Hoffman Falls Wind Project (Facility) which is proposed to be located in the Towns of Eaton, Fenner, Nelson, and Smithfield, Madison County, New York. On behalf of the Applicant (Liberty Renewables, Inc.), we are reaching out to you to request your input on the development of the visual impact assessment which will be included in the review under Chapter XVIII, Title 19 of NYCRR Part 900, §900-2.9 (Section 94-c of the New York State Executive Law).

Specifically, we are requesting your input on an inventory of **visually sensitive resources**, potential **visual simulation locations**, and sensitive **proposed land uses** within a five-mile radius of the Facility. In the attached letter and material with attachments at this link [2023-10-05 Visual Outreach for Stakeholders](#) we have provided information on recommended visual simulations and previously identified visual resources. **Your input is important to this process.** Your contributions should include historic and/or publicly accessible scenic locations that are important to you and the local community.

If there are any issues accessing the above link, please reach out. If required, paper copies can be provided upon request. We ask that your responses be provided by **November 5, 2023** so that we can ensure your input is included in the analysis.

Thank you in advance for your participation in this important outreach process and we look forward to receiving your input.

-Kiva

Kiva VanDerGeest, AICP

EDR Visualization Project Manager

217 Montgomery Street, Suite 1100, Syracuse, New York 13202

O: 315.471.0688 x654 www.edrdpc.com

EDR a **better** environment