

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 A.L.J. ASHLEY MORENO: Please come to
3 order. Okay, folks. We're going on the record. I call
4 Case 15-F-0327, application of Galloo Island Wind, L.L.C.
5 for a certificate of environmental compatibility and
6 public need pursuant to Article 10 to construct a wind
7 energy project. Good afternoon again, folks. My name is
8 Ashley Moreno. I am an Administrative Law Judge with the
9 Department of Public Service. With me today are
10 Administrative Law Judges James Costello and Michael
11 Caruso and together we are responsible for presiding over
12 the hearings in this case and development of a complete
13 record in this proceeding. And we -- as we mentioned at
14 the other session, we may also make recommendations to the
15 New York State Board on Electric Generation Siting and the
16 Environment or the Siting Board which is the ultimate
17 decision maker in this case. So we are here this
18 afternoon for a public statement hearing that was noticed
19 on July 17, 2018. This public statement hearing, again,
20 is to hear concerns or statements about Galloo Island
21 Winds, L.L.C.'s proposal to construct and operate a 108.9-
22 megawatt wind electric generating facility in Galloo
23 Island in the Town of Hounsfield in Jefferson County.

24 So with us today also is our -- one of our
25 Siting Board members. It's an honor and a privilege to

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 introduce you all to Joan Treadwell-Woods. She is the
3 local member of the Siting Board and one of the decision
4 makers in this proceeding. Did you want to say something?

5 MS. JOAN TREADWELL-WOODS: Thank you. I
6 just want you all to know who I am and, you know, just a
7 tiny bit about my background. I am a year-round resident
8 of Henderson. I was nominated by the Jefferson County
9 Legislature and Patty Ritchie to become a member of this
10 Siting Board. I consider it an honor to be representing
11 the county and I -- I will do my best to do what I can for
12 every citizen of this county, make sure you're all -- your
13 -- your opinions are adequately represented.

14 As I said, I've -- my family has been here
15 since 1919 in Henderson, owning property and participating
16 in town activities, so I feel that I -- I know most of
17 you. Every day I get to meet even more of you and I just
18 look forward to working with you and to hearing what your
19 thoughts and opinions are. Thank you.

20 A.L.J. MORENO: So just before we begin, a
21 couple of things, and some of this may be redundant to
22 what we just spoke about a little while ago, but the
23 Galloo Island proposal is, again, being reviewed pursuant
24 to Article 10 of the Public Service Law and prior to any
25 construction, Galloo Island Wind must first obtain what's

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 called a Certificate of Environmental Compatibility and
3 Public Need from the Siting Board. So when the case is
4 eventually brought to the board for its decision, it may
5 adopt, reject or modify Galloo Island Wind's proposal and
6 in making its decision, again, it will be considering the
7 entire record in these proceedings, including the
8 statements that you're going to be making on the record
9 here today.

10 So we're here today to hear from you folks
11 so that we understand what -- what your thoughts are with
12 regards to Galloo Island Wind's proposal. So this hearing
13 is -- is not an evidentiary hearing like we talked about
14 before and it's not an opportunity for cross examination,
15 but it's really an opportunity just for you to let us know
16 what your concerns are or what your interests are in -- in
17 this case. So if you would like to a make a statement, I
18 know we've said a couple of times before, but for anybody
19 who may be coming in just now, if you could please fill
20 out one of these cards, they're over at the table over
21 here, and then we're going to be calling folks up one-by-
22 one to make their statements on the record.

23 I'll just ask that you please speak slowly
24 and clearly, that was the perfect time to say it
25 incorrectly. So we do have a court reporter here today

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 who is going to be making a record of today's events and
3 the transcript, when it's ready, is going to be posted on
4 the Department of Public Service website for your review.

5 So I would just ask that you be respectful
6 of one another and please don't interrupt the speakers
7 when they are making their statements. If you have a cell
8 phone, if you could please silence it, it would be very
9 appreciated and just before we begin, I just wanted to
10 reiterate again, this is not the only opportunity that
11 folks have to comment.

12 If you prefer not to speak on the record
13 here today, there's other means in which you can make a
14 statement. You can go to the commission's website, the
15 Public, I'm sorry, the Public Service Department's website
16 and place a comment in the project file. You can email
17 the secretary or send in your comment by regular mail as
18 well. And as I mentioned before, if you could please
19 ensure that those comments are in by October 15th, that
20 provides the greatest opportunity for the parties who are
21 developing their cases to review your -- your comments and
22 understand what your concerns are, but you're certainly
23 welcome to continue throughout the pendency of this case
24 to make comments in this -- in this proceeding. So are

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 there any questions about the procedures just before we
3 begin?

4 MR. RICHARD WILEY: Just one quick
5 question.

6 A.L.J. MORENO: Yes, sir.

7 MR. WILEY: This -- these comments are
8 going to be added to the case?

9 A.L.J. MORENO: Absolutely.

10 MR. WILEY: Thank you.

11 A.L.J. MORENO: Yep, so there's a
12 transcript that's going to be prepared and then those all
13 are considered as part of the case file as well in
14 addition to --

15 MR. WILEY: And that will be --

16 A.L.J. MORENO: -- the public comments.

17 MR. WILEY: -- entered as one document?

18 A.L.J. MORENO: It is, yep.

19 MR. WILEY: Thank you.

20 A.L.J. MORENO: You're welcome. Okay. So
21 we have a stack of cards here. I will call the first
22 person up and I'll just ask if you could please come to
23 the front here and use the microphone so that we can hear
24 you.

25 Mr. Gerald Smith? Thank you.

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 MR. GERALD SMITH: Thank you. If I may?
3 Normally, these are about five minutes. Is that a
4 reasonable amount of time?

5 A.L.J. MORENO: Sure.

6 MR. SMITH: Okay. There are people in this
7 room that can testify you never give me a microphone with
8 unlimited time.

9 A bit of background first. I am one of, if
10 not the senior, ornithologists. I'm one of the senior
11 ornithologists in the North County.

12 AUDIENCE MEMBER: We can't hear you.

13 MR. SMITH: Can you hear?

14 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Now we can.

15 MR. SMITH: Sorry about that. All right.
16 I am one of the senior ornithologists in the North
17 Country. I am very active in bird-related matters in
18 Jefferson County.

19 This project is of great concern from an
20 avian standpoint and frankly what I've seen in the -- the
21 application looks to me like nature concerns are not being
22 addressed, specifically the fact that about forty-three
23 years ago, I rediscovered, along with a couple of other
24 people, the major water bird colony on Little Galloo
25 Island very close to Big Galloo Island. It is, if not the

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 largest, certainly one of the largest water bird colonies
3 for Caspian terns, a small population of common terns,
4 large gull populations, and yes, cormorants and some of us
5 -- some of us may have a more favorable view of cormorants
6 than others. Couldn't -- couldn't leave that out.

7 The bottom line here is that just that
8 proximity and the potential mortality and other impacts on
9 that colony is the reason why this is a really poor
10 project in my opinion, but on top of that, you have other
11 considerations and I will be addressing these in more
12 detail with you all at a future date, but just as a
13 summary, obviously the raptor considerations were
14 mentioned, the duck migration and waterfowl and put --
15 what I'm saying here is the cumulative impacts are
16 potentially very great specifically also, this lies along
17 a major songbird flyway over the east end of Lake Ontario
18 and along the east end of Lake Ontario particularly in the
19 fall months and equally importantly right over the lake in
20 the spring months. The songbirds that migrate at night
21 behave somewhat differently depending on the time of year.

22 But the bottom line here is this, placing
23 large turbine complexes, again, these turbines continue to
24 grow. The literature is indicative that the taller the
25 turbines are, the more problems you have, and also the

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 other major consideration is the post-construction studies
3 at places like Wolfe Island, Amherst Island are in my
4 humble opinion basically very poorly done and essentially
5 close to useless.

6 I will use a quick example. It is my
7 understanding that the firm that was doing Wolfe Island
8 essentially hires local individuals to monitor the impacts
9 that for example, raptors being killed and that sort of
10 thing.

11 I'm sorry to be a cynic, but -- or a
12 skeptic both, but I cannot imagine that if Cousin John
13 finds a dead bald eagle on Uncle Charlie's farm, he's
14 necessarily going to report it. We are looking -- we're
15 overlooking the aspects of human nature here and that's
16 not a good thing and from -- bottom line here, there are
17 clearly many human impacts which will be brought up, but I
18 would like to at least, should we say, put down the first
19 shot of -- for our feathered associates with the comment
20 that again, from my standpoint, putting a project of this
21 type in this flyway is just plain inappropriate and I will
22 leave it at that and you guys will hear more from me
23 later.

24 A.L.J. MORENO: Okay. Thank you.

25 MR. SMITH: Yeah.

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 A.L.J. MORENO: Our next speaker is John
3 O'Driscoll.

4 MR. JOHN O'DRISCOLL: I was instructed to
5 inform you I also submitted a written statement. Judge
6 Costello, Judge Moreno, Judge Caruso, I appreciate the
7 opportunity to speak before you concerning the Galloo
8 Island Wind Farm. My name is John O'Driscoll. I'm
9 business manager of the International Brotherhood of
10 Electrical Workers Local Union 910 at Watertown. In the
11 interest of time, I am speaking not only on behalf of my
12 members, but also the members of the other building trades
13 unions who will work on the windmill project.

14 Projects such as Galloo Island are critical
15 for all the individual building trades involved in
16 performing this construction work to maintain our regional
17 workforce. Like every industry, the skilled trades unions
18 have an aging workforce and we need more local projects to
19 train more apprentices to keep our -- keep replacing our
20 retired members. We have seen very little construction
21 activity in Jefferson County in several years which causes
22 many of our members to travel for work, oftentimes
23 spending time away from their families. When wages are
24 paid to local construction workers, the effect is
25 multiplied throughout the local economy including our

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 healthcare and pension dollars. These are greatly needed
3 economic development dollars in northern New York.

4 Last fall, Assemblywoman Addie Jenne
5 arranged a meeting on Fort Drum with all the building
6 trades to explain how wind towers affect the mission of
7 the post. The officials at Fort Drum did an excellent job
8 of explaining all the issues with both aircraft radar and
9 weather radar. At the end of the session, I asked
10 specifically considering the location of Galloo Island and
11 the small footprint of this wind farm, do you have any
12 concerns with the proposed Galloo Island project and their
13 reply was no.

14 Our members are highly skilled, well
15 trained men and women. They're raising families here,
16 paying taxes here. They need as many opportunities to
17 work locally as possible. All building trades unions are
18 united in their support of the Galloo Island Wind. This
19 is a good project for northern New York and for northern
20 New York workers. Thank you.

21 A.L.J. MORENO: Thank you. Our next
22 speaker is Elaine Scott.

23 MS. ELAINE SCOTT: Thank you for this
24 opportunity to speak to you and to offer criteria for the
25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 consideration of this study of the Apex Clean Energy -
3 Galloo Island Wind Project.

4 My name is Elaine Scott. I reside at 12205
5 Mill Street here in the hamlet of Henderson. I have a
6 master's degree in education from Syracuse University, and
7 while a student at SUNY Oswego, I studied archeology and
8 ancient cultures at the Pisa, Italy campus.

9 At present, I am the Recording Secretary
10 for the Henderson Historical Society and one of the
11 curators of the well-known Stony Island archival
12 collection of Indian and ancient artifacts. I come today
13 not as a representative of the historical, I come to speak
14 to you based on my training, and knowledge, and experience
15 of what will be lost for all of us, for all generations to
16 come if this wind power project is rushed through without
17 proper evaluation.

18 In 2007 when the Town of Hounsfield
19 received the application for the original wind power
20 project of Upstate New York Power Corporation to construct
21 a wind farm on Galloo, an intensive archaeological review
22 was made of the area through which, at that time, the
23 intended transmission line would pass.

24 Many of us took notice as it comes through
25 New York State's protected archaeological areas and there

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 was no intensive evaluation of Galloo. Where is the
3 archaeological site review for this present Galloo Wind
4 Power Project? Why has it not been done for the 30
5 concrete pads upon which the wind turbines will stand?

6 At the Henderson Historical Society in
7 2004, we wished to pour a concrete slab as a foundation
8 for an 1807 log cabin. This project could not be moved
9 forward until an archaeological site review was made for
10 the 18- by 24-foot quadrant at a cost of 11 hundred
11 dollars. A little space for a great deal of money for a
12 small chartered organization existing on a shoestring
13 budget.

14 Why have the local archaeologists not
15 spoken up about the Galloo Project? Precisely because
16 they would not wish to endanger their possible employment
17 for a site review.

18 You can say we do not really need to find
19 more arrow heads or stone implements? What would really
20 be lost for future generations to come? Our Stony Island
21 collection has been evaluated by four known
22 archaeologists. The most important being the study done
23 in the 1950s at the Stony Island Lodge by William A.
24 Ritchie, who was the chief archaeologist for the New York
25 State Museum, 1949-1987.

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 The collection contains archival material
3 that is Indian, Pre-Indian, and that of the people who
4 lived here at the end of the ice age 15,000 years ago.
5 However, Ritchie dated items in the Stony Island
6 collection to be thousands of years older.

7 In the Henderson Historical Society is a
8 spear point which has been evaluated at 40,000 years old
9 by two archaeologists. We have been advised that the
10 Henderson area sits on a great, as yet to be evaluated,
11 archeological discovery. That this could be the center of
12 an important ancient people is mind blowing. It is for
13 this reason that I have come today to petition that the
14 proper archaeological study of Galloo now be done before
15 precious historic and archaeological material is buried
16 and entombed for all time in a heavy layer of cement.

17 Further and I will only mention these
18 things as a footnote, what about the fossil or ancient
19 creature's footprints beneath the surface soil of Galloo
20 or do you think that the only dinosaurs were in Colorado
21 or Siberia? In addition, archaeologists are moving
22 quickly forward with the revelation of the Viking
23 exploration and settlements following the waterways of our
24 Great lakes.

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 Evidence has already been found here of
3 Viking installations on our very shore and this Golden
4 Crescent, the vortex of a great known ship graveyard, why
5 has that underwater archeological review not been
6 considered?

7 Thank you for allowing me to bring these
8 considerations to your attention. I do ask that you weigh
9 heavily what might seem sensible right now for immediate
10 renewable energy savings that will be lost -- but consider
11 what will be lost for all generations to come without the
12 proper archaeological site review.

13 A.L.J. MORENO: Thank you very much.

14 Our next speaker is Jim Burrows.

15 MR. JIM BURROWS: Thank you. Yeah, my name
16 is Jim Burrows. I'm an attorney in Watertown with Conboy,
17 McKay, Bachman, and Kendall and my office serves as
18 attorneys for the Village of Sackets Harbor in this
19 application.

20 The written submittals that I have reviewed
21 to date and the comments that I have heard already to date
22 make it clear that a portion of the Village of Sackets
23 Harbor in general and Madison Barracks in particular will
24 apparently be used in connection with this project.

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 The information that I've heard suggests
3 that a boat launch will be constructed by someone
4 apparently other than the developer, a parking area for
5 approximately two hundred vehicles will be constructed by
6 someone, and then roads in the village and the boat launch
7 and the parking area and construction trailers, et cetera
8 will be used in connection with this potential project.

9 They've been identified as ancillary
10 facilities in this project.

11 From the Village of Sackets Harbor's
12 perspective, we've not pre-judged. We don't know to what
13 extent, if any, the development and the use in connection
14 with the ancillary facilities might have a negative impact
15 on the village. We don't know that yet. It's too early
16 in the game.

17 The -- the Village's questions and concerns
18 were previously identified in a June 24, 2016 letter from
19 the late Dennis Whelpley to the Siting Board. That's been
20 followed up more recently by an August 9 letter from Ian
21 Gilbert of my office to -- to this group as well that
22 highlights some of the questions, some of the issues that
23 the Village has to date.

24 Again, the Village hasn't pre-judged, but
25 we just think that those issues are important and should

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 be looked at. They include transportation and parking,
3 invasive species, emergency services, and cultural coastal
4 and historic resources that are of particular importance
5 to the Village. Again, the goal is we just want to make
6 sure that those ancillary facilities are considered, are
7 reviewed, and we have an opportunity to weigh in on those
8 issues as this process unfolds.

9 Yesterday, Ian Gilbert and I received a
10 telephone call from attorneys for the developer Jim
11 Muscato and Jessica. I apologize Jessica, I don't
12 remember your last name.

13 MS. JESSICA KLAMI: Klami.

14 MR. JIM BURROWS: But as I understand, from
15 the applicant's perspective, sure these issues are part of
16 the ancillary facilities and they will be considered by
17 this group and the Siting Board as the matter unfolds.
18 That's just important to the Village, not pre-judging, but
19 simply making sure that those issues will be considered as
20 the narrative unfolds.

21 Thank you for that -- for that help and for
22 this opportunity today.

23 A.L.J. MORENO: Thank you. Our next
24 speaker is Jim Scee.

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 MR. JIM SCÉE: Thank you. Good afternoon,
3 my name is Jim Scee. I'm the town supervisor for the Town
4 of Hounsfield and I am here today on behalf of the
5 residence of the Town of Hounsfield to express our
6 overwhelming support for the Galloo Island Project.

7 As everyone is aware, there are many
8 economic benefits to the Town of Hounsfield, but in
9 addition to those economic benefits, our businesses, not
10 just in the Town of Hounsfield, but in the Town of
11 Henderson and around the surrounding area as well. Those
12 workers will have to buy food. Those workers will have to
13 travel around on our roads and buy gas. Those workers
14 will have to have housing and so the spin off economic
15 benefit to our local businesses is just as great.

16 Also, in my comments today during the
17 presentation on the Galloo Island Project, they covered
18 many of my topics. The one that comes to mind that
19 they've covered is the blinking lights. We've all heard
20 that the blinking lights are going to be a terrible
21 imposition to the folks along the -- along the shoreline,
22 but with the new system that they've developed with the
23 radar controlled lighting where they will only come on
24 during the time when an airplane is approaching, that will

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 hopefully eliminate some of the concern from some of the
3 visitors -- some of our residents.

4 In addition, we've talked about support for
5 the project and opposition to the project. On the D.P.S.
6 website, there's -- last time I checked, there was 196
7 comments submitted to the D.P.S. specifically regarding
8 Galloo Island. Not all of the comments were negative and
9 very few of them actually were positive, but when you take
10 the population of Jefferson County which is a part of this
11 proceeding and you take 196 comments and of those 196
12 comments there were multiple comments from the same person
13 which would turn down -- run the comment down to 126
14 people complaining and out of them 126 people complaining,
15 20 of them or so were from the same family, father, son,
16 daughter, cousin, what have you.

17 So when you're all said and done, I grant
18 you there's not 115 adults in Jefferson County, so I'll go
19 down to 60,000 adults in Jefferson County, so we've got
20 100 people specifically complaining to the Public Service
21 Commission regarding the Galloo Island Project, so you
22 have to ask yourself how much opposition is there to this
23 project?

24 The folks in Henderson and understandably
25 so, they're concerned and speaking about Henderson, they

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 actually commissioned a study to see about the property
3 values impacted by the wind mills. That study was never
4 released. The report that was given to the supervisor had
5 many discrepancies with other studies done on the impact
6 of wind on a community, so in addition, the -- those --
7 the study was never released only to the Town of
8 Henderson.

9 AUDIENCE MEMBER: It's on the Town's
10 website.

11 MR. JIM SCHEE: When -- I have the floor
12 right now, so anyhow -- so anyhow we feel that if that
13 document is in fact could be a determination in this
14 process then it should be released to everybody. I'm not
15 -- I didn't -- I wasn't aware that it was on the website,
16 but when we asked, they didn't want to --.

17 Anyhow, with that being said, this project
18 as many people have said that the first project for the
19 Galloo Island Wind Farm was approved in 2009 by the D.E.C.
20 to be complete with 30 wind turbines, that reduces the
21 impact that the residents in the Town of Henderson will --
22 will suffer, so anyhow -- anyhow, with one third the wind
23 farms, we feel that this project will align itself with
24 the state's renewable energy plan for fifteen percent by
25 thirty renewable energy, so with those comments, I move to

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 ask that you give your due consideration to the many
3 comments you'll hear today and receive in the mail that
4 you do -- with your due consideration that you support the
5 Galloo Island Wind Project and thank you for this
6 opportunity to address the board.

7 A.L.J. MORENO: Thank you.

8 Our next -- our next speaker is Kathy
9 Dillon.

10 MS. KATHY DILLON: Thank you very much for
11 letting me have a chance to express my feelings about the
12 Galloo Wind Project and giving this roomful of people an
13 opportunity to share their feelings as well.

14 I'm a Lake Ontario coastal resident of
15 Jefferson County over on Point Peninsula. Many people are
16 not well versed on history, but one of the main reasons we
17 have been successful as a country is that we have worked
18 together. Today this almost seems like more and more
19 people are just out for themselves. This self-serving
20 focus has become so prevalent that it now has a name,
21 entitlement mentality.

22 The Galloo Wind Project is a perfect
23 example of selfish perspectives. The developer wants to
24 squeeze every dollar of profit out of this that he can
25 irrespective of the consequences to the environment, our

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 economy. The leaders at Hounsfield, a generally
3 prosperous town, wants to collect some cash irrespective
4 of the consequences to their neighbors.

5 My recommendation is that we should
6 objectively and comprehensively analyze all of the
7 regional implications of such a long-term project. So --
8 so far this state has not done that, so far Jefferson
9 County I.D.A. has not done that, and so far the Town of
10 Hounsfield has not done that. It makes absolutely no
11 sense to move forward on this project until such an
12 analysis is done, made publicly available, and then
13 approved by all affected communities. I would also like
14 to add that I wholeheartedly hope that the Town of
15 Henderson obtains the intervenor funds that they have
16 requested and that they deserve.

17 For those of you wishing to delve deeper
18 and learn more about energy issues, I urge you to take a
19 look at a very good website called wiseenergy.org which
20 was created by an upstate New York native and energy
21 physicist John Droz.

22 In closing, I would like to say let's stop
23 staking out self-serving positions and work on such
24 regional issues together.

25 Thank you very much.

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 A.L.J. MORENO: Thank you. Our next
3 speaker is William Bunk. I'm sorry?

4 MR. WILLIAM BURKE: Burke.

5 A.L.J. MORENO: Pardon?

6 MR. BURKE: Burke.

7 A.L.J. MORENO: Burke. I'm sorry. William
8 J. Burke.

9 MR. BURKE: Do I sit? Am I supposed to
10 sit?

11 A.L.J. JAMES COSTELLO: You can.

12 A.L.J. MORENO: Whatever you'd like.

13 A.L.J. COSTELLO: You don't have to.

14 MR. BURKE: I don't have to. Okay. Good.
15 I can speak better pacing back and forth. I'm here today
16 for support of your -- of your wind project. I'm from
17 Lewis County and obviously we have the Maple Ridge Wind
18 Farm there and -- and I just want to -- if there's any
19 misunderstanding about wind farm, I'd like to help clear
20 them up.

21 We've been at this for -- for fifteen years
22 and I host wind turbines on my property. I have some and
23 -- and I also am a part-time worker for the wind farm and
24 I participated in the bird study for three years on our

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 project and I live right among the -- right among the wind
3 farm.

4 I live -- we live 1,000 foot from -- from a
5 turbine and I seen how much our project has benefitted the
6 community and we've never been bothered by the wind
7 turbines. There's absolutely no health effects. There's
8 no sleep disturbance. No heart troubles. No seizures
9 from the very minimal shadow flicker each -- not each, but
10 it takes a very certain day to have a shadow flicker. It
11 has to be a clear day basically no -- no clouds in the sky
12 and for about fifteen minutes in the afternoon when the
13 sun is about a forty-five-degree angle you get some
14 flicker -- some flicker, but once you've been around it,
15 you really don't -- don't notice it.

16 Our property values have not gone down,
17 neither mine or -- or -- or my neighbors and on the
18 contrary, I was a school board member for fourteen years
19 and it's just allowed us to do a number of great things
20 for our schools. A lot of updates to our fields,
21 computers for each students, and renovations. And our
22 fund balance is in great shape, so I just -- yeah, and
23 I've been on the board of legislators -- was on the board
24 of legislators for six years and a very positive impact

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 for the townships, the infrastructure, equipment, and also
3 our -- our county fund balance.

4 The first year, I've -- I've -- as part of
5 my part-time work on the wind farm, I do presentations.
6 We have a presentation room and our first year we had 3800
7 people come, but that was in the beginning of, you know,
8 that was -- but we had busloads of people coming from
9 Buffalo and -- and the benefits have been tremendous for
10 our community and equally meaningful for the folks who
11 live there.

12 We have thirty well-paying jobs and -- and
13 I just know our local Agway Store has attributed about
14 \$1100 a month to ancillary business from -- from the wind
15 farm. Just -- yeah, so I -- I just see this as a -- as an
16 economic opportunity that is knocking on the door for this
17 generation and future generations here. If there's any
18 questions, I'd be happy to --.

19 A.L.J. MORENO: Well, sir, actually --.

20 A.L.J. COSTELLO: That's not --.

21 MR. SCEE: That's not part -- okay. Sorry.
22 I'm going to sit down now. Thank you.

23 A.L.J. MORENO: Thank you. Our next
24 speaker is Karen Wiley.

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 MS. KAREN WILEY: Thank you for this
3 opportunity. I'm Karen Wiley from Cape Vincent. First, I
4 guess I'd like to say I heard the Apex Energy offered free
5 transportation and food, so people would come here and
6 support this project today and I don't know if that's
7 true, but if it is --

8 AUDIENCE MEMBER: I heard that too.

9 MS. WILEY: -- I have a serious ethics
10 concern about that --

11 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Me too.

12 MS. WILEY: -- and I might add that no one
13 is paying me in any way to be here. I am a concerned
14 citizen. So I continued to be stunned that New York state
15 would even consider allowing industrial wind in an
16 ecologically sensitive region and nationally recognized
17 migratory flyway of eastern Lake Ontario, so it would be
18 so destructive to the bird and bat populations. And since
19 these bird and bat kills are well documented, it would
20 just be irresponsible to me to install these more than 500
21 foot tall structures with killing blades on Galloo Island.

22 In addition to this horrific environmental
23 damage, please consider the dismal inefficiency of the
24 industrial wind turbines, the enormous carbon footprint
25 left by the manufacture and installation of each tower,

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 the non-recyclable and sometimes toxic materials used, the
3 hazardous effect on Fort Drum radar, the sizeable impact
4 on property values from as far as 20 miles around this
5 project, the detrimental influence on our all important
6 tourism, the serious visual impact of these tall
7 structures and their lights, the sound generated by these
8 turbines, and the approximately 200 public comments on the
9 P.S.C. website already. So in my opinion, this is a
10 tremendously short-sighted project with so many negative
11 long-term effects for the entire region and I urge New
12 York state to shut this project down.

13 A.L.J. MORENO: Okay. Our next speaker is
14 Ray Melfi, I believe.

15 MR. RAY MELFI: Yep.

16 A.L.J. MORENO: My apologies if I
17 mispronounced.

18 MR. MEFLI: Yep, yep. Thank you. I don't
19 have any credentials, but I live here. I look at the
20 island. The other thing I'm probably the most biggest
21 nobody in the room maybe. I have no background, much.
22 The Maple Ridge man, that's why I'm standing up here. Let
23 me see -- let me review that. I think you'd be better off
24 if you just stand here and said I live near a windmill
25 because he says I own -- I own land that has windmills on

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 it. I just read an article today on my iPad that they get
3 up to \$8,000 a year for every windmill. He works for the
4 windmill company. Whoa, nice, and he has nothing to say
5 bad against them. No kidding. Great sense for the
6 obvious.

7 Anyways, Governor Cuomo just recently said
8 on Long Island Sound, he doesn't want any windmills
9 constructed, unless they're thirty miles off shore. Okay.
10 What are we mincemeat here? We -- we can have them in our
11 backyard, but his front yard -- he wants them thirty miles
12 off shore. The union man -- I'm a union man. What
13 guarantee do you have, and you've been through this again
14 and again and again? These people come in with these
15 projects. They get our unions to stand behind them and
16 they're coming to these meetings and they hire people from
17 across the border or from some country or someplace with
18 no union connection, no training whatsoever, and we're --
19 we're backing it before it's done. Unions are backing it
20 before it's done. You can't do that. You get a promise
21 from him right now. Where is he? Where's the guy that
22 owns this thing that wants to build it.

23 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Gone.

24 MR. MELFI: Is he gone?

25 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Of course.

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 MR. MELFI: I want him to guarantee the
3 union people that he'll hire nobody but union. Now you
4 can stand up and talk about union workers. They are
5 brilliant. They're the best in this country and we have
6 the best in this country, but don't bring in someone from
7 across the border to put in cement.

8 Also, Maple Ridge, why did the windmill
9 fall over up there? Was that one of yours? Do you know
10 about that? Is he here? Is the guy here from Maple
11 Ridge?

12 MR. BURKE: Right here. Yeah, there's no
13 windmill fell over.

14 MR. MELFI: You don't even know about it.
15 That's how good it was. You want to know why it fell
16 over? What the excuse was? The wind was too strong.

17 MR. BURKE: Nothing fell over.

18 MR. MELFI: Okay. How about windmills --
19 the propeller goes around and around. There's gears and
20 oil in there. Hundreds of gallons of oil cooling the
21 bearings in a windmill. When a windmill blows, and it is
22 on fire, it blows out hundreds of gallons of oil. There's
23 only one way to put the fire out. That's with foam.
24 Anybody know where the closest foam truck is for the
25 island? Fort Drum. I don't think you're going to float

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 it out there to put out a fire or pick up the oil that's
3 running into the lake, so think about that.

4 The other thing is like I touched on
5 before, if the government says no subsidies, these guys
6 are going to run so fast in the other direction, but I'd
7 like to ask the man, if you back out because of no
8 subsidies, you want to come and buy the people of
9 Henderson a free lunch and we'll celebrate with you.
10 That's all I got to say.

11 A.L.J. MORENO: Our next speaker is
12 Cornelia Kelley.

13 MS. CORNELIA KELLEY: Thank you for the
14 opportunity to speak today.

15 My name is Nelia Kelley and I am Senior
16 Staff Organizer for Mothers Out Front, a grass roots
17 organization of mothers, grandmothers, and allies to push
18 for a renewable energy future, so all children inherit a
19 livable climate.

20 Wind power is key to a renewable energy
21 future and here in New York, the Galloo Island Wind
22 Project is an important part of that. Galloo Island Wind
23 has the potential to displace greenhouse gas emissions
24 equivalent to taking 22,000 cars off the road.

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 The project will allow our children clean
3 air to breathe. Our children's health and a secure
4 renewable energy future are two of the reasons why I
5 support approval of the project and I also must share that
6 another reason why I support the project is the support
7 I've heard from the Town of Hounsfield residents.

8 They recognize the positive economic
9 benefits the project will bring to the town, local
10 schools, and broader Jefferson County through job creation
11 and increased revenue through the PILOT payments. This
12 too is key.

13 As a mother and a fellow New Yorker, I
14 encourage a swift, just, and complete transition off of
15 fossil fuels towards a clean and renewable energy future.
16 Galloo Island Wind is a critical opportunity to take a
17 step in that direction. My daughters, Jessie age twelve
18 and Martha age ten, and all children are counting on you
19 for a safe future. Their futures are in the hands of
20 everyone in this room.

21 Thank you.

22 A.L.J. MORENO: Our next speaker is Briggs
23 McAndrews.

24 MR. BRIGGS McANDREWS: I appreciate the
25 opportunity to make a few comments. I'm Briggs McAndrews.

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 I live in Sackets Harbor and one of -- some of my comments
3 I associate with some background that I have in another
4 area as a Superintendent of Schools who have dealt with
5 large organizations, General Electric, Martin Marietta who
6 then come into a community, ask to be building facilities,
7 and then take certain actions after the facilities are
8 built, so some of mine are more financial than
9 environmental.

10 I would note that there -- if you look
11 around on a number of websites, you'll find that the
12 economic benefits and job creation are often overstated
13 and most -- most presentations of these are generally
14 short term and false.

15 Tax benefits look enticing until a wind
16 farm asks for PILOT support essentially asking the
17 taxpayer to help finance its construction and when the
18 PILOT ends, may request a lowered assessment than was
19 originally anticipated. Also, what will the tax benefits
20 be used for is it to lower the local taxpayer requirement?
21 How much per taxpayer? What will be the reduced property
22 taxes per thousand in year one and beyond?

23 In addition to that, wind farms come with
24 substantial impacts on human environment, noise and visual
25 pollution, and the environment for migratory birds. In

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 objective terms, the noise and visual pollution will
3 negatively affect homeowners both in the immediacy and in
4 the lowered home values for the future. Cape Vincent is
5 one example of lowered home values.

6 Do we really as -- and I'm really targeting
7 this more toward the Town of Hounsfield and the Village of
8 Sackets Harbor and the Sackets Harbor School District, do
9 we really want to make decisions that negatively impact
10 our resident's lives? Is that our goal as decision making
11 makers for this project?

12 Regarding the financial arrangements, I
13 would strongly suggest that no PILOT agreement be part of
14 the approval. An independent assessor would make a full
15 assessment that would be used for the first twenty years
16 of the wind farm life. If a PILOT is a part of the
17 approval, and this is kind of the -- the PILOT would be
18 five years only beginning in 50% of full assessment and
19 increasing 10% each year and reaching the 100% full
20 assessment in year six.

21 The project development owner would then
22 agree to retain the full assessment or higher, if
23 reassessed, until the twenty-sixth year of operation and
24 my experience with some of these large organizations is
25 they come in, they ask for PILOTs, they receive PILOTs,

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 sometimes for five, sometimes for ten years, and after the
3 PILOT has ended, shortly thereafter, they ask for reduced
4 assessments and they say well, you know, we've got ten
5 years where our building is not what it was, our machinery
6 is not what it was, so they then begin to look for reduced
7 assessments.

8 Unfortunately, I've dealt with a couple of
9 those and including where they bring in teams of lawyers
10 from Florida and other places where they just argue and
11 argue and they cost the local community a lot of money in
12 tertiary costs before the courts, so I worry a great deal
13 that we may be getting into something that is really a
14 money loser in many ways for the communities, so I had a
15 couple of suggestions beyond that.

16 The developer would support local job
17 creation by agreeing to hire and train, I say at least
18 50%, listening here, I think it's gone up, why not 100% of
19 their workforce from Jefferson, St. Lawrence, and Lewis
20 counties and contract them with the Town of Hounsfield or
21 the North Country Development Authority to inspect and
22 maintain the wind farm using workers trained by the
23 developers, paid prevailing wind farm rates from those
24 involved counties.

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 Also, because there have been reports of
3 wind farm developers walking away from the wind farm after
4 the useful life is over, the developer/owner will agree to
5 provide an escrow account to the Town of Hounsfield which
6 is added to each year for purposes of restoring Galloo
7 Island to its 2018 state upon the end of using the wind
8 farm. The escrow account would be started with a payment
9 of 50% of assessment, will be added to each year with 5%
10 of full assessment in addition to the taxes, and the
11 developer/owner will be returned these monies once the
12 return to the 2018 state has been accomplished, so he can
13 get his money back if he makes Galloo Island look like it
14 is now once he is done using it. So while it may be
15 difficult to a developer to agree to, let's remember it's
16 going to have a negative impact on at least some of our
17 residents at little or no long term job or economic
18 benefits without a guarantee and certainly has very little
19 positive impact on the tourism part of the life blood of
20 our community, so thank you for that opportunity.

21 A.L.J. MORENO: Our next speaker is April
22 Warner.

23 MS. APRIL WARNER: Thank you. I am afraid
24 I'm unprepared. I did not expect to be coming here this
25 afternoon and --

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 THE COURT REPORTER: Put your mic up.

3 MS. WARNER: -- I didn't write out a
4 statement. I have several things I'd like to say. I'd
5 like to find out how much the Town of Hounsfield was paid
6 to do this project. I'd like to know what the -- they're
7 planning to do with the wind turbines when they are
8 defunct whether I've heard from other people in other
9 parts of the country, that when the wind turbines are
10 defunct, that they just walk off and leave them and I
11 think that's unacceptable. They should -- as the
12 gentleman was just talking about -- they should have some
13 sort of funding to take care of those or remove those once
14 they're no longer useful.

15 I would like to know how -- what percentage
16 of the residents in Sackets Harbor and the Town of
17 Hounsfield will see the flashing lights on Galloo Island
18 compared to the people in Henderson and I'd also like to
19 know what's in it for Henderson. I don't think Henderson
20 is going to benefit in any way, shape or form. I had
21 another question I wanted to ask and I'm trying to think
22 what it was. I -- I just don't see where we're going to
23 benefit. Who -- where does the electricity go? Does it
24 -- is it coming to Jefferson County or are
25 you shipping it out of state?

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 These are all questions I'd like to know.
3 I don't think Henderson is going to benefit in any way.
4 It's just going to be a detriment and I -- I came to the
5 meeting ten years ago when -- when this whole thing came
6 up and I'm just as opposed now as I was then. I don't
7 think it's good for us. It's not good for the tourism.
8 It isn't good for the residents. It isn't good for Fort
9 Drum. I don't see any good at all in any of it. That's
10 all I have to say.

11 A.L.J. MORENO: Our next speaker is
12 Frederick Hall Junior.

13 MR. FREDERICK HALL: Good afternoon. My
14 name is Frederick A. Hall. I am a resident of the Town of
15 Adams 14275, U.S. Route 11. I also am a lifelong resident
16 of Jefferson County. I'm a retired individual and I
17 represent or speak for no party involved in this decision
18 making.

19 What I do know is that I have been an
20 educator for my entire adult life. I was a teacher, I was
21 a principal, I was a supervisor, and I too was a
22 superintendent of schools retired. I do know that during
23 the time I was a superintendent, we had to work one of the
24 greatest recessions that hit and plagued all of us, all of
25 our homes, all of our states, and our country.

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 I could only speak for what I know as true
3 facts in that the Sackets Harbor Central School endured
4 during that time a loss in revenue of 2.5 million dollars.
5 That's quite a kick in the teeth. And in the first year,
6 we tried to close the gap and then as the -- as the state
7 said it's just temporary, it kept going and kept going and
8 kept going and through that time, our students lost
9 programs. Our curriculum was affected. Our facilities
10 were impacted. We lost staff and believe it or not we
11 even cut athletics.

12 With that being said, during that time, I
13 am happy to announce that we also had students who were
14 successful and went to Harvard and Princeton, Berkley,
15 Duke, Jefferson Community College, the SUNY systems.
16 There's a phenomenon in the north country and in New York
17 state called brain drain. Our smartest and our most
18 intelligent kids are leaving our area to take jobs
19 elsewhere.

20 Galloo Island will bring reliable revenues.
21 Remember that 2.5 million dollars was never paid back. In
22 2017, communities and school districts throughout New York
23 state received revenues in the amount of 5 million
24 dollars. That may not seem like a lot of money to some
25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 people, but it would be a lot of money to a lot of
3 communities.

4 In today's education, we are really
5 striving to have STEM related occupations for the future
6 of our work force. STEM is Science, Technology,
7 Engineering, and Math.

8 Galloo has been a partner without even one
9 shovel to build a partnership with the local region
10 through BOCES and through Sackets Harbor and their build a
11 wind turbine project. It's sparking interest for
12 interesting future projects and careers. I think that
13 Galloo Island believes that education is the key to our
14 future.

15 I also, during that time, was the inaugural
16 President of the Tri-County Energy Consortium where
17 municipalities throughout St. Lawrence, Lewis, and
18 Jefferson County along with school districts bonded
19 together and created a consortium so we could use what we
20 know the federal government has and try to bring some of
21 that back to our area and try as we will, our objective
22 was to bring renewable energy. While in its infancy, the
23 first solar arrays opened and it's generating power. The
24 spark was lit and I was happy to say I was a part of that.

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 According to the Bureau of Labor
3 Statistics, employment in this country for wind turbine
4 technicians and solar installers are the two highest
5 growing occupations. I will tell you that I respect all
6 people in this room. I respect all people and how this
7 project will affect you. I truly do.

8 I want to thank you for the opportunity to
9 speak, to address you, and in the end a lot of research
10 will need to be done whether this project will go forward
11 or it will not be a reality in the future.

12 I want the North Country. I chose the
13 North Country. I came back here. I raised my children
14 here and perhaps my lens is quite narrow for those of you
15 from Henderson. My mother-in-law will probably kick me in
16 the teeth because she is not at all positive in regard to
17 this project, but what I can tell you is that we have to
18 have a spark. We have to remember that our days here are
19 limited and that without thinking outside of the box and
20 being close minded, we'd still be driving buggies and we'd
21 still be doing lots of things that we never thought we
22 could do, so with that, in the end, a decision will be
23 made.

24 I respect the decision that has to be made.
25 I know I would not want to make it. I respect all of you

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 and I thank you for giving me the respect today to at
3 least voice one opinion, only one opinion, and that
4 opinion is only mine. Thank you very much.

5 A.L.J. MORENO: Our next speaker is Molly
6 Reilly.

7 MS. MOLLY REILLY: Good afternoon. I'm
8 Molly Reilly and I am the mayor of the Village of Sackets
9 Harbor which is situated in the town of Hounsfield. The
10 Village of Sackets Harbor has previously submitted
11 comments related to the proposed Galloo Island Wind Farm
12 Project and today I offer comments on behalf of the
13 Village of Sackets Harbor in order to bring attention to
14 potential impacts from the project on a cultural and
15 historic resources.

16 Sackets Harbor is a small community of
17 about 1500 residents and the major economic activity of
18 the village is tourism. The village's historic character
19 with designation of areas on the National Register of
20 Historic Districts is at once the foundation and the
21 impetus for our tourist economy.

22 The situation of those historic places
23 including the New York State Parks, Sackets Harbor
24 Battlefield, and the Sackets Harbor Heritage Area
25 Visitor's Center at Market Square are on the shores of

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 Lake Ontario and they define the critical economic
3 interests of the village.

4 As the village's historic and coastal
5 assets are its important physical resources and the
6 drivers of our economy, the village believes that it is
7 important and proper that the applicant consult and
8 collaborate and coordinate with the village regarding all
9 plans that might impact those resources, including
10 detailed site plans related to parking, project staging,
11 and transportation. Having engaged in a full effort to
12 articulate the interests of the residents of the Village
13 of Sackets Harbor, our village has sought substantial
14 legal counsel and to that end, the village strongly
15 encourages that there be a full award of intervenor funds
16 as requested by the village. And I thank you for
17 consideration of these comments and for physically taking
18 a deliberative process.

19 A.L.J. MORENO: The next speaker is Gary
20 Zehr.

21 Do you know if Gary is still in the room or
22 perhaps -- is Gary Zehr? Okay. We'll move along then.
23 Robert Ashodian?

24 MR. ROBERT ASHODIAN: Thank you very much
25 for this opportunity. It's very worthwhile for you folks

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 to have a gathering here. I spoke about ten years ago on
3 the last project and one of the early comments that I
4 made, I'll repeat again.

5 For the first time in my life, I am really
6 afraid of our government and afraid especially of what
7 people in Albany are trying to push on Upstate New York
8 citizens. We live in an absolutely marvelous area for
9 which I don't believe our state legislators really care
10 about. And I am also afraid of any agency that can make
11 decisions that impact our livelihood and our way of life
12 here in this community.

13 I've sailed Lake Ontario for some thirty-
14 five years. I don't sail anymore because I'm old and my
15 knees hurt. I have a beautiful home on County Route 123
16 directly across from Lime Barrel Shoal.

17 This is a unique area not only in New York
18 state, but in the United States and around the world. It
19 is the finest cruising area, boating area, and fishing
20 area and uninterested, uncaring government officials in
21 Albany want to destroy us by misguided policies and the
22 only way is to push back and that's why we're here today.

23 One of the concerns that I have I'm not
24 going to harp about the economics or the engineering or
25 the lack of viability of the overall concept of trying to

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 support wind power by extensive subsidies, PILOTs, and
3 production patch products. I want to talk about something
4 in terms of visual impact. Sometime back in April of '15
5 -- April of 2015, I did submit a letter outlining the same
6 thought. I've cleaned it up a little bit and I'm going to
7 submit this to the group that's here -- actually I can see
8 better without my glasses on when it comes to reading.

9 So the title of my paper goes Galloo Island
10 Wind Turbines, Can You See Them Now? The Galloo Island
11 proposal refers to 32 wind turbines 574 feet tall. How
12 big will thirty-two 574 feet high wind turbines six miles
13 from the mainland appear on the horizon? In the earlier
14 presentation, they had a couple of -- looked like sunset
15 shots and they said oh, they've done a big visual study,
16 but here's some comparisons for the visual reference. I
17 don't know how many people have a good frame of reference
18 when somebody says it's 574 feet.

19 One tenth of a mile is 528 feet. A
20 football field is 100 yards, 300 feet, in length. Imagine
21 an industrial wind turbine about twice the height of the
22 length of a football field. A typical Great Lakes
23 freighter is 600 to 700 feet long. Imagine a 600-foot
24 lake freighter stood on end. The Henderson water tower,
25 probably typical of water towers in the area, is 125 feet

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 high. A wind turbine at 640 feet is about 5 times higher
3 than a water tower.

4 A typical two-story house is 27 to 30 feet
5 high including the roof. I'll do the math for you. A 575
6 high -- foot high wind turbine is about the same as 18 or
7 19 houses piled on top of each other. The Dulles State
8 Office Building is about 200 feet high and here's a good
9 frame of reference because everybody can see it from Stony
10 Point, the nuclear cooling tower in Oswego is 450 feet
11 high. Can you see it --

12 AUDIENCE: Yes.

13 MR. ASHODIAN: -- from where you live?

14 AUDIENCE: Yes.

15 MR. ASHODIAN: You bet you can, so the
16 argument comes back well, the references you're making,
17 Bob, they're all wet because these are big bulky things
18 and we're not going to see that, so some of other
19 comparisons. The Seattle Washington Space Needle is 600
20 feet high and the Washington Monument is 500 feet high.
21 Now that you can visualize the height, imagine that part
22 of the height is derived from the diameter of the rotor --
23 the blades. Imagine on Galloo Island, six miles off
24 shore, 32 industrial wind turbines with this height and

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 breadth, in motion, with red, blinking aviation warning
3 lights near the tower apex.

4 Can you imagine how high these industrial
5 wind machines would be in the pristine eastern end of Lake
6 Ontario six, twelve, or even twenty miles from shore? Can
7 you imagine the visual impact from Cape Vincent, Chaumont,
8 Lyme, Dexter, Sackets Harbor, and Henderson Harbor? Of
9 course, you can.

10 So let's not be fooled by the developer
11 when they downplay any visual impact these massive
12 spinning machines cause. Galloo Island itself is only a
13 few feet above lake level, as is Stony Island in its
14 forefront to the south. Any structure 570 feet high will
15 be very, very visible night and day for many, many miles,
16 from Mexico Bay to Tibbett's Point and inland even to the
17 Tug Hill plateau region.

18 This view shed degradation will destroy
19 this beautiful area forever to produce energy to be
20 consumed downstate where off shore wind is not permitted
21 within their view shed. That's not fair. Because Albany
22 doesn't care, but we do. Thank you very much.

23 A.L.J. MORENO: Thank you. Our next
24 speaker is Garrett McCarthy.

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 MR. GARRETT MCCARTHY: Thank you. Good
3 afternoon. My name is Garrett McCarthy. I'm Henderson's
4 Historical Society Director representing myself. I've
5 been coming to the area for the last twenty-five, twenty-
6 six years. I'm from Springfield, Massachusetts and just
7 in general, my involvement in the area, especially in
8 historic preservation has led me to the numerous towns
9 north of us especially specifically along the Black River
10 where manufacturing was extensive one hundred years ago
11 and what powered that was the Black River and what makes
12 that river unique amongst all is its constant current with
13 only about a foot or two difference throughout the year.

14 Unlike when we discuss, or we have
15 questions, in regards to what happens with the turbines
16 when the wind is not blowing? What is the interruption?
17 What has to kick in? Is there still other coal-fired
18 plants that the utilities have to fire up to fill in the
19 gap time until the winds come back? But what I've noticed
20 along the Black River is its underutilization in terms of
21 its hydroelectric power and what that has for long term
22 for the foreseeable future for the North Country. Is this
23 plan a good fit? Is it a good partnership for the
24 taxpayers of New York state or could it be not the right
25 time, not the right plan?

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 Why aren't the taxpayers of New York state
3 offered additional plans which could encompass more hydro
4 -- hydraulic, I'm sorry, hydroelectric power usage of a
5 natural resource which would have far less impact on the
6 area, far less degradation. It would not impose upon what
7 it does to our tourism-based economies all along what they
8 call the Golden Crescent. It's absolutely stunning what
9 you have up here between St. Lawrence River.

10 There are all the other arguments
11 environmentally that have been made already so -- but in
12 terms of long-term usage, energy production, if that's the
13 main concern from Albany, show us some additional plans.
14 Why is it just this being shoved at us and the decision is
15 going to be pretty much made by -- behind closed doors?
16 We should have a say. We should have a voice and those
17 type of projects would produce long-term jobs as opposed
18 to what we've seen in the nominal construction phase of
19 these turbines at the different sites and then it's left
20 to a skeleton crew for monitoring and repair. So that's
21 all I have to say is we -- we're not being offered
22 additional projects to address energy usage especially for
23 downstate. If we are to be used, and that was the phrase
24 that has been thrown -- thrown about quite a bit, if we

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 are to be used up here, then let's have more bang for our
3 buck. That's what I'm saying. Thank you.

4 MR. MELFI: You misspoke one thing.

5 A.L.J. MORENO: I'm sorry. Could you just
6 --

7 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Just say your name again.

8 A.L.J. MORENO: -- say your name again?

9 MR. MELFI: Ray Melfi, Ray Melfi. I said
10 Maple Ridge -- the windmill fell down in Maple Ridge and
11 fell down on Madison County Wind Farm it went down. Okay?
12 But these guys knew about it, so I want to apologize to
13 them for saying Maple Ridge, but it went down in the
14 Madison County Wind Farm and it did -- it did go down.

15 A.L.J. MORENO: Thank you.

16 MR. MELFI: It was a design flaw.

17 A.L.J. MORENO: Our next speaker is Luke
18 Dailey. No? Not Luke Dailey?

19 MS. LUKE DAILEY: Yes, yes, nickname. Hi.

20 A.L.J. MORENO: Hi there.

21 MS. DAILEY: My name is Luke Dailey. I
22 come from the village, a town and rural area. We've just
23 been through what you folks are all going through now. I
24 wish you the best of luck and I offer you the advice that
25 you should organize -- organize right now and organize

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 well. A wind company came to our town that did not have
3 zoning, that had poor residents, and sneaked in, signed
4 leases before the town government had -- even knew they
5 were there. Their neighbors had no idea that someone was
6 planning to put a 500-foot tower up next to their house.

7 The Article 10 process is being changed all
8 along. Believe it or not, this is better than what we got
9 at the beginning. We didn't have any public hearings at
10 the very beginning. We had dog and pony shows from a
11 different wind developer. The same ones who developed Mr.
12 Burke's place down on Maple Ridge and just to be
13 absolutely clear, he does make \$40,000 a year and he
14 bragged that he doesn't even have to go to work if he
15 doesn't want to, so that's very important that you know
16 who you're hearing from.

17 Some of the town people that wanted to have
18 wind towers in our company brought in legislators from
19 Lowville and they told us how wonderful the wind turbines
20 were. When we asked them how close they lived to a
21 turbine? Seven miles. It wasn't on their property. They
22 weren't living next to it.

23 A lot of Mr. Burke's neighbors have left
24 and that's what happens with these. If any of you ever go
25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 over to Burlington through -- through Chateaugay, it's --
3 it's horrendous to see what happens with wind turbines.

4 The company has told you that there's not a
5 big problem with migratory birds. We had a woman who was
6 coming home late from work. It was a foggy night and she
7 found fifty dead snow geese on -- in the road under the
8 wind turbines. That wasn't a hunter. That wasn't cars.
9 That was wind turbines and I really hope you folks can
10 organize. We have signs in our car. We have materials to
11 give you. We want to help you if we can. We are just
12 recovering ourselves from being through a war for the last
13 two years.

14 I have some -- some comments for the
15 Article 10 folks here because there are some things they
16 can do to improve the process and I'm hoping they'll do
17 that. Your public information program, it should --
18 people -- the company should have to go to the town before
19 they ever go to lease holders. They should not be
20 sneaking in under the radar. Right? The leases should be
21 promptly filed at the court -- at your court house and
22 there should be notice to all adjoining land owners that
23 this is being proposed for their -- for their homes to
24 people next to where these leases are signed.

25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 Sometimes we have found that the wind
3 companies wait 6, 8, 9 months before those leases ever
4 show up in the court house and I don't think many of us
5 hang around court houses looking to see what's going on.

6 The public comment period for the P.S.S.,
7 we were fortunate enough that we were allowed more time
8 these are huge documents -- huge documents for untrained
9 people to try to sort through. You have this much time to
10 get experts on board to help you and you have no -- no
11 reassurance that you're going to get money to pay for
12 them. The intervenor funding, even though we think it's a
13 great idea, it's inadequate. We spent at least three
14 times what it -- what we were granted in intervenor funds
15 to try to let the public know about the meetings, to let
16 the public know the information that they needed to know
17 to make the decisions.

18 The application, 90 days after the P.S.S.
19 is totally inadequate. The P.S.S., like I said, is a huge
20 document. You have to find experts to help you understand
21 it and to go through it and then get them paid. The
22 comments, people are allowed to put comments on -- on the
23 internet. Unfortunately, a lot of them get kicked back
24 because they're not in a quote unquote readable format.
25 Now for many of us, computers are difficult enough and to

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 go through something and write it up and then have it
3 kicked back and have no idea what they're talking about
4 with a readable format when they have people in Albany
5 that can easily transmit that into a quote unquote
6 readable format is -- is another failing of this system
7 and the first -- there's only one -- just to give you
8 hope, there's only one project that has gone through --
9 one wind project that has gone through the Article 10
10 process and been approved and that's Cassadaga Wind.

11 Unfortunately, it turns out that the power
12 from Cassadaga Wind which is down there almost to the
13 Pennsylvania border near -- south of Buffalo, you know, is
14 going to Massachusetts. Now if you can tell me that
15 that's part of public need, well, we're the public here
16 guys. It's our tax money that's supporting these and we
17 have information about how every electric bill you pay and
18 your taxes that go to NYSEDA that go to subsidies to
19 these companies, we have it all with us and we hope you'll
20 take some and we hope you'll give it to other people so
21 they understand what's really going on here.

22 In addition, just some of the things that's
23 been brought up today, I already told you about the snow
24 geese. What has not been mentioned is bats. Now we also
25 have information about bats and their importance to

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 agriculture and their importance to insect control and the
3 wind turbines, I have something that told me that wind
4 turbines are now the number one killer of bats in addition
5 to White Nose Syndrome which many of you know about in the
6 caves where they live. The bats are very important and
7 just as important as the birds, not as lovely I'll admit,
8 but just as important.

9 The radar in Fort Drum, if what -- what
10 those wind turbines are going to produce is nothing for
11 funding in terms of what -- what Fort Drum brings to this
12 area and I think you should all be aware that they say
13 there's no problem with the radars. Well, there's
14 problems. I've seen it on the weather in Texas where
15 there's wind turbines. They'll show oh, it shows it's
16 raining over there in Taft, but that's just the wind
17 turbines. It messes up radar and weather radar.

18 School funding, we heard an educator that
19 said this would be a good thing. Well, we also have
20 information from the State School Board Association that
21 says that if your town -- school district gets money from
22 a wind project or some other installation like the one
23 fellow was telling you, that gets taken away. The state
24 says you're getting it here? Oh, okay. You don't need it
25 from us, so it's -- there's no gain there.

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 And then the last thing, people have talked
3 a little bit about noise. Well, you think it is way out
4 there six miles. There's a study from Wisconsin that
5 found that infrasound which nobody is even mentioning,
6 it's not the whoosh whoosh, it's this thump thump that you
7 may hear when somebody has got a -- a boom box too loud of
8 a car next to you, that's what creates the health
9 problems. That's what upsets people's heart rhythms.
10 That's what keeps people awake at night. There was
11 another educator from over there in Clinton/Franklin
12 County and he had to leave his home because the turbines
13 that were a quarter and a third of a mile -- no, a third
14 and a half mile from his home made -- turned his house
15 into a reverberation chamber. It was louder inside than
16 out. Infrasound 6 miles, that's 6 miles if what I heard
17 tonight is correct.

18 So I'm wishing you all the luck in the
19 world. We'd like to share information with you. We're
20 still in recovery, so that's about the best we can do, but
21 good luck and I hope that the Article 10 process, it at
22 least saves you from your local planning boards having to
23 deal with this because that's what the SEQRA Process was.
24 It was all on the locals who are volunteers who are not
25 usually trained professionals, so at least you have that.

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 Your best bet and I don't even think they
3 have a vote is your ad hoc local people. Make those
4 comments on the website and make sure they're in a
5 readable format. Thank you.

6 A.L.J. MORENO: I'm sorry, ma'am. Did you
7 say you lived close to Maple Ridge?

8 MS. DAILEY: It was going to be North Ridge
9 --

10 A.L.J. MORENO: North Ridge.

11 MS. DAILEY: -- but now it ain't. Thank
12 heavens. Thank you guys.

13 A.L.J. MORENO: Thank you very much.

14 MS. DAILEY: We know it's tough and we love
15 Michelle Phillips.

16 A.L.J. MORENO: I'm so glad. I'll pass
17 that along. Thank you. I only have one card left for
18 folks that had indicated an interest in speaking and that
19 was Gary Zehr.

20 Is Gary in the room? Okay. Unless anybody
21 else has an interest in filling out a card, is there
22 anyone else interested in filling out a card and speaking
23 here today? Well, then with that then, we thank you all
24 very much for coming out today and participating and
25 letting us know what your comments and concerns are, and

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327
2 we will adjourn. I do just want to remind folks that if
3 you missed the information session that we had earlier
4 today, there is another one starting at six o'clock and we
5 will be hosting another public statement hearing at seven.
6 Thank you very much.

7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1 Public Statement Hearing - 8-14-18 - 15-F-0327

2 STATE OF NEW YORK

3 I, HANNAH ALLEN, do hereby certify that the foregoing was
4 reported by me, in the cause, at the time and place, as
5 stated in the caption hereto, at Page 1 hereof; that the
6 foregoing typewritten transcription consisting of pages 1
7 through 56, is a true record of all proceedings had at the
8 hearing.

9 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
10 subscribed my name, this the 21st day of August, 2018.

11

12

13 HANNAH ALLEN, Reporter

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25