

ESCO Proceeding - September 2017
All Residential - Electric and Gas
2014 - 2016

	Total Customers (Aggregate Number of Bills to Customers)		Comparative Aggregate Utility Bill		Aggregate Difference (Actual ESCO - Comparative Utility)	Percent Difference compared to Utility Amount
		Actual Aggregate ESCO Bill				
CH	1,015,436	\$ 246,403,401	\$ 219,723,943	\$ 26,679,458	12.1%	
CE *	29,800,367	\$ 4,167,788,001	\$ 3,669,122,295	\$ 498,665,706	13.6%	
NYSEG	7,405,519	\$ 852,867,176	\$ 761,752,692	\$ 91,114,484	12.0%	
O&R	4,535,469	\$ 711,061,349	\$ 666,653,421	\$ 44,407,929	6.7%	
RGE	4,463,911	\$ 479,817,274	\$ 436,176,757	\$ 43,640,518	10.0%	
NiMo	13,518,239	\$ 1,554,221,153	\$ 1,277,029,645	\$ 277,191,613	21.7%	
KEDNY	6,553,580	\$ 670,801,783	\$ 545,046,637	\$ 125,755,146	23.1%	
KEDLI	1,602,870	\$ 244,494,671	\$ 206,138,744	\$ 38,355,927	18.6%	
NFG	2,931,991	\$ 275,770,330	\$ 228,542,032	\$ 47,228,298	20.7%	
Total	71,827,382	\$ 9,203,225,137	\$ 8,010,186,165	\$ 1,193,039,078	14.9%	

Low Income - Electric and Gas
2014 - 2016

	Total Customers (Aggregate Number of Bills to Customers)		Comparative Aggregate Utility Bill		Aggregate Difference (Actual ESCO - Comparative Utility)	Percent Difference compared to Utility Amount
		Actual Aggregate ESCO Bill				
CH	44,391	\$ 9,935,738	\$ 8,914,252	\$ 1,021,486	11.5%	
CE *	5,940,807	\$ 569,525,875	\$ 495,459,761	\$ 74,066,114	14.9%	
NYSEG	864,536	\$ 87,653,286	\$ 72,815,209	\$ 14,838,077	20.4%	
O&R	459,241	\$ 59,763,906	\$ 57,558,369	\$ 2,205,537	3.8%	
RGE	647,225	\$ 63,471,581	\$ 57,516,723	\$ 5,954,858	9.7%	
NiMo	1,377,105	\$ 141,204,714	\$ 112,695,377	\$ 28,509,362	25.3%	
KEDNY	511,134	\$ 45,549,497	\$ 36,739,286	\$ 8,810,211	24.0%	
KEDLI	44,338	\$ 5,545,406	\$ 4,279,140	\$ 1,266,266	29.6%	
NFG	624,543	\$ 54,322,970	\$ 44,220,498	\$ 10,102,472	22.8%	
Total	10,513,320	\$ 1,036,972,972	\$ 890,198,613	\$ 146,416,950	16.4%	

Small Commercial - Electric and Gas
2014 - 2016

	Total Customers (Aggregate Number of Bills to Customers)		Comparative Aggregate Utility Bill		Aggregate Difference (Actual ESCO - Comparative Utility)	Percent Difference compared to Utility Amount
		Actual Aggregate ESCO Bill				
CH	180,901	\$ 43,583,061	\$ 40,170,321	\$ 3,412,740	8.5%	
CE *	3,588,151	\$ 683,681,206	\$ 668,109,792	\$ 15,571,414	2.3%	
NYSEG	736,207	\$ 117,826,573	\$ 120,425,959	\$ (2,599,385)	-2.2%	
O&R	105,196	\$ 27,656,373	\$ 23,318,362	\$ 4,338,011	18.6%	
RGE	407,345	\$ 83,040,505	\$ 79,020,192	\$ 4,020,313	5.1%	
NiMo	1,356,257	\$ 243,846,481	\$ 214,114,391	\$ 29,732,090	13.9%	
KEDNY	607,876	\$ 551,729,199	\$ 516,820,574	\$ 34,908,625	6.8%	
KEDLI	547,733	\$ 434,571,743	\$ 393,903,250	\$ 40,668,493	10.3%	
NFG	274,635	\$ 51,245,217	\$ 45,051,204	\$ 6,194,012	13.7%	
Total	7,804,301	\$ 2,237,180,359	\$ 2,100,934,044	\$ 136,246,315	6.5%	

* Per response to IR DPS 1-1, approximately 2% of the total number of bill records from 2011 - 2016 were excluded since their customer class information is no longer available in company's system.

ESCO Proceeding - September 2017
All Residential - Electric
2014 - 2016

	Total Customers (Aggregate Number of Bills to Customers)	Actual Aggregate ESCO Bill	Comparative Aggregate Utility Bill	Aggregate Difference (Actual ESCO - Comparative Utility)	Percent Difference compared to Utility Amount	Actual ESCO Aggregate kWh
CH	790,290	\$ 199,232,913	\$ 176,330,687	\$ 22,902,226	13.0%	1,015,770,952
CE	23,936,775	\$ 3,314,568,023	\$ 2,928,584,319	\$ 385,983,704	13.2%	10,765,033,925
NYSEG	5,819,660	\$ 686,046,668	\$ 604,624,449	\$ 81,422,219	13.5%	4,714,003,438
O&R	2,656,533	\$ 452,264,519	\$ 441,739,598	\$ 10,524,920	2.4%	2,083,440,771
RGE	2,461,059	\$ 283,603,504	\$ 266,297,956	\$ 17,305,547	6.5%	1,949,668,214
NiMo	9,656,073	\$ 1,203,689,900	\$ 999,756,966	\$ 203,932,980	20.4%	7,070,873,040
Total	45,320,390	\$ 6,139,405,526	\$ 5,417,333,976	\$ 722,071,597	13.3%	27,598,790,340

Low Income - Electric
2014 - 2016

	Total Customers (Aggregate Number of Bills to Customers)	Actual Aggregate ESCO Bill	Comparative Aggregate Utility Bill	Aggregate Difference (Actual ESCO - Comparative Utility)	Percent Difference compared to Utility Amount	Actual ESCO Aggregate kWh
CH	26,512	\$ 6,408,944	\$ 5,628,838	\$ 780,106	13.9%	31,061,946
CE	4,651,824	\$ 515,629,058	\$ 448,120,226	\$ 67,508,832	15.1%	1,697,944,462
NYSEG	548,649	\$ 60,038,904	\$ 46,560,325	\$ 13,478,579	28.9%	400,737,893
O&R	235,790	\$ 35,849,390	\$ 36,012,291	\$ (162,901)	-0.5%	165,700,171
RGE	341,655	\$ 32,901,381	\$ 30,979,098	\$ 1,922,283	6.2%	233,607,274
NiMo	845,563	\$ 95,066,291	\$ 77,225,747	\$ 17,840,555	23.1%	562,088,569
Total	6,649,993	\$ 745,893,968	\$ 644,526,525	\$ 101,367,454	15.7%	3,091,140,316

Small Commercial - Electric
2014 - 2016

	Total Customers (Aggregate Number of Bills to Customers)	Actual Aggregate ESCO Bill	Comparative Aggregate Utility Bill	Aggregate Difference (Actual ESCO - Comparative Utility)	Percent Difference compared to Utility Amount	Actual ESCO Aggregate kWh
CH	116,974	\$ 18,328,140	\$ 16,805,618	\$ 1,522,522	9.1%	93,400,564
CE	2,754,816	\$ 494,236,649	\$ 504,417,612	\$ (10,180,963)	-2.0%	1,628,533,503
NYSEG	481,843	\$ 36,554,391	\$ 39,352,423	\$ (2,798,032)	-7.1%	295,702,910
O&R	32,719	\$ 2,449,187	\$ 2,513,345	\$ (64,158)	-2.6%	7,610,563
RGE	217,845	\$ 23,855,852	\$ 24,175,951	\$ (320,098)	-1.3%	176,883,135
NiMo	908,089	\$ 120,644,452	\$ 109,744,418	\$ 10,900,035	9.9%	674,526,511
Total	4,512,286	\$ 696,068,672	\$ 697,009,367	\$ (940,695)	-0.1%	2,876,657,186

ESCO Proceeding - September 2017

All Residential - Gas

2014 - 2016

	Total Customers (Aggregate Number of Bills to Customers)	Actual Aggregate Bill	ESCO	Comparative Aggregate Utility Bill	Aggregate Difference (Actual ESCO - Comparative Utility)	Percent Difference compared to Utility Amount	Actual ESCO Aggregate Therms *		
CH	225,146	\$	47,170,487	\$	43,393,255	\$	3,777,232	8.7%	29,354,319
CE	5,863,592	\$	853,219,978	\$	740,537,976	\$	112,682,002	15.2%	540,117,394
NYSEG	1,585,859	\$	166,820,508	\$	157,128,243	\$	9,692,265	6.2%	166,411,584
O&R	1,878,936	\$	258,796,830	\$	224,913,822	\$	33,883,008	15.1%	194,926,195
RGE	2,002,852	\$	196,213,771	\$	169,878,800	\$	26,334,970	15.5%	175,039,257
NiMo	3,862,166	\$	350,531,253	\$	277,272,679	\$	73,258,633	26.4%	328,781,142
KEDNY	6,553,580	\$	670,801,783	\$	545,046,637	\$	125,755,146	23.1%	435,241,910
KEDLI	1,602,870	\$	244,494,671	\$	206,138,744	\$	38,355,927	18.6%	177,528,916
NFG	2,931,991	\$	275,770,330	\$	228,542,032	\$	47,228,298	20.7%	270,999,311
Total	26,506,992	\$	3,063,819,611	\$	2,592,852,189	\$	470,967,480	18.2%	2,318,400,029

Low Income - Gas

2014 - 2016

	Total Customers (Aggregate Number of Bills to Customers)	Actual Aggregate Bill	ESCO	Comparative Aggregate Utility Bill	Aggregate Difference (Actual ESCO - Comparative Utility)	Percent Difference compared to Utility Amount	Actual ESCO Aggregate Therms *		
CH	17,879	\$	3,526,794	\$	3,285,414	\$	241,380	7.3%	2,114,005
CE	1,288,983	\$	53,896,818	\$	47,339,535	\$	6,557,283	13.9%	20,590,899
NYSEG	315,887	\$	27,614,382	\$	26,254,884	\$	1,359,498	5.2%	30,667,813
O&R	223,451	\$	23,914,516	\$	21,546,078	\$	2,368,438	11.0%	18,074,489
RGE	305,570	\$	30,570,199	\$	26,537,625	\$	3,675,141	13.8%	29,560,901
NiMo	531,542	\$	46,138,423	\$	35,469,629	\$	10,668,807	30.1%	48,687,575
KEDNY	511,134	\$	45,549,497	\$	36,739,286	\$	8,810,211	24.0%	34,294,527
KEDLI	44,338	\$	5,545,406	\$	4,279,140	\$	1,266,266	29.6%	4,224,670
NFG	624,543	\$	54,322,970	\$	44,220,498	\$	10,102,472	22.8%	53,547,571
Total	3,863,327	\$	291,079,004	\$	245,672,088	\$	45,049,496	18.3%	241,762,451

Small Commercial - Gas **

2014 - 2016

	Total Customers (Aggregate Number of Bills to Customers)	Actual Aggregate Bill	ESCO	Comparative Aggregate Utility Bill	Aggregate Difference (Actual ESCO - Comparative Utility)	Percent Difference compared to Utility Amount	Actual ESCO Aggregate Therms *		
CH	63,927	\$	25,254,921	\$	23,364,703	\$	1,890,218	8.1%	24,488,288
CE	833,335	\$	189,444,557	\$	163,692,180	\$	25,752,378	15.7%	125,072,851
NYSEG	254,364	\$	81,272,183	\$	81,073,536	\$	198,647	0.2%	97,585,862
O&R	72,477	\$	25,207,186	\$	20,805,017	\$	4,402,169	21.2%	26,097,487
RGE	189,500	\$	59,184,653	\$	54,844,241	\$	4,340,412	7.9%	71,000,684
NiMo	448,168	\$	123,202,029	\$	104,369,973	\$	18,832,056	18.0%	152,414,246
KEDNY	607,876	\$	551,729,199	\$	516,820,574	\$	34,908,625	6.8%	601,122,227
KEDLI	547,733	\$	434,571,743	\$	393,903,250	\$	40,668,493	10.3%	421,749,454
NFG	274,635	\$	51,245,217	\$	45,051,204	\$	6,194,012	13.7%	54,958,635
Total	3,292,015	\$	1,541,111,687	\$	1,403,924,678	\$	137,187,010	9.8%	1,574,489,734

* Central Hudson, NFG, O&R provided usage data in ccf. Staff converted ccf data to therms using 1.03 conversion factor.

** Central Hudson and NFG includes "Small Industrial" customers. NYSYEG/RG&E includes some "Small Industrial" customers. O&R "Small Commercial" customers are categorized as < 5000 MCF.

**Aggregate ESCO Bill Variance Compared to Utility
Electric**

Utility	All Residential				Total	Utility	Low Income				
	2014	2015	2016				2014	2015	2016	Total	
CH	\$ 6,335,263	\$ 8,563,345	\$ 8,003,618	\$	22,902,226	CH	\$ 257,456	\$ 263,780	\$ 258,870	\$	780,106
Con Edison	\$ 111,040,669	\$ 143,582,362	\$ 131,360,672	\$	385,983,704	Con Edison	\$ 19,705,553	\$ 23,867,233	\$ 23,936,046	\$	67,508,832
NYSEG	\$ 13,328,235	\$ 41,440,706	\$ 26,653,278	\$	81,422,219	NYSEG	\$ 2,012,852	\$ 9,251,485	\$ 2,214,242	\$	13,478,579
O&R	\$ (4,407,939)	\$ 7,029,157	\$ 7,903,703	\$	10,524,920	O&R	\$ (506,919)	\$ 223,569	\$ 120,449	\$	(162,901)
RG&E	\$ (7,463,278)	\$ 14,313,015	\$ 10,455,810	\$	17,305,547	RG&E	\$ (715,857)	\$ 1,510,948	\$ 1,127,192	\$	1,922,283
NMPC	\$ 63,724,845	\$ 85,241,674	\$ 54,966,461	\$	203,932,980	NMPC	\$ 4,935,777	\$ 7,655,281	\$ 5,249,497	\$	17,840,555
Total	\$ 182,557,796	\$ 300,170,260	\$ 239,343,541	\$	722,071,597	Total	\$ 25,688,863	\$ 42,772,297	\$ 32,906,295	\$	101,367,454

**Aggregate ESCO Bill Variance Compared to Utility
Gas**

Utility	All Residential				Total	Utility	Low Income				
	2014	2015	2016				2014	2015	2016	Total	
CH	\$ 458,824	\$ 1,527,208	\$ 1,791,200	\$	3,777,232	CH	\$ 19,230	\$ 109,096	\$ 113,054	\$	241,380
Con Edison	\$ 23,569,406	\$ 52,710,073	\$ 36,402,524	\$	112,682,002	Con Edison	\$ 1,907,572	\$ 2,755,220	\$ 1,894,490	\$	6,557,283
NYSEG	\$ (5,713,113)	\$ 9,751,705	\$ 5,653,672	\$	9,692,265	NYSEG	\$ (1,123,677)	\$ 1,550,980	\$ 932,196	\$	1,359,498
O&R	\$ 6,102,205	\$ 16,402,981	\$ 11,377,822	\$	33,883,008	O&R	\$ 376,825	\$ 1,293,667	\$ 697,947	\$	2,368,438
RGE	\$ 7,740,248	\$ 10,772,925	\$ 7,821,797	\$	26,334,970	RGE	\$ 1,278,302	\$ 1,424,142	\$ 972,697	\$	3,675,141
NMPC	\$ 24,622,886	\$ 29,071,450	\$ 19,564,297	\$	73,258,633	NMPC	\$ 3,909,945	\$ 3,858,789	\$ 2,900,073	\$	10,668,807
KEDNY	\$ 50,302,889	\$ 45,270,725	\$ 30,181,531	\$	125,755,146	KEDNY	\$ 3,633,591	\$ 2,954,894	\$ 2,221,726	\$	8,810,211
KEDLI	\$ 6,898,117	\$ 16,082,257	\$ 15,375,552	\$	38,355,927	KEDLI	\$ 188,608	\$ 541,354	\$ 536,304	\$	1,266,266
NFG	\$ 12,858,314	\$ 17,302,412	\$ 17,067,572	\$	47,228,298	NFG	\$ 3,553,910	\$ 3,295,482	\$ 3,253,079	\$	10,102,472
Total	\$ 126,839,778	\$ 198,891,737	\$ 145,235,966	\$	470,967,480	Total	\$ 13,744,306	\$ 17,783,623	\$ 13,521,567	\$	45,049,496