

**TRANSCRIPT: Brooklyn Community Board #1 Meeting - January 14, 2020
Presentation on Metropolitan Reliability Infrastructure Project by National Grid**

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4JArLHYEkDE&feature=emb_logo

Keith Rooney, National Grid: Good evening. Guys, my name is Keith Rooney. I'm the director for the Customer and Community team for downstate New York. With me I have Lizzet Lugo, Renee McClure, Fabio, and Pete Metzdorff. I ask about 10 minutes of presentation, it'll be short and sweet. Please hold your questions to the end. I know that there's a lot of questions here, um, I appreciate all the passion. I'm just going to make 3 points, we'll be really quick. Who we are as a company, our clean transition, and the Metropolitan Reliability Project. So thank you for having me tonight, thank you.

So who we are. We serve 1.3 million customers in New York City and another 600,000 on Long Island. Uh we have the infrastructure. Today we're investing in safety and reliability and improving the customer experience. Everything we do is for safety and reliability. We have 2000 employees as well down state. So I wanted to talk about just a real quick thing. How many people here, show of hands, how many people here use gas to power their home or their business. Not a choice, I'm just asking just to raise their hands, how many people use it? Thank you, I just wanted, I just wanted to get an idea, thank you. Um, the infrastructure, just so you know, we feed 1.8 million customers and it's a 24/7 operation, and on the coldest days we put almost 3 billion cubic feet of gas in the system, just to give you an idea of the enormity of the system.

But I wanted to talk about the clean transition, about who we are as National Grid, as a company. Just over the last year we've made the transition to clean energy, and we've invested a hundred million dollars in a company called Sun Run. This company, we actually last year converted more solar customers than we did gas company, uh we did gas customers. We normally convert about 8000 customers a year, and this year we actually, with this investment, are putting more solar in than gas, so that's a great story. We've also invested a hundred million dollars in Geronimo, which is one of the biggest solar and wind generating companies. They're based out of Minneapolis, one of the biggest companies in the United States today. That's an exciting story. We're working with our upstate, with farmers, to build solar and wind farms, so we are investing in this. Also I want to talk about, we sit on the National Offshore Wind board, setting the supply chain up for wind technology. And connected to Deepwater Wind on Block Island, which is another wind project. And then, for renewable gas, how many people here over the Kosciuszko Bridge, ever see the eggs that are off to your right, they look like 2 big eggs? We, this project, we partnered with New York City, and in this project, it took a couple of years, but together with New York City, we're taking human waste and converting into renewable natural gas that's gonna power 2500 homes. And this is gonna go live next month, February of 2020, so think of the concept, human waste stripped out, put back into the gas system, powering 2500 homes. Another, just another example of our commitment to clean energy. And then, as far as energy efficiency, we've just been nationally recognized as leaders and invested

over 55 million dollars in energy efficiency, again lowering all of our use. So this is another, just another proof. And then on the electric business, our company, we just added 165 electric charging stations. And also, our employees, if you buy an electric vehicle, we give you a check for \$5000 as a rebate, as an incentive to buy electric cars and stop using gas. So now we have over 400 employees that have taken part in this since we've offered this. So another step in the clean energy direction. So just wanted to put that out there as well. These are some of the other green initiatives. This is a green gas tariff, where you have the ability to mix renewable, uh natural gas, and reduce your regular natural gas. You can read about this online.

We also have a power to gas pilot, and a hydrogen blending study where we actually use hydrogen and blend hydrogen, we're looking at blending hydrogen into the gas system. And then for the methane reduction, we have a target to reduce by 60% and expand our demand response in geothermal pilot programs. We just completed a geothermal program out in Riverhead, LI. It was 55 and older residents and we did a geothermal loop that actually heats a group of homes and that went live, it's been a success. And in a new rate case, we're gonna be looking at new ways to do geothermal and invest in the future. So the transition is real. We are underway, but that being said, we still have 1.3 million customers in New York City and another 600,000 on Long Island. And I wanted to just, I wanted to clear something up, just to make, uh I asked about gas, how many people here drive a car? Y'all drive a car, right? So in a car, there's 30 lbs of air in a tire, just to give you an idea, and I know councilman got up before and said this is a pipeline, I want to be clear, this is not a pipeline. I've been in the business 30 years, I spent 25 years as an operator, operating the system before I came into the customer world. We receive gas, there's 4 pipelines, I'll give you a quick education, there's 4 pipelines that, one comes from Canada, two come from Texas, and the other one comes from Tennessee. They come in at about 1000 lbs, so 30 lbs in your car tire, 1000 lbs, come into a gate station where it's reduced to 350 lbs, which is our transmission system. The gas then flows through that transmission system and gets broken down into 15 lbs, which most of Brooklyn and Queens is 15 lbs. From 15 lbs, it gets broken down again into inches of water column into your home to heat your home or your business. I just want to clear up any misnomer, we are not a pipeline, we are a distribution gas company, and by the way, we've been in Brooklyn for over 100 years, and, and I know again, to add to what the councilman said, when that crisis happened in Puerto Rico, within a week, we were there. Not only we were there, we restored power, we committed people, we had bi-lingual people helping the electric crews, get everybody back on their feet, and not only that, we adopted a class of engineering students, and I personally paid for that out of my budget, and these kids came here, there was 12 of them, and we have them in our STEM pipeline program, supporting them, we bought them computers, we spent money on labs in Puerto Rico, and the intent is to have them as employees and engineers. So I just want, you know we are embedded in the communities. Renee McClure, she sits on the Green Initiative for the greenest block in Brooklyn. Just last year we had over 100 employees clean Prospect Park, so I just, we're not the enemy here. We work and live, I've been working in Brooklyn for over 30 years, so um I just wanted to put that out, and that we are clean, but the real point I wanted to make is this project is all about safety and reliability. 60% of the money that we spend on capital investment is mandated by the Public Service Commission and by PHMSA. So when you say

“Why would you put this thing in?” this is all about safety and reliability and redundancy. It has nothing to do with any pipelines, it’s nothing to, this has to, picture being home on the coldest day of the year with somebody that you love and not having gas, or losing service and having no heat for 5 days. Just think about that concept. So that’s what this is about. This project started in 2017 um and now it’s 80% complete, this is the last leg of the project, and uh once it’s completed, it ties in the whole network of the system. To give you, to make it simple, anyone familiar with Bay Ridge, the system comes from Bay Ridge, it comes from Staten Island into Bay Ridge, and it comes all the up into North Brooklyn. This connects from Brownsville all the way up to north Brooklyn, creating a gigantic horseshoe, if you will, and that gigantic horseshoe gives you redundancy, like that water main break, that was in New York City a couple days ago, all of these issues that you have on the system, this gives you the ability to feed each way and it contributes to safety, it’s all about safety, reliability, and what we’re mandated. And by the way, this project was approved by the Public Service Commission in 2017 and mandated by safety and reliability. I just wanted to put that out there, um and just another 5 minutes, I’m gonna have a couple of people come up and just get into the technical part of this. I’m more than happy to stay here and answer questions, um, any questions you may have, we have a team here, happy to have a conversation. Some of the men and women here from Sane, I welcome to sit down with you, I’d even invite you to our control center and if you want to sit down and have an energy conversation, I saw you guys at the rate case, you did an outstanding job. I will say you had some valid points, we’re not your adversary, I’d be happy to sit here and have a conversation with you, uh but I just want to know that we are embedded in the communities here and we’ve been here for over 100 years and we’re proud to serve you. So with that I’m gonna turn you over to Pete Metzdorff.

Peter Metzdorff, National Grid: So the Metropolitan national natural gas reliability project is primarily a reliability project. It is connecting one portion of our transmission system to another portion of the transmission system. It does not bring additional gas into New York City. Okay? The project is there to enhance Brooklyn’s natural gas system for the 1.3 million current customers that we serve within Brooklyn Queens and Staten Island by having the system safety and reliability and operational flexibility

The speech that Keith spoke about. What we accomplished is being able to do maintenance on the older parts of the system and maintain reliable service to the existing customers that we have at all times. We want to make sure that everybody stays warm throughout the entire winter Current weather notwithstanding. We are also here to improve the gas system capacity in support of safe and reliable service to customers in New York City by having this new pipeline come in.

It increases the number of pipes that move between two places. What that does is that reduces the pressure drop on the system and it allows us to maintain pressure to our existing customers by having two paths instead of one. Same as if you had to get out of here through one door or two doors. If you have two doors to get out you can get out twice as fast. Same concept.

This is the route map four phases four and five of the MRI project as it stands

Right now we have been working on this project now for a few months. The original three phases of this project that were installed in order to get up to this point have been put in. And we have worked hand-in-hand with the communities as we've gone through them In order to get these put in.

The goal here is to get up into the Green Point facility that National Grid has up in the mess but they have a new area. that will be one end of the system, the other end of the system will be back down in Brownsville as Keith noted

So I'll hand it over to Renee at this point thank you.

Renee McClure, National Grid: Good evening. so my name is Rene McClure. I am the manager of community and customer management for National Grid. And I cover all of Brooklyn and as we have indicated a little earlier you know it's important that we stay involved with the community and ensure the community of what we're doing so I just wanted to share with you some of the processes that we've gone across the board to ensure that we have community outreach and community connections.

The first thing what we do is we've had a dedicated project team our relations team associated with this and the project did start in 2017. We started in Brownsville Area Community Board 16 where we had meetings with them to talk about the project and address any concerns and ensure that we were on the ground test desk

we meet with community boards and bids if there's a bid in that particular location to talk about any concerns and again it's a collaborative issue because we understand the importance of having this project done but we also understand the importance of that it's going to have an impact on the community and we want to make sure that while we're in the community we are addressing any concerns that take place.

In addition to that we also reached out to our government electives because it's important that we reach out to not only the community key stakeholders but also to the government electives as well and we provided the same information

in addition to that when we look at how do we continue to maintain ongoing communications

We actually in working with our stakeholder management team we have on the ground, individuals who are responsible for ensuring that they are in the community on a regular basis to address any concerns from that initiative that we've established with them, we have phone lines we have a website which we maintain up-to-date information

we have questions and concerns

we have email addresses

I'm going to actually turn it over to Fabio who is on one of our on the ground individuals who has been out in the community regarding this project

We actually reached out initially October 23rd about the project

and we were coming in and they have been out there since, providing on-the-ground information and to address any concerns

Fabio Perla, National Grid: Yeah you sort of beat me to a bit of the punch but my name is Fabio Perla. I am the outreach director for the Metropolitan Natural Gas Reliability Project. thank you guys again. Obviously for having us here so we could talk about the project and for my piece at the community outreach that I have been doing previously. This work, while short term, does have some large impacts in the street and that is why they have me out there. Short term work doesn't feel so short if it's in front of your home right? oh sorry about that. does that matter all right? so to that end I am out in the field every day doing a part of a holistic outreach effort. What does that mean? I'm out there speaking with residents, management companies when necessary, and business owners throughout the area where we're working to make sure that we minimize disruptions as much as possible in regards to traffic management, noise concerns, all that sort of stuff.

Folks who I'm not able to reach in person we leave factsheets with kind of overarching information about the project as well as contact information. Renee mentioned we have our outreach hotline. Folks can give me a call or the rest of my team, a call. We have an email address. We have the website that has weekly updates every Monday morning. So so this holistic approach, you know, obviously we can't be everywhere at once especially me talking to folks in the field. But we were making it as widespread as possible to share information as much as possible. To that end, you know I'm gonna leave a nice stack of those fact sheets as well as the map. Folks who are following along with the agenda for this evening already have that there but we'll have some more in the back. You know, happy for folks to grab it. Please reach out through the phone number through the website. Come find me. You know we are happy.. oh there we go...even better. That information is also on the fact sheets that will be in the back. Yeah, that is it on my end okay.

Community Board: Yes Questions. Ok wait wait. I'll call on board members first. Ok go ahead.

Questioner: This is a question, out of my ignorance, I don't know do you guys have a contract or is NYCHA your customer? like do you heat the NYCHA buildings? Is that part of your..?

Keith Rooney: NYCHA is in our portfolio. Yes.

Questioner: Just because you mentioned you know heat and the winter and keeping people heated and it's just kind of ironic that that's like your selling point but we know that our NYCHA neighbors are often without heat on the coldest days of the year. Currently

Keith Rooney: yeah, so I can answer. Most of the times when there's an issue with NYCHA we send all crews out to check all the meters and on the buildings. Most of the time, I would say nine out of ten times, it's problems on the inside with equipment that needs to be upgraded.

Questioner: I also heard that there was two separate pipes, one that can operate at any temperature and one that stops operating at a certain temperature and then there's a kick back to the to whoever's running the oil and gas, or whatever it's called, I don't know all the right words, to the buildings so that that's the reason why a lot of these buildings go without heat sometimes because they need the other pipe put on. Is that...

Keith Rooney: No, so I think what you mean is we have temperature control customers. There's about 3,300 temperature control customers in New York City and what happens is they pay a cheaper rate with the intent that when the temperature hits fifteen degrees they have to switch to the alternate fuel which is oil for 24 hours or 48 hours to let cold periods over. They pay a reduced rate but we don't.. and then we also have programs for our low-income customers. We have income advocates that work with those that need assistance but it's not two pipes it's, it's you pay you know if you pay if you... Let's say I owned a house, let's say I owned a building, you know right here on Jewell Street somewhere and I wanted to...the other question to answer your second party question, we have a demand response program and what we did was we went out...say you own the factory, you had a well..so you have a laundromat...

Questioner: Say I lived at NYCHA and I didn't have heat on the coldest night of the year.

Keith Rooney: No, NYCHA is part of a city agency which is part of our customer account management

and we're supplying them with gas. If they have a problem, it's internal. It's not external. Yes, ma'am. But but the demand response program what we're doing is, we're going out to some of our big users and we're incentivizing them on the coldest days of the year to get off gas and then we're gonna give them a check at the end of the year and we're doing this to reduce the load. I hope that answered your question.

Questioner: Hi, So I happen to know that you've requested several variances to ship liquified natural gas from Greenpoint through frontline communities to New England and other locations. This is very dangerous um kind of work and I'm interested in the shipping of natural gas that you're doing.

Keith Rooney: So I'll answer that the best I can. There is two LNG plants here in Greenpoint but you see those two big white tanks off the bridge? They have, one has a billion cubic feet of

reserve. The other one has 600 million cubic feet of reserve. And on the coldest days of the year we use those tanks to go out into the transmission system when we really have you know the really like top cold four or five days of the year. But as far as trucking LNG into New York City, we have no variance at this time. We would only ask for a variance if there was an all-out emergency in an emergency situation only and that has not been approved. I, we deal with the fire chiefs. They have not approved it. Honestly you know to do it on a regular basis, absolutely not. But if it was the coldest day of the year and we had a system problems, we would ask for a variance and I'm not sure if we'll get that or not. I'm not at liberty, that's above my head.

Yes sir.

Questioner: It's been applied for. I've seen the papers.

Community Board moderator: Hold up, hold up sir.

Questioner: Yeah, it's been applied for and the papers exist.

Keith Rooney: Whether the papers exist or not and whether they get approved are two different things. They're two different things. If you would ask me ...

Questioner: But you're applying for them.

Keith Rooney: Well...

Questioner: You know it's dangerous to our community.

Keith Rooney: No, what I'm saying is if it was the coldest day of the year and there was some kind of failure that we couldn't get gas into the system here... Again we're a distribution company. The choice would be shutting off people or having this LNG trucked in for 24 hours. That's what we're asking for and again that's all up for debate and this could you know could be ongoing for quite a time.

Questioner: Um, I have some issue with the statements you made earlier about your commitment to the community and about you being embedded here as a responsible partner. My question is in regards to "the waterway?" and you are identified as potentially one of the responsible parties for the clean up and yet part of your seeking to increase ratepayer is to offload 100 percent of the cost onto the communities that have been burdened by the pollution that your parent company Brooklyn Union Gas caused. So my question is how is that being a responsible community partner?

Keith Rooney: So if you would give me your contact information I will meet you after the meeting and I'll go to our environmental group and try to get you an answer.

(loud discontent from crowd)

Keith Rooney: I really... I'm not gonna you know I'm not gonna sit here and lie to you. I I'm not the environmental department but I will get an answer for you.

Community Board moderator: Are there any more questions from our board members?

Questioner: I have a question in regard to safety, what you're calling these lines. There's just hundreds of accidents involved with similar projects where there've been fatalities, injuries and damage to buildings, to houses. In one specific, it was in 2010 in Northern California that killed 8 people and injured a lot of others. And it was found that there were basically bad welds in the construction, connecting the pipes. So I just wonder what kind of quality control will you put in place to catch that in construction and if there's any sort of detection system when the system is online to prevent them because obviously we have similar or more density here in Brooklyn than in Northern California or San Francisco so the consequences would be enormously devastating.

Keith Rooney: That's an excellent question. I will tell you that after 2010 that was the game-changer for the business. You've heard of something called Control Room Management? You could google it. After that 2010 incident in California, it changed the way we do business. Everything everything is mandated... What we have... uh what we do is we run... we're required to run PIGS through our transmission line and these are three tools that go through the pipe and they inspect for any impurities on the pipe. We have one of them cleans them the other one inspects them and then there's a digital pig that reads and goes through this everything we do is mandated and Pete if you want to add to some of the technical background stuff?

Pete Metzdorff: Alright so with regard to the way that we construct a pipeline within New York City as opposed to the pipeline that you're referring to. We operate under a much more stringent criteria than what a lot of the interstate pipelines operate under. We operate at what is considered a significantly lower percent of the yield strength of the steel pipe. The pipe that is being run through this area has additional wall thickness to it. Every single weld is x-rayed 100% to be checked by a certified radiographer to ensure that the weld is sound. After we get done constructing that pipe, the entire pipe is filled with water and put under a very high pressure test to ensure that there are no leaks. After that is done, we go back and we will go and run a number of PIGs after the fact. The pig in the pipe is a piece that goes through the inside of the pipe. We will do the inspections on that. Once that is done, we will then odorize the pipe. That odorant is in there so that this way if there is a leak, the familiar rotten egg smell that people associate with the gas leak. That is put in there to ensure that if there are any additional items that we somehow missed through all the previous things, that those will all show up after it's done. The pipe will be inspected from end to end once every seven years using the technology that is best available at that time. So as the technology gets better we use whatever the leading edge technology is. The pigs that we run today are significantly better than ones that we ran seven years ago and we expect that the ones that we run seven years from now will be better than those. So those are all things that we do throughout the pipelines. in general, the most common mode of failure for a pipeline anywhere in the country is third party damage. Somebody digging into it where they're not supposed to. We have additional

safeguards that we put in running through the New York City area. We have the pipe down at minimum depths of at least three feet if not 42 inches. As a standard, some of the areas of the pipe are down 10 or 12 feet in order to go underneath other obstructions along the way if the pipe is shallower than that we use additional steel plates or concrete barriers so that this way if somebody is excavating and they are not following the rules as far as a walkout is concerned, that they will hit that rather than the pipeline. So we have a number of significant safety pieces that are built into the entire process safety analysis that we do around all the pipes that we run.

Questioner: On your handout it says work will start in 2019 and will complete this fall. That seems really ambitious for the amount work that you have to do.

Keith Rooney: Yeah Absolutely.

Questioner: Are you really expecting to finish all this work in less than a year, A, and B, what's your relationship with DOT to reduce disruption? maybe this is a question for Fabio.

Keith Rooney: So I do the first half of that for sure. That fall of this year date refers to phase 4 where we actually do have to update that for our new map that has the combined phase four and five. Where you see that color change in the map is the demarcation point. I personally don't have a timeline for phase five as well but it's a similar length. I would imagine that it would take about the same amount of time. We meet with the DOT on a monthly basis in Manhattan and we go over all the major projects, all the little projects and how to mitigate, you know, impacts to our customers. Even when it comes to, you know, when you talk about green, we have a robotic system now. Instead of ripping up a whole block in Brooklyn we put a robot into the ground and we go all the way down the block. Instead of making 50 holes now we make one hole and actually the robot goes in and seals the leaks. So this is some of the technology that we're incorporating just to cause less harm to our customers and communities.

Questioner: Are the borough commissioners involved?

Keith Rooney: are not; their assistants are. Sometimes Polly Trottenberg. We meet on a monthly basis sometimes. They're all high-level meetings where I'll meet with Polly. I mean, if you have concerns, I'd be glad to sit and talk to you if you have issues.

Community Board Chair: Other questions by board members? First 3 speakers. Each speaker will have two minutes. The first speaker is Eric Radetzky and following him is Elizabeth Adams then Alexa. oh I'm sorry looks Alexandra Zevn and Deborah Spiroff in that order please.

Erik Radetzky: Can everyone hear me? yep, good evening, my name is Erik Radetzky. I work for Assemblyman Joe Lentol. I'm glad that we have such a large turnout here tonight. We've heard many, many complaints, questions, concerns over the past few months. Many of the people are here in the room, others who couldn't be here tonight and that's why it's important that we have National Grid here. That's why Assemblyman Lentol and I work to make sure they were here; many phone calls were made to guarantee that we would have an open and

transparent process that we would have basic accountability, that this presentation would be made here in public to the community board and to the members of this community. Now I'm not an environmental expert but I do believe in environmentalism. I believe that we need to protect our environment. We need to make sure that this project is not dangerous in terms of public safety, that this isn't about rate hikes, that this isn't about increasing capacity needlessly and that's why we have them here tonight so I'm going to limit my comments because what I really want to hear is your questions and that's what Assemblyman Lentol would want to hear as well. He's in Albany tonight so I'm going to turn back the rest of my time so that we can hear from you the members of the public.

Those of you that's called up to speak please make your way to the front.

Elizabeth Adams: Hi everyone, my name is Elizabeth Adams I work for council member Levin. I just want to start off with a little bit of framing. We just came off a gas moratorium that was done by National Grid where our gas for new hookups was put on pause and National Grid went and contacted customers and said, "hey, we need you to call your state legislators to put in the NESE pipeline so that we can get the gas back on. The State disagreed with that and the State forced National Grid to turn the people's gas back, which I think really calls into question what is the real capacity needs, what is National Grid telling us of what the expansion looks like, what the real need is, when they were looking to expand. And then we're told, hey that's not allowed and so I think it's really hard to take at this point; what's being said at face value when we haven't been given the information that we need and to know what the real universal capacity needs is and along those lines I think you know what we saw of the National Grid saying we are looking to invest in solar and and these new plans because promising. However, we have so far to go when we have so much that we need to do around switching to a world where energy comes from renewable options and so that to me didn't look like it was pretty exhaustive in terms of how we get there. What I would like to see is what National Grid is saying. We are achieving a world that is using renewable energy, that is not reliant on fossil fuels and that we're getting off fossil fuels in the next 10 years. I would like to see that more concretely so that we have an actual sense of what is happening, of what the plans are, and yeah, you know. And the last thing I would say, I think along those lines, is we're never gonna get to those goals we passed. The city passed the Climate Mobilization Act in the council last year. We're never gonna get the goals of that if we don't make real change and so far we're not there yet with National Grid.

Deborah Spiroff: My name is Deborah Spiroff. I have been a resident and a homeowner since 2004 and I have been very active and interested in environmental issues in Greenpoint, so much so that I brought the lawsuit against ExxonMobil.

So they're wanting to put in a pipeline. He said it wasn't a pipeline but then another member of his own team kept referring to it as a pipeline so I'm gonna refer to it as a pipeline. What I don't understand is why is the community just hearing about this now and they're talking about Stage four and five. Why are we just being involved in this process at this point? He's talking about

being involved in the Community. The only reason why they're here is because their arms were twisted by Joe Lentol's office. Otherwise they wouldn't be here. That's unacceptable.

We need a concrete safety plan. We need to know why this is necessary. You are putting this in a neighborhood where people and generations have died. Children. It is normal that they are tested and they have lead in their blood, so we can't believe what people are telling us. That. "oh yeah, believe us, we've done the testing." or "it's fine." For more than a hundred years they've been telling us that, yet families and children and generations have died and have been sick because of it.

Community Board Chair: Next speaker please.

Alexandra Zevin: Hi, my name is Alexandra Zevin. I'd like to thank Community Board 1 for allowing me to speak. I'm hoping that you will use your voice to ask the City of New York administration, the New York State Department of Public Service Commission and Governor Cuomo to deny this pipeline.

I'm personally speaking as someone who lived in Newtown Creek for several years and in other parts of Williamsburg and as a rate payer and as someone who's living with leukemia. I have serious doubts about the reality of how safe this pipeline is going to be. I've heard that one National Grid pipeline in Queens had 1600 safety violations this year. This is a great concern to me. I think it's disturbing that there's all this talk about modernization and improvement in the description of this pipeline and yet it's essentially a scheme to transfer the wealth of ratepayers to the shareholders and the corporate officers of National Grid and I can't remember how many thousands of dollars an hour the CEO of National Grid makes but to describe this company as embedded in the community is absurd. We do need to improve and modernize our energy system by building renewables; the thousands of scientists who contributed to the International, I mean the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, have shown us that we should not be building these pipelines. I don't think we should rob our children's future to make a quick profit for CEOs and shareholders.

Community Board Chair: The next five speakers are Kevin Lesherra, Stephen Fox, Lee Ziesche, Kim Frazcek, and Erik McGregor. Come forward please, Kevin. Following Kevin is Stephen Fox.

Kevin LeCherra: Thank you. So my name is Kevin LeCherra and I'm from Greenpoint.

Some of y'all heard this already, sorry.

My great-grandmother was born on M-- Avenue 120 years ago and we're still there. I love this place and I'm here to fight for it. This community is no stranger to what National Grid is trying to do. The Industrial Revolution in this country was born on the banks of Newtown Creek. Corporations were processing oil in Greenpoint before the Civil War. The history of North Brooklyn can be told by listing the industries that came here, destroyed the air, the soil, the

water, the health of the working-class immigrants who lived here and then left. They made their money off our backs and let the next couple of generations deal with the consequences and we're still dealing with those consequences today. One of the largest oil spills in North America, a Superfund site letting chemicals in our soil. Some of the highest asthma rates in the nation for those that were fortunate enough not to have their homes bulldozed to build the BQE. And now a massive fracked gas pipeline, a pipeline that will carry plenty of profit for National Grid but that will leave this community where we found ourselves time and time again, which is in danger.

Of course it doesn't have to be that way. The story of our neighborhood is also the story of people fighting back. People that are in this room today that showed us the way. El Puente, the fighting of the power plant, neighbors against garbage, the Exxon lawsuit, GSF, Bushwick Inlet park. This community knows those stories too. When we come together and we fight back we can win. And this fight is happening all over our city. It's happening in Sunset Park tonight where our neighbors are fighting to stop their community from being sold off like the Williamsburg waterfront. It's happening in Hunts Point where residents are sounding the alarm that the city's food supply is at the mercy of the next storm. It's happening in coastal communities in all five boroughs that were washed out during Sandy and are still rebuilding.

This is the same fight. Just like Governor Cuomo this neighborhood does not want to be held hostage by a public utility company that is supposed to be working for us. We don't want this pipeline. We want National Grid to invest in renewable energy. Now a climate emergency is coming and we don't have any time to waste.

[Applause]

Steve Fox, office of Jumaane Williams, the Public Advocate of New York: So it's always hard to follow Kevin. Hi everyone! My name is Steve Fox. I actually live within earshot of the pipeline. I'm just here to read a statement from the office of Jumaane Williams, the Public Advocate of New York.

So, as you all know, National Grid is seeking nearly 20% rate hike, totaling \$236.8 million and use it in part to complete this Metropolitan natural gas Reliability project called the MRI that will reinforce its disregard for low-income residents and frontline communities of color. Jumaane Williams is calling on Governor Cuomo and the PSC to say no to National Grid's rate hike. Jumaane is asking them not to reward last year's egregious behavior with a prize when, like a schoolyard bully, the corporation held customers hostage by denying them services because they were not getting what they wanted. In that case, New Yorkers went without gas, lost income, and business owners even lost their life savings because they could not operate. Many of those businesses were hit twice by National Grid's refusal to serve them, as well as the interruption that resulted in the construction of this fracked gas pipeline as it tore up roads in front of their communities and in front of their storefronts. The MRI project is a project that fills National Grid's coffers, a project that was largely and deceptively undertaken to install transmission pipelines that will not serve the communities being put at risk and which will harm

our environment by increasing our reliance on fracked gas and creating routes for natural gas tankers through these communities.

Last year, National Grid proved its only priority is money. New York's low-income communities already buckle under the cost of daily living and egregious environmental injustices that are the drivers of the climate change crisis we face. With profits in mind, National Grid has managed to marry these issues with an outright assault on repairs, especially low-income residents and communities of color. These communities are more valuable than National Grid's money.

We have a responsibility to not give in to this corporation but rather protect our residents. Jumaane Williams is calling on the Governor and the PSC to take care of regular New Yorkers, not just fracked gas profiteers.

Thank you very much.

Lee Ziesche: Hi, my name is Lee Ziesche. I am with Sane Energy Project.

As the gentleman from National Grid said, we are participating in the current rate case and we are arguing that this pipeline goes against climate science because fracked gas is methane which is actually more potent than CO2. Within the rate case, we asked them if they were looking at the full lifecycle of methane which is what New York State climate law says we must do. They said that they're not, so that means they're not looking at the leaking of wellheads in Pennsylvania; they're not looking at interstate leaking at compressor stations and pipelines; and they're not looking at people in Pennsylvania who are getting fracked to death. Kids in Washington County right now are getting cancer. I'm from Pennsylvania and people I love are getting poisoned right now so this pipeline is just morally reprehensible.

They're also not looking to see if there's radon in this gas. The Marcellus Shale has a very high level of radon and this gas is not traveling very far. National Grid is not looking at that. There's going to be a groundbreaking report very soon in Rolling Stone about the high levels of radon in our gas. Our argument is that, if we follow city and state climate law, this is going to become a stranded asset and who's going to get stuck paying for it? Us, that's who.

They mentioned that this pipeline is not supposed to bring in new capacity. In the testimony they filed when they started raising our rates three years ago - \$188 million to pay for phase one through phase three - they said this would bring in new gas through the Williams pipeline - 850 decatherms, I believe, a day.

So National Grid had the ability to email all their customers and push for the Williams pipeline. I don't understand why we all didn't get an email saying that this pipeline was coming, way back in 2016.

I am not a community board member; I live in Bed-Stuy so I want to thank you all for letting us come and speak - we really appreciate it. But I am a rate payer and, when I'm not working for Sane Energy, I'm waiting tables so I work really hard for my money and I don't want it to go to a

fracked gas pipeline that's going to put my future under water and put you all at risk of an explosion.

Thank you.

Kim Fraczek:Hi everybody I'm Kim Fraczek. I'm the director of Sane Energy Project.

As the gentleman from National Grid mentioned, we did ask some good questions and one of the good questions that we asked was whether they were doing any evacuation zone studies. They said no, so we worked together with our friends from FracTracker Alliance that have pipeline analysts and scientists working there. This is the evacuation zone (see handout) and my house is in that evacuation zone and so are those of 49,000 other people and 22 schools and the Woodhull hospital and numerous other other parts of our community that we want to keep intact, like our homes, our businesses, our aftercare programs, our libraries and our schools. So I just want you to know that the pipeline presentation that they're giving you is not forthcoming with all of the information. I'm going to leave this here and you all should have a handout with this evacuation zone that we were graciously able to get from the Frac Tracker Alliance.

When they tell you that they're safe, it should be noted that, on July 11th 2019, the Public Service Commission filed 1616 safety violations against National Grid and they have not answered that yet. We're waiting for that answer.

Secondly, because I'm the Director of the organization that fights fossil fuels, I've been fighting fracked gas pipelines and fracking for nearly a decade. I know a lot about this stuff and I live a block away from where they're constructing this pipeline and I just found out about it in October. So the outreach that you're doing, Fabio, is not really that great. Additionally, my local coffee shop partner was told by National Grid that they had to shut off the water for a day and the company was not compensated for that, nor were their employees. They had to shut off the water for the day because they wanted to set up their staging area for the pipeline. These guys are lying. We don't need this. This is for their shareholders, not for us.

Erik McGregor: Hello My name is Erik McGregor. I'm a Brooklyn resident and I also live one block away from the pipeline.

I just want to point to the candor that these guys have and come and use emotional names like "real reliability project". We know already what's going on. Let's do a quick straw poll. Who was outreached about this pipeline? Is there only one person here - two people - one from the Board. How big is the blast radius of your pipeline?

This is safety and this is the person who does the outreach and who will tell you how safe the pipeline is, but they don't have that information. I really think that they came here thinking that we are stupid and that they try to give us and try to make something emotional and interesting, something that we really don't need. These guys cannot answer basic safety questions. I live a

block away and he cannot tell me if I'm in the blast radius. There's a map here that shows this. He could look at the map and say 'Yes, you are in the blast radius', but they don't care. This is the bottom line - they don't care, they just want profits for their shareholders.

Thank you very much.

Shame on you all.

Community Board Chair: The last five speakers are Annie Garneva, Victoria Cabranos, Cessa Tate, Judith Canepa and Roxanne Sharif.

Annie Garneva: everyone. My name is Annie Garneva. I live in Brooklyn. I have been part of the Stop the Williams pipeline coalition for the last three years. I have many best friends and close family that live in the blast zone and in Bushwick. Bushwick is a dear place in my heart and I certainly don't want it to go up in flames the way that these people have proposed for it to happen and continue with their disingenuous lies and communication tactics to say silly things to us as if we're too poor, too stupid, too unseen, too uneducated enough to actually get through both their literal and metaphorical gaslighting tactics.

As a woman, I've had 30 years of experience of gaslighting. I know what it looks like and is. You coming up here and saying this - it's like Williams talking about 'Oh, you know, don't worry about it, it'll be fine.' And then about 30 pipelines burst because they didn't check them in the mandated seven years. But you don't do that; you say you're mandated, but you don't end up doing it. Only after the fact, after people die, after methane comes out through leaks, only after somebody catches you, that's when you say 'Oh, whoops! We did have stuff in our plan but, sorry, it's too late for your particular individual life to have been impacted by it'.

A real authentic investment would be taking all the excessive profit that you have handed over to your shareholders and executives - which is about at least four and a half billion dollars a year - instead of putting that in two redundant pipelines, putting it into real investments in geothermal pipelines, in renewable energy or in solar energy. If you say that you are going to make these investments, then take all the money that your executives do not need for more yachts and more silly condos and actually take all of that money, all of that money, - not 2%, not 5%, but all of it and put it into renewable energy.

Victoria Cabranos: Hi everyone. My name is Victoria Cabranos. I was born and raised in Greenpoint. I

still live here and I'm a candidate for City Council District 33. I really want to echo what Deborah said earlier. This doesn't feel like phase 4; this feels like phase 1 to this community. For us to find out that this project has been going on since 2010 apparently, and the conversations have only just started about all of this - about phase 1 to phase 4 and phase 5 - and just in October people started to learn about this - this is absolutely unacceptable. The public needs to be aware of these projects before they happen, before these conversations are cemented. Now,

unfortunately, it's too late - we're the last stop and, for us to stop this, we have to now take direct action. We have to go out into the streets and put our bodies on the line. That's what it's going to take to stop this and that is absolutely unacceptable. Honestly, everyone in this community has had enough of having to put their bodies on the line to stop projects and to stop having so much pollution in our communities. We know exactly what these projects bring and we know what it takes to actually stop these projects. It takes our time, our effort, our money - things that we want to dedicate to other things - and yet we have to fight this. So I am calling for a local green new deal from Greenpoint to Gowanus so we can talk about sustainability and comprehensive Infrastructure and a comprehensive City planning because we have needed that for generations, for generations we have been forgotten. And we need to do this now. We don't have a future if we don't talk about this now and if we don't think about sustainability in a comprehensive way.

Thank you.

Community Board Chair: Cessa Tate are you here? Anybody that was called, would you please step forward.

The next person after her is Judith Canepa and then Roxanne Sharif.

Cessa Tate: Hi, everybody. My name is Cessa Tate. I want to thank Community Board 1 for allowing me to speak tonight.

I had a really funny feeling during this presentation because we were asked to imagine what it would be like to be without gas in the cold and I actually didn't have to imagine that because I was one of the people who was denied gas service as a pawn in National Grid's manipulation game to try to get the Williams pipeline. So, for the sake of National Grid shareholders, I had to use an electric kettle to fill up a bathtub or I had to walk for 10 minutes to a friend's house in the freezing cold and have my hair freeze. I had to wash dishes with cold water and my hands bled. And I want to say that none of this - absolutely none of this - would have happened if public utilities, like their name implies, were publicly-owned and not privately-owned.

Judith Canepa: I'm Judith Canepa and I'm part of Sane Energy also.

I want to say that you are right - pipelines are the safest way to carry gas. Knives are safer than guns. You know, I'd rather not face either.

Anyway, we're talking about a 30-inch diameter pipe; we're talking about a hundred square inches carrying a thousand pounds per square inch, down to three hundred pounds per square inch. Imagine a square inch, each and one of those square inches carrying 300 pounds of pressure. I can't imagine that.

Here's what a 30 inch pipe rupture looks like. It not only ruptures; it moves down the pipe like a zipper, moves really fast. It emits a fireball from a hundred feet up in the air to a thousand feet up in the air. It creates a crater; it melts cars. You have a river of heat. You're trying to run

down there to get the kids out of the daycare centers, the 22 daycare centers and the 20 schools and the hospitals, and you're running on your feet because your car has melted. You can't evacuate. You can't safely get the people out of Brooklyn. These pipeline ruptures in Wisconsin, North Dakota and and Kentucky have killed people. In the East Village, a two-inch pipe ruptured and two apartment buildings went down. Two people died. What are we talking about here? Safety? Evacuation? Get real!!

Thank you

[Music]

Community Board Chair: Okay that is the last of the people that signed up to speak. Anyone wishing to ask a question - a question, not a short story disguised as a question - please line up in the center of the room and come up to the mic in the order that you get on line. Can people already standing in the aisle who don't want to speak please move over.

Questioner: I have a question about the pipe that's there right now. How big is it? My name is Ken Schles, born in Brooklyn and a Brooklyn resident. I'm not in this district, but I'm curious about the diameter of the pipe. My understanding is the existing pipe is 24-inch and you're going to a 30-inch pipe?

Peter Metzdorff: For this particular run, it will be a 30-inch pipe

Questioner: And it is replacing a 24-inch pipe?

Peter Metzdorff: No, this is a new transmission pipe.

Questioner: So this is a totally new pipe? All new capacity?

Peter Metzdorff: (Inaudible) ... a new pipe from Greenpoint down into Brownsville

Questioner: So there is no 24-inch pipe that it is replacing? I know the difference between a 24-inch pipe and a 30-inch pipe is a 70% increase in transmission rate. So you're going, you're just going from 0 to 30 inches. The question is you're going from 0 to 30 inches?

Peter Metzdorff: On the transmission system, yes.

Questioner: So this is a whole new set up?

Peter Metzdorff: It is a new pipe connecting two points. As I said before, we have two points that are connected currently by one pipe. We are adding a second pipe to connect the two. So no - it is not replacing a pipe. It is incremental to the system. It is a 30-inch pipe

Questioner: It is incremental. So my second question is 'How does this fit in with the mandates of the CLCPA?'

Community Board Chair: I would everybody to stand on line to define your questions. This is not where we want a question disguised as a short story.

Keith Rooney: This project was approved by the Public Service Commission in 2017.

Questioner: That doesn't answer my question, but I am not going to take any more of your time.

Questioner: How long have you known that phase 4 was going to happen? How long? Phase four, like you know, we're gonna build this plant. How long have you known phase four, this section of the pipeline coming through our neighborhood, how long have you known it was going to happen? When did you make the decision?

Peter Metzdorff: We had to wait for the plan, so the pipe itself, the routing of the pipe, has undergone a number of iterations so that routing for phase four and five was probably finalized in 2016.

Questioner: So you took a big gamble about the public outreach. Almost no one knew you were doing this work. Where were you for this community in 2016, 2017, 2018? Where were you in September, October, November, December to tell us that this was coming? Where were you? I would like to hear. You're here now because

Peter Metzdorff (Inaudible): We notified people as we were going along. We've gotten additional permits and worked with the city to finalize that we were going down this block or not that block and went in and got all the permits and what have you. The project has progressed as far as that's concerned.

Questioner: Sure. You are telling this community that you're doing the work and the work has already begun - the ground is trenched, the pipe is laid, so you know. it's hard for me to take what you're saying at face value ... (interrupted)

Community Board Chair: Kevin, we know you are passionate about this but let somebody speak who hasn't spoken

Questioner: I'm Antonia Ortiz and I am NOT on this board but I'm on the Board of the hospital that's in this area. I'm also on the block of your high density area. I'm trying to understand. You're a big corporation. I work for a big corporation. I'm trying to understand. How you could say you communicated anything to this community?

I live in [a complex of] seven buildings, 2,700 units. No one knew about this until they had to get their car and they were digging a hole.

So, when did you start communicating and to whom did you communicate this? Because this is not true and this is very embarrassing for you, not for us. Thank God we have all these active people that live in this community.

Renee McClure: So, when we're planning a project of this magnitude, the project was done in phases, and we started in Brownsville and we spoke to community boards, we spoke to anyone that we needed to have a conversation with to understand what was happening. As we finished one phase you move to the next phase. This is not uncommon and how we move through the project when leave when we were coming into the area, the first time we had reached out to say we're coming into the area was October 23rd and we asked for a meeting to talk about it. We've done it before, we've done it with all the other community boards, so we have a process of which we go through in the interim because we weren't able to get to the community board so we are thankful that we are here today just have this conversation. Our team on the ground team was in was moving in the communities in the areas where we were doing the work. So prior to the work actually coming into that area we were out Fabby was on the ground with the team to talk about and give out information about the project. This is common, our common practice that we've been from the beginning of the project; we've actually, repeat, when we were asked to go to a community board to speak like today we did. And we give all the information, the information that's been on the website it's been through when we have community meetings if I'm at a district community meeting I'm sharing it that information, so it's been a long time in the process of sharing that information. So there as we move through we will continue to notify the communities if there's questions we have websites that tell you exactly where we are at that particular point in time, weekly newsletters that come out we update the community as we move through the process.

Questioner: I'm listening to what you say, but I have to say this. I did say one. To me, no one was contacting anybody in such a high density area. I don't know who you were talking to and I don't know who you say has to know, but the people that live here the business people, the homeowners, they have to know because they have to bear this after the fact. You're coming here now -interrupted.

Renee: So my question to you is, and I do have a question for you ,is where are you? And the reason we're asking because we may not even be at that phase of the project. I'm just asking.

Antonia Ortiz: You are right there. People are a block away, I'm one foot away, I'm in 91 Borum Street, cross street Manhattan Avenue and Montrose avenues is behind me.

Fabio Perla: Yes so we did the outreach there on Montrose itself. just there just to clarify

Community Board Chair: Listen, we are here to get information and people keep getting up saying what they want to say, then nobody is listening and nobody can hear what's going on. We heard the question let's be gracious enough to hear the answer. If we don't like it, that's the answer.

Fabio Perla: If I may, the short version to answer your question specifically Antonia, is that right now at that phase I did the outreach on Montrose itself, between I believe that's Leonard and Manhattan there I still do need to reach out to the side streets there but the direct abutters of the project have been notified, and we're in advance.

Questioner: I have two very brief direct questions if I may. If National Grid has the technology to email its customers to lobby for the Williams Northeast Supply Enhancement pipeline, and you supposedly had this community outreach plan, why did not everybody in this room get an email announcing this pipeline

Renee McClure: That's a good question, not everybody in the neighborhood is actually a National Grid customer so we do have to notify the whole residential area and we don't have the address for all of the residential areas. That's why we go building by building and letting in the information know, go contact at NYCHA, go to the hospital, the schools in the community board to make sure that we pass the information to all the residents of the area because not everybody is a customer.

Questioner: And my second direct question, earlier this year Governor Cuomo threatened to revoke National Grid's license because of its behavior with the Northeast supply enhancement pipeline. National Grid agreed to avoid that license being revoked, to develop a long-term energy plan over three months and then have four hearings to present it to the public in Brooklyn Queens Nassau and Suffolk County. My question is when are those hearings being held?

Keith Rooney: I can answer that. So right now we have the month of March is slotted, we're gonna do 18 meetings altogether, 18 meetings across Brooklyn, Queens, Nassau County and Suffolk County. These are going to be public hearings where we will have elected officials, academics, people like yourself, community members to come in and express their concerns. We're going to take all the clean energy initiatives we're working on we're gonna look at every every possible way that we can because they're, to be honest with you, right now which trying to get through this winter with the short-term solution, which includes using trucks, not in New York city but on Long Island to get gas into the system. I'm just telling you the real world, that's where we're at right now. The second, the second part of that question to the long-term, we have to go back to the state in June of 2020 to our regulators as a team after we get all of that input it's going to be similar to a rate case everyone's going to be welcome. We will be posting in our website we will get will make sure that every community board knows where those meetings are so that you can attend, we're going to do it we're gonna do a lunch session and an evening session so people that work have an option to go to either session.

Questioner: When can we expect that schedule to be released for those hearings?

Keith Rooney: I've been told that the schedules got to be finalized by the end of January, and then and then sent out to the community probably by mid-february. The meetings will commence March 1st and be over the end of the end of March.

Questioner: Thank you

Questioner: Earlier in the meeting you bragged about being in the community for a hundred years, but when my name is Rebecca but when directly asked about your record in this community you declined to answer so I just wanted to give you another chance to answer questions about how we can trust you to keep this community safe and not polluted when you are one of the potentially responsible parties for the pollution that we're already facing

Renee McClure: So what Keith was asking and was providing you was the fact that we have a separate team that works for that whole Superfund, those are our subject matter experts and we have to make sure that the information that you're asking for we have to get that from them and we will get back to you on that. I have noted that. In regards to our community give back, we have been working with the community, we've actually volunteered in the community when Newtown Creek we gave \$50,000 to that organization Not Nick Nick. In regards to that and also we actually did a volunteer Earth Day in that community so we're in the communities trying to make a difference so if they programs that you feel that we should be involved with we're more than welcome to have a conversation about them we're doing we bring our trucks for touch-a-truck but to St. Nick's alliance every year, so we're in the community. We continue to look at ways in which we can build our relationships, it does take time but we're definitely here.

Questioner: I have a follow-up question. you just said you gave \$50,000 I want to know how much money you make off of ratepayers in this neighborhood.

Keith Rooney: I can't answer that question, that's a calculation

Questioner: Is that some another team as well, thought another team

Keith Rooney: that's a very high level question

Questioner: It's a high level question how much profit a public utility makes?

Keith Rooney: for this neighborhood, to segment this neighborhood is you know -(didn't finish)

Questioner: So here I'm looking for just yes/no answers or a number, real straightforward, we'll do it quick. 1. yes or no, will National Grid profit off this extension, yes or no.

Keith Rooney: yes

Questioner: okay - what's the guaranteed rate of return off the profits

Keith Rooney: I don't have the exact numbers for the rate of return, that's that's

Questioner: 3. just a just a number, how much will this cost ratepayers

Keith Rooney: the rate, the regulation and the ratepayers, everything is mandated by the Public Service Commission, so every dollar that we made...

Questioner: just the number what's this gonna cost?

Keith Rooney: I don't have the number off the top of my head, but up but it is mandated by the public service

Questioner: I believe it's 185 million is that right, Kim? 185 million. 4. True or false, methane is more powerful than co2 when leaked, true or false?

Peter Metzdorff: That would be true.

Questioner: True, alright, correct. Next, yes or no, has the company assessed the blast zone?

Keith: this I'm gonna say this again, this is not a pipeline this is not a blast zone

Questioner: so yes or no

Keith Rooney: yeah it's not a pipeline; yes or no, listen

Peter Metzdorff: this is not an interstate pipeline. An interstate pipeline is not the same entity as the utility pipe that is running through. it is not operating at the same pressure, it is not operating at the same percent of smize and your blast zone question does not apply because the pipe is designed differently to operate in an urban environment as opposed to operating as an interstate pipeline at a much higher pressure going through a very rural area. the rules of New York State are very clear as to what we can and cannot do and this pipe is operating at a much lower percent of smize it is not within the rupture range.

Questioner: I'm gonna let Kim...

Peter Metzdorff: it is operating at a lower percent of smize than it can rupture at. it cannot rupture, it will leak, it cannot rupture.

Questioner: I have a question for you about pigs

Community Board Chair: Hello! Let's make this brief. Otherwise I'm losing my board members, if I lose my board members I can't get votes and I can't do my board meeting and we have to come back and you'll be home.

Questioner: we're the community. I have a question for you about pigs. Where are you storing these pigs, and do you know how dangerous the pigs are that go through the pipeline? you

gave a whole presentation about pigging, about pigging in the pipeline so don't look at me like you don't know what I'm talking about.

Peter Metzdorff: The pigs are done by an independent contractor

Kim: Who's your independent contractor?

Pete: it goes by bid; it is competitively bid for each project and we do that based on the low bid process because we have to do that in order to contain costs for our customers.

Questioner: So you have no personal responsibility for these poisonous pigs being may be stored at your Greenpoint facility or whatever?

Peter Metzdorff: The pigs are brought in by the contractor and they leave with the contractor.

Kim: who was your last pigging contractor?

Peter Metzdorff: I cannot tell you that. I don't know

Community Board Chair: One question, I'm about to lose my quorum.

Audience member: yes, make it brief madam chair we can't respect one another in here we're not gonna get anywhere and I don't want to be here all night and I'm sure that boy doesn't need those folks go to work just like you do and then come in and help represent you you wonder for our assemblymen these people wouldn't be here to answer your questions. she asked you and every last one of you to ask one question you're entitled to your questions you're entitled to your opinion. I'm gonna say this again, your lack of respect is horrible. let's give each other ... it's Julia ..?.. thank you

Questioner: why should you be private, why should we guarantee you a monopoly and let you hold our energy hostage if you either cannot or will not build the renewable infrastructure we need why should we pay shareholders billions of dollars to do something we could just do ourselves.

Keith Rooney: the Renewable transition is real. I will tell you I just came back from a leadership meeting and like blockbuster we are transitioning otherwise we'll be out of business. we know that we are investing I went over the slides earlier the transition is real it takes time to get there I'm somebody who sat in the control room for 25 years and operated the system and if one of the gentlemen got up before and talked about I'm making my electric building and everybody clap guess what every building that you electrify guess what you just did you just raise your gas consumption nobody uses oil I used to operate 30 power plants and 2 million customers across the state guess what every power plant is on gas 24/7 they come off two days a year during maybe the coldest days of the year so when everybody clapped every the more electric you use and the more building you electrify you're gonna need more natural gas it's a fact we are on the transition it is going to take time to get there natural gas is part of the clean puzzle and part of

the bridge that gets us to where we want to be you can't you can't just shut the lights off tonight and say all right we're gonna do this and we you know it's gonna take time and we are committed to use that bridge to get there but three billion cubic feet of gas through this system for two million customers you can't just walk outside here and say okay let's shut the lights off

Community Board Chair: okay next

Questioner: hi my name is Chris I just have one quick question I understand that there was a bit of a mismatch between your commitment to community outreach and what this community actually expected. what reasons do we have to believe that there won't be a similar mismatch in your commitment to safety and your commitment to renewable energy than what this community would expect?

Keith Rooney: so I will tell you that safety is at the forefront of every single thing we do every meeting we have is revolved around safety, we start with a safety message we have tail board meetings safety is one of it is the number one issue at national grid and the men and women that work in the field we want to make sure they come home in the same condition they went to work. as far as the transition being real, two hundred million dollars invested in clean energy in the last six months, I mean that's a that's a commitment. And giving our employees five thousand dollars to buy electric cars, adding 165 electric stations, incentivizing people and four hundred people bought cars already in the first six months, that's make that's driving a change positive clean energy.

Questioner: I think you misunderstood my question, like we understand that from your perspective you're committing to safety but clearly you were also committing to community outreach and it wasn't enough for this community on this community that's affected by this

Community Board Chair: Next, I understand everybody's got a lot to say, but we don't have time

Questioner: I'll keep it brief. so correct me if I'm wrong, so far one hundred and eighty five million dollars were used to build phase one through three ,and one hundred and eighty five-ish is also expected to be used for phase four and five is that correct?

Keith Rooney: the numbers that sounds higher than what it is, I'd have to get back to you on the numbers, but I will tell you that it's been they didn't approve by the state government Public Service Commission in 2017 so every dollar we spent is mandated by the state so I don't just make it's not just made up okay

Questioner: so my question is why not use that let's say 200 million dollars let's lowball it why not use that two hundred million dollars to then build out sustainable renewable infrastructure and why not use that money to stop that bridge from becoming longer and longer and longer as you said this doesn't

Community Board Chair: Okay Kevin okay Kevin next

Keith Rooney: well if I just answer real quick. those that the transmission main that we're putting in we all looking at hydrogen blending and there might they'll in the future if we do this right there might be it we're still gonna need the infrastructure but instead of gas you know 20 years from now it might be hydropower we all we have engineers and scientists working with Brookhaven lab right now in Stony Brook on this

Questioner: is this mic working so so I am a National Grid customer and I'd like to know why you guys didn't tell me by email you have my email address

Keith Rooney: it's a good question I'll take it on my shoulders we've done a better job

Questioner: yes and and you know what that's honestly like you're saying you're telling us that you want to be good neighbors and you want to do the outreach you have and I understood what you said that you have to go door-to-door because not everyone is one of your customers but a lot of us here are your customers and I'm hearing about this now you've had my email address I could have been notified in two seconds years ago.

Keith Rooney: you have a valid point

Questioner: I know but what I want to know is can you actually believe that? like email has been a lot around for how long I mean seriously, how long has email been around and it doesn't dawn on you guys to use this in outreach it's not very...

Keith: it's a it's a good point I'm going to take it back I'm. so I apologize to you

Questioner: I'm a National Grid customer and I want to hear about these things before their de facto

Keith Rooney: agree and apologize

Questioner: hi my name is Derrick. you said you notified elected officials of the session here I just want to know which officials were notified and when were they notified

Keith Rooney: that's a good question, Eileen, on the elected official front in this community do you have a time frame of when the electeds were notified or who or what elected officials? can you speak up a little Eileen, Eileen's our director of public relations (I think that's what they said)

Chair: Salazaar, Renoso, Wen? Next!

Questioner: hi my name is Majana I grew up in Greenpoint Brooklyn I want to bring this to not forget the global scale of this and the connections. my question is have you have y'all read the IPCC report the International Panel on Climate Change can you raise your hand if you've read it.

Keith Rooney: I've read some of it

Questioner: okay so you are in the energy sector but you guys haven't read the IPCC can I can I be brutally honest if you if you have children can you raise your hand right now okay my question is do you understand we are in a climate crisis this second not tomorrow, do you understand?

Keith Rooney: yes we do

Questioner: so I've heard that like we need to transition and we need time to get there I'm really sorry we don't have time to get there are you clear that civilization might collapse that is what the best scientists in the world are saying right now do you understand that we have 10 years so my question is why are we laying new pipeline?

Keith Rooney: so we are working with can I answer the question so we are working with the state officials on all the green initiatives that you speak of we understand the climate change is real we get it, I'm gonna say I got it I gotta say it again I'm gonna repeat myself and I apologize we serve almost 2 million customers and we put almost 3 billion cubic feet of gas through the system.

Questioner: That is terrifying

Keith Rooney: I'm just being honest with you. We are doing everything we can do to be a clean like to transition to clean renewables where there we're it's not happening 10 years from now we're doing it today but it's going to take time and if we do this right we might be putting hydro power power in this transmission system

Community Board Chair: Next

Questioner: I appreciate your time so much. so I'm a rate payer National Grid answered to us that they do not look at the full lifecycle of methane leaking which is now with the CL CPA requires. are you concerned that once we implement that plan and also city law, this will become a stranded asset and who will pay for that, the shareholders or the people in this room and myself?

Keith Rooney: as a sixty percent we have a sixty percent methane reduction target. We have mandated again everything mandated by the Public Service mission to reduce leaks. We're out there doing it every single day.

Questioner: But you're not looking at what' leaking in PA? I mean, that is now required by law.

Keith Rooney: with all due respect I am NOT a pipeline company I don't work for Williams and I don't work in Pennsylvania I understand your passion I am NOT a pipe I do not operate in Pennsylvania I operate in Brooklyn Queens Staten Island and Long Island.

Questioner: I understand you don't know how much methane is leaking, but if you do have to take that into account and you're no longer allowed to run your pipelines because what research is finding is there's a lot of leakage in methane and this becomes a stranded asset

Keith Rooney: I'm not a pipeline company not a pipeline company I'm not a pipeline company because I'm a distribution company

Questioner: so when this transmission line becomes a stranded asset will we pay for it or will your shareholders

Keith Rooney: it will not be a stranded asset. Like I said before we are looking at hydrogen blends and blending into the gas system

Questioner: But it hasn't been approved yet

Keith Rooney: so if we do even if we even if we were completely green ten years from now if we do this right

Questioner: Which is what climate science says

Keith Rooney: yes and I'm with you, but guess what the transmission the system that we're putting in is still going to have to take that clean energy hydro power to power one point eight million custom is reliably and safely.