

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 NEW YORK STATE

3 DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SERVICE

4 19-E-0378 PROCEEDING ON MOTION OF THE COMMISSION
5 AS TO THE RATES, CHARGES, RULES AND
6 REGULATIONS OF NEW YORK STATE ELECTRIC
& GAS CORPORATION FOR ELECTRIC SERVICE

7 19-G-0379 PROCEEDING ON MOTION OF THE COMMISSION
8 AS TO THE RATES, CHARGES, RULES AND
9 REGULATIONS OF NEW YORK STATE ELECTRIC
& GAS CORPORATION FOR GAS SERVICE

10 19-E-0380 PROCEEDING ON MOTION OF THE COMMISSION
11 AS TO THE RATES, CHARGES, RULES AND
12 REGULATIONS OF NEW YORK STATE ELECTRIC
& GAS CORPORATION FOR ELECTRIC SERVICE

13 19-G-0381 PROCEEDING ON MOTION OF THE COMMISSION
14 AS TO THE RATES, CHARGES, RULES AND
15 REGULATIONS OF NEW YORK STATE ELECTRIC
& GAS CORPORATION FOR GAS SERVICE

16 PUBLIC STATEMENT HEARING

17 DATE: August 27, 2020
18 TIME: 6:00 p.m.

19
20 A.L.J. JAMES COSTELLO
21 A.L.J. MICHAEL CLARKE
22 COMMISSIONER HOWARD
23 COMMISSIONER BURMAN
24
25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 (On the record 6:00 p.m.)

3 A.L.J. COSTELLO: I call Cases 19-E-
4 0378 Proceeding on Motion of the Commission as to the
5 Rates, Charges, Rules and Regulations of New York
6 State Electric and Gas Corporation for Electric
7 Service, 19-G-0379 Proceeding on Motion of the
8 Commission as to the Rates, Charges, Rules and
9 Regulations of New York State Electric and Gas
10 Corporation for Gas Service, 19-E-0380 Proceeding on
11 Motion of the Commission as to the Rates, Charges,
12 Rules and Regulations of Rochester Gas and Electric
13 Corporation for Electric Service, and 19-G-0381
14 Proceeding on Motion of the Commission as to the
15 Rates, Charges, Rules and Regulations of Rochester
16 Gas and Electric Corporation for Gas Service.

17 Good evening and welcome. We are here
18 today for a public statement hearing that was noticed
19 on July 28th, 2020. This public statement hearing
20 concerns a joint proposal filed on June 22nd, 2020,
21 which among other things, proposes the closure of 6
22 customer service walk-in offices by the companies.
23 This public statement hearing is intended for
24 comments on the proposed closure of those 6 customer
25 service walk-in offices.

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 My name is James Costello. I am an
3 administrative law judge for the Department of Public
4 Service. With me is Administrative Law Judge Michael
5 Clarke, also from the Department of Public Service,
6 and together we are responsible for presiding over
7 the hearings in these cases and the development of a
8 complete record in these proceedings. The joint
9 proposal is currently before the Public Service
10 Commission for its consideration. The joint proposal
11 does not go into effect on its own but rather is the
12 proposal of the signatory parties as to how the
13 commission should resolve these cases. The
14 commission may decide to adopt a joint proposal,
15 reject it or modify it.

16 The Public Service Commission is
17 comprised of a chairperson, John B. Rhodes and four
18 commissioners. Diane Burman, James Alesi, Tracy
19 Edwards and John Howard. We are fortunate tonight to
20 have 2 of the commissioners with us on the line.
21 Commissioners Diane Burman and John Howard who are
22 here to listen to your comments. I'm going to turn
23 first to Commissioner Howard and ask whether you
24 would like to address the participants.

25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 COMMISSIONER HOWARD: Thank you,
3 Judge. Just briefly. Want to thank everyone who
4 planned to participate this evening and assure them
5 that their views and comments will be taken very
6 seriously by the commission as we deliberate this
7 case.

8 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Thank you
9 Commissioner Howard. Commissioner Burman, would you
10 like to address the participants?

11 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Yes, thank you
12 so much. I really appreciate being here virtually
13 with you, and I also echo the comments on
14 Commissioner Howard. We're here to listen and to
15 bring back to the other commissioners. Thank you.

16 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Thank you,
17 Commissioner Burman.

18 Now I will explain the process that
19 we're going to follow this evening. The purpose of
20 our hearing is to provide you with an opportunity to
21 tell the commission your thoughts on the proposed
22 office closures. The statements that you can make
23 will become part of the case record. We have a court
24 reporter on the line who will prepare a transcript of
25 the hearing which will be included in the official

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 record of these proceedings so that your comments can
3 be considered by all the members of the commission.

4 The transcript, when prepared, will be
5 available for view on the department's website. This
6 hearing is not an evidentiary hearing or a question
7 and answer session but a forum to hear comments from
8 you. And this is not the only opportunity for you to
9 submit comments. If you did not preregister to speak
10 at today's hearing, but you would like your views
11 included in the record, there are a variety of other
12 ways to comment that were listed in the public notice
13 for today's event and that are also showing on your
14 screen at the moment.

15 You can submit comments by submitting
16 them through the department's website, by e-mail,
17 regular mail or by telephone. Regardless of how you
18 submit comments, those comments will be given equal
19 consideration. Comments may be submitted and will be
20 considered throughout the pendency of these
21 proceedings. We ask if you have registered to make a
22 statement and have any lengthy written statements,
23 that you provide your comments and submit the full
24 written statement by mail or e-mail.

25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 Because of the COVID-19 pandemic we
3 are holding this public statement hearing virtually
4 and we have asked people to preregister if they wish
5 to make a public statement. The preregistration
6 process allows us to identify people who indicated
7 that they want to make comment. During the hearing,
8 if you have any technical difficulties, you can call
9 this -- this number and I will repeat it. It's 1-
10 800-342-3330. That's 1-800-342-3330. You can call
11 that number and leave your name and a phone number
12 where you can be reached and someone will get back to
13 you.

14 Before we go to comments from the
15 public, we are going to have a representative from
16 NYSEG and RG&E as Sarah Hanley -- Hanley provide some
17 information on the proposed office closures. This is
18 just for informational purposes and is not going to
19 be open for any question and answer session. After
20 we hear from Ms. Hanley, we will then take your
21 comments. Ms. Hanley, you may proceed.

22 MS. HANLEY: Thank you. On behalf of
23 NYSEG and RG&E my name is Sarah Hanley and I will be
24 presenting a brief informational statement related to
25 the joint proposals provisions regarding the closure

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 of specific walk-in customer offices. NYSEG and RG&E
3 have always been proud to deliver safe and reliable
4 service to our customers' homes and businesses in the
5 territories we serve. The joint proposal submitted
6 in this rate case and supported by a diverse group of
7 parties continues the company's long standing
8 commitment to put customers first.

9 Approval of the joint proposal will
10 provide immediate relief of COVID-19 financial
11 impacts to residential and commercial customers while
12 also limiting the rate impact to ensure that NYSEG
13 and RG&E customers will continue to have among the
14 lowest electric and gas rates in the state. The
15 proposed plan will enable much needed investment in
16 our infrastructure and harness the power of
17 technology to make our electric system more
18 resilient, providing for a better customer
19 experience.

20 It also reaffirms our commitment to
21 build more economic, social and environmentally
22 sustainable communities throughout the areas we
23 serve. Closure of a limited number of walk-in
24 offices is part of the joint proposal. The specific
25 walk-in office closure proposal is based upon very

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 careful and thoughtful consideration and analysis of
3 how customers use the companies' walk-in offices.

4 We have identified and demonstrated
5 the availability of other already existing channels
6 currently used by customers to make payments and
7 carry on other interactions with the companies.
8 These analysis have shown that a significantly larger
9 percentage of our customers perform transactions with
10 the companies through these other channels. The
11 other channels include the NYSEG and RG&E mobile
12 apps, our website, our interactive voice recognition
13 system and through personal contact with a
14 representative by calling our contact centers.

15 Notably, as part of this proposal,
16 NYSEG and RG&E will also eliminate per transaction
17 fees for customers who choose to pay their bill at an
18 authorized payment location. This service will
19 provide customers with free access to approximately
20 370 payment locations throughout the companies'
21 service area.

22 NYSEG and RG&E will close 6 of their
23 18 customer walk-in offices beginning June 1st of
24 2021. These closures by year are in 2021 RG&E office
25 located at 256 Waring Road in Rochester, RG&E office

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 located at 32 Main Street, Fillmore, RG&E office

3 located at 79 Clark Street, Canandaigua, NYSEG office

4 located at 150 Erie Street, Lancaster, NYSEG office

5 located at 7760 Industrial Park Road in Hornell. And

6 in 2022 NYSEG office located at 26 Wierk Avenue in

7 Liberty.

8 In addition to these closures, hours
9 of the following walk-in offices would be modified to
10 2 days per week from 9 a.m. to 4 p.m. Those offices
11 are NYSEG office located at 73 Wright Circle in
12 Auburn, NYSEG office located at 65 Country Club Road
13 in Oneonta, NYSEG office located at 1387 Dryden Road
14 in Ithaca, and RG&E office located at 14 State
15 Street, Sodus.

16 No jobs will be lost as a result of
17 this proposal. All current employees assigned to a
18 walk-in office that will be closed will continue with
19 a job assignment that is located in the same company
20 division or region. In those service areas where the
21 company has closed a walk-in office, a customer will
22 be able to request a meeting with a customer service
23 employee. A customer service employee will then
24 schedule meetings with customers on an as needed or
25 as requested basis.

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 The companies will also coordinate
3 with the following counties to provide scheduled
4 dates and times to have a New York State Department -
5 - sorry, to have a New York -- a NYSEG or RG&E
6 customer advocate on site at the New York State
7 Department of Social Services office for a minimum of
8 2 times per month per location subject to the
9 approval and schedule of the particular D.S.S.
10 location. Those counties are Monroe, Chenango, Erie,
11 Ontario, Steuben and Sullivan.

12 These offices have been selected to
13 correspond with the walk-in office locations that
14 will close. The companies will also coordinate with
15 the New York State Office of Temporary and Disability
16 Assistance and D.S.S. to expand the periodic location
17 of customer advocates in additional counties subject
18 to the approval and schedules of the particular New
19 York State Department of Human Services location.

20 To ensure customers are aware of the
21 transition, the companies will engage in customer
22 outreach beginning about 2 months prior to the
23 closure of each walk-in office. This outreach will
24 include options for completing transactions, making
25 payments as well as meeting with a company

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 representative in person. We will use multiple
3 channels including third party payment locations,
4 customer contact centers, company websites and bill
5 inserts. Thank you.

6 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Thank you, Ms.
7 Hanley. Okay. We're now going to go to the
8 statements by people that have registered. We have 5
9 registered speakers. Some people are participating
10 electronically and we can identify those people and
11 we're going to start with them first.

12 When we call your name, we will unmute
13 your line. You will be able to give your statement.
14 Please be reminded that if you have put your own line
15 on mute you will have to unmute your line before you
16 begin to speak. And we remind you to please speak
17 slowly and clearly so that the court reporter can
18 accurately capture your statement for the record. So
19 our first speaker will be Carol Chock.

20 MS. CHOCK: Oh, okay. Can you hear
21 me?

22 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Yes, we can hear
23 you.

24
25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 MS. CHOCK: Great. Thank you.

3 Because I added myself this afternoon I didn't know
4 how long your -- how long is your list tonight?

5 A.L.J. COSTELLO: We have -- we have 5
6 people.

7 MS. CHOCK: Okay. Well, then I will
8 say a few words. I wasn't going to but you know how
9 I am. Carol Chock. I'm a party to this proceeding.
10 I'm a former legislator from Tompkins County and I am
11 president of the Rate Payers and Community
12 Intervenors group. I just want to say a word about
13 the storm that's going on right now outside my house.

14 There's -- there's a line of trees
15 along my property line right behind where I'm sitting
16 at the moment. The power lines to a group of houses
17 in my area runs right along those trees. When we
18 moved in 30 years ago, NYSEG showed up every year or
19 two to trim the trees. Our trees had sort of a
20 little circle around those lines and they're kind of
21 funny shaped. Now they look like trees. I can't
22 remember the last time they showed up even after I've
23 called.

24 It's scary for us. My husband and I
25 were sitting on the other side of this room right

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 here about 10 years ago and during -- during a storm
3 a -- a tree on the other side of our property, an
4 older tree came down on our house. It was very
5 scary. It missed where we were sitting. My husband
6 knew what was going on. He -- we heard this loud
7 noise and he grabbed me and ran out the other side of
8 the house.

9 He was right. That put the fear into
10 us. And so we called an arborist. We had that
11 arborist walk around our property and we sprang for
12 the big bucks to take down some other trees that were
13 aging. But the arborist wouldn't touch the trees
14 along the power lines. They said that that's --
15 they're not supposed to do that. That should be up
16 to our utility. That's one of the times I called and
17 I'm still sitting here in fear.

18 I'll also note that we've got a summer
19 storm going on right now and we have alert residents
20 in our area who circulate on our list serves and it -
21 - I will note that there are currently 21,000 people
22 in the NYSEG service area. I don't have RG&E up
23 here. The last this was updated which was before I
24 logged in here, 21,000 people out of power.

25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 There are 9,550 people, customers who
3 are without power in Broome County. That's over 10
4 percent of the customers. Over 2,000 people in
5 Dutchess County, over 2,000 in Erie County. Over 500
6 here in Tompkins County and this is not a bad storm.
7 But that storm is supposed to come this weekend.
8 It's supposed to come -- we're supposed to get the --
9 the remnants of -- of the hurricane that's currently
10 in the Gulf and traveling across Louisiana.

11 And the track might bring it this way,
12 might skirt us a little further south. But if we're
13 already behind to this extent, I can't imagine how
14 we're going to be later in the week. And the point
15 isn't that any one particular storm won't necessarily
16 take out power maybe even for a lot of us. It's how
17 far behind we are. So thank you for the additional
18 time here to address you.

19 Again, I appreciate greatly that the
20 commissioners, that the judges and that the other
21 attendees have come out to listen to the customers.
22 And I do hope that you will take all of the concerns
23 very seriously. This isn't the time to raise rates.
24 It's not the time to raise rates when your utility
25 has not delivered, and it's not the time to raise

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 rates during a pandemic. Thank -- thank you very
3 much.

4 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Thank you. Our next
5 speaker will be Richard Berkley.

6 MR. BERKLEY: Thank you, your Honor.
7 And thank you Commissioners Howard and Burman and to
8 the Department of Public Service staff present today
9 at this public statement hearing. And to everyone
10 who was -- has tuned in despite the lack of power and
11 presumably the lack of telephone and Internet that
12 requires power in those parts of the companies'
13 service territory.

14 My name is Richard Berkley. My
15 pronouns are he, him. I'm executive director of the
16 Public Utility Law Project of New York also known as
17 PULP. PULP made a statement earlier today in the
18 afternoon at -- in the afternoon office closure
19 public statement hearing. And we also spoke twice
20 yesterday generally speaking to the reasonableness
21 and whether or not the joint proposal was in the
22 public interest.

23 Today is focused on office closures
24 and so I'll -- I'll use a brief amount of time to
25 discuss the harm that would be -- that would be

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 caused by once again letting this company close
3 customer offices. And, forgive me, I will say
4 companies from here onward to refer to NYSEG and
5 RG&E.

6 PULP is a 40 year old not-for-profit
7 public interest law firm. And we have a -- a mission
8 to act on behalf of low income, fixed income and
9 generally vulnerable households in the State of New
10 York. And therefore we've been an active party in
11 this case since summer of 2019. We have filed
12 testimony in this case, we've participated in the
13 settlement discussions and we have taken part in the
14 evidentiary hearing on the joint proposal.

15 So I start by noting that while the
16 company spokesperson tonight described the joint
17 proposal as being signed and approved by a broad
18 array of parties, in actuality, the companies, the
19 Department of Public Service, some large corporations
20 in the service territory of the utility, no consumer
21 groups have approved of this joint proposal and
22 signed on to it. So I just wanted to take a moment
23 to underline that point.

24 In addition to our work at a statewide
25 level assisting low income and fixed income and

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 vulnerable consumers, we also provide direct
3 services. We provide direct services in the service
4 territories of the companies that we're speaking
5 about tonight. When we provide direct services, we
6 listen which is why we know some of the pressures and
7 problems faced by customers in the companies' service
8 territory and why we oppose the closure of any of the
9 offices.

10 Honestly, if it were possible, we
11 would have sought to get the companies' in this rate
12 case to reopen the offices that they had been allowed
13 to close the last time. If there was ever a time to
14 spend more time and resources assisting customer,
15 isn't this that time? We provided statements
16 yesterday that addressed the key elements of
17 assessing whether a joint proposal should be seen as
18 being in the public interest and receive a favorable
19 order from the commission, all other things being
20 equal.

21 Would it result in just and reasonable
22 rates? Was it in the public interest? Could it have
23 resulted by compromise through normally adversarial
24 parties resulting in an outcome that might have
25 reasonably arisen from litigation? Our answer

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 yesterday and today is no plain and simple. This is
3 not the first time that the companies have attempted
4 to deprive their customers of customer service
5 offices. They have a history of doing that. In
6 their last rate case, only 3 years after the end of
7 the great recession and long before the state's
8 economy and our individual personal economies had
9 recovered, the company closed -- was allowed to close
10 3 rates cases after proposing to close 7. Roughly 40
11 percent of the companies' customer service offices at
12 the time.

13 In the current case, the companies
14 once again displayed their lack of attention to the
15 financial circumstances of their customers and
16 service territory and initially asked to close 14
17 offices. Although the consumer advocates in the case
18 push back in their testimony and the companies
19 subsequently decreased that ask to 6, PULP believes
20 that 6 office closures is 6 too many.

21 Instead of closing offices during this
22 public health emergency and economic crisis and
23 additionally suggesting that if that closure is only
24 delayed until next summer that everything would be
25 okay, PULP suggests the company should examine their

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 service territory and the personal financial
3 circumstances of their customers and make a choice
4 this time that supports rather than burdens the
5 community.

6 Walk-in offices are important to
7 seniors. They are important to people without access
8 to telephones and Internet which I point out here,
9 the companies' representative this evening noted is
10 the direction that they wish to push their customers
11 toward. Again, during a blackout or a major or minor
12 outage in the companies' service territory due to the
13 fact that across much of the state many people have
14 shifted from traditional landline telephones to
15 telephone service provided by cable companies or
16 telephone service provided by the Internet or
17 telephone service provided by cellular telephones.

18 All of those things require external
19 power to function as the state found out only a few
20 weeks ago with the impact of Tropical Storm Isaias
21 upon much of New York State. Although it didn't hit
22 most of the companies' upstate territory, it hit
23 their downstate territory and people were out for a
24 significant amount of time. And the company, one
25 believes, will be fined once again for failure to

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 restore rapidly. Although that investigation has
3 some time yet to run.

4 For people who might need a little
5 extra time to explain their situation, for people who
6 are unemployed, under employed and the others in
7 these times need help and not abandonment, walk-in
8 offices are important despite what the company says.
9 The people in the communities we focused upon earlier
10 today have been most affected by COVID-19 and will
11 need all of the help available to keep their lights
12 and gas on.

13 But that is by no means to say that
14 other communities facing the loss of their office do
15 not need assistance in their customer service offices
16 but rather that there was only so much time to speak
17 tonight. And as a nonresident of the companies'
18 service territory, I believe it's important for the
19 consumers that live in the service territory to
20 speak. While we may speak to some other issues that
21 we've heard when they called us and asked for
22 assistance, we have not heard all of them by any
23 means.

24 The process of deprivation of the
25 customer service offices in the companies' service

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 territory is almost over. If their requests in the
3 last rate case and this one had been approved, all of
4 the customer services most likely would be gone. The
5 company may have reasons that it believes are
6 important for closing those offices. But this is
7 where the consumers, the companies' customers come in
8 and have to make their voices heard either tonight or
9 by filing written public comments with the secretary
10 of the commission. Or by calling the telephone
11 number on the display tonight.

12 For those people listening who are not
13 listening -- I'm sorry, who are not looking through
14 WebEx, 800-335-2120. The amount of money that the
15 companies will save by closing these offices is
16 minimal as we said earlier today. Certainly minimal
17 in compared to the additional money that they're
18 asking for -- for the term of this rate plan from
19 their customers.

20 The -- the RG&E office on Waring Road
21 serves a community with a median household income of
22 35,000 dollars. That's only 1,500 dollar on average
23 above destitution, abject poverty. And they point
24 out that the numbers that PULP referred to earlier
25 today, and I'm referring to tonight, are from the

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 last American community survey which comes 5 year
3 after the 10 year census. So the numbers are
4 relatively old even though they were just released to
5 the public in the past year.

6 They are not the numbers that we would
7 see if we went in and took a census right now which,
8 in all honesty, earlier in the rate case PULP filed a
9 motion with the administrative law judge to require
10 the company to update the numbers based upon the
11 effects of the pandemic upon its service territory.
12 That request was denied.

13 The companies admit in their own rate
14 case testimony that this office is used by the
15 community but they still want to close the Waring
16 Road office. And that would leave a population, as I
17 said, that was exceptionally hard hit during the
18 worst parts of the pandemic without a lifeline. The
19 office in Liberty, New York is in a similar
20 situation. Median household income is low there too
21 although there are, of course, as in all parts of the
22 state, many people who are able to afford to pay all
23 of their bills on a monthly basis without needing to
24 time when the bill arrives at the service provider so
25 that there will be money in their account.

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 That doesn't mean that everyone is
3 well off just because it's downstate. The closure of
4 the Liberty office would also be felt dramatically by
5 consumers especially because, as you heard yesterday
6 from Senator Jen Metzger who represents that portion
7 of the companies' service territory, that the Liberty
8 area in particular has extremely low reliability,
9 often suffers from outages which are counted by the
10 residents of that area. And they suffer from slow
11 restoration times.

12 So I ask you, can a check cashing
13 store or a supermarket or a website assist someone
14 whose residents or small businesses being billed for
15 power they could not use due to outages? No. And
16 particularly if they're out of power and they have no
17 telephone or Internet. Again, as was plain across
18 the state at our last big outage, which was only 2
19 weeks ago. And our next big outage may be as soon as
20 this weekend.

21 PULP urges the Public Service
22 Commission to reject any office closures proposed by
23 the companies in this joint proposal. No matter the
24 companies' optimism, the economy will not recover by
25 the summer of 2021. This is not our number. This is

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 the state's division of the budget. The joint
3 proposal in the -- of this proceeding, which are all
4 before the judge and the commissioners tonight and
5 will be before the commission when it votes upon this
6 joint proposal, contain no reasonable evidence that
7 employment will return to 2019 levels even by next
8 summer.

9 And no evidence of the signatory
10 parties even considered such questions through
11 examining data or government reports or providing
12 studies as opposed to simple unsupported conjecture.
13 PULP therefore repeats its position tonight as we did
14 earlier today and twice yesterday that the joint
15 proposal in this case is not in the public interest
16 and should be rejected or amended by the commission
17 such that it does address the public interest.

18 And but because of tonight's topic,
19 particularly the areas that the companies' plans
20 would deprive of customer service offices during an
21 historic downturn of New York's economy. Thank you
22 for this opportunity to speak.

23 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Our next speaker
24 will be Valdi Weiderpass. And I just remind you, if
25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 -- if you are on the -- on the line and have muted
3 yourself, you have to unmute yourself.

4 MR. WEIDERPASS: Can you hear me?

5 A.L.J. COSTELLO: We can hear you now.

6 MR. WEIDERPASS: Okay. All right. My
7 name is Valdi Weiderpass. I live in Endicott, New
8 York. I am a long time customer of NYSEG since 1985,
9 and thank you for the opportunity to speak to the
10 Public Service Commission as well as to the members
11 of the staff who are -- have been working on this
12 proposal and others that have provided comments and -
13 - and participated in negotiations.

14 I like the gas proposal as it has been
15 negotiated and want to keep it as it is. In other
16 words, keep it the same. However, I am opposed to
17 giving NYSEG their requested 25 percent increase of
18 delivery rates. A 25 percent increase during a
19 recession is not reasonable even if it is phased in
20 over 3 years. In 2009 P.S.C. decision stated that
21 utility frugality is expected and is reasonable
22 during a recession.

23 Lavish bonuses to top executives in
24 the million dollar range are not examples of
25 frugality. Investors have been getting a return on

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 equity through dividends of about 8.8 percent with
3 dividend payments of about 100 million dollars per
4 year over the past 10 years, and this can be reduced
5 now while we are in a severe recession. What NYSEG
6 has done is reduce lower level staff and it has not
7 lived up to promises it made to make improvements and
8 maintenance and tree trimming in 3 rates cases since
9 2009.

10 NYSEG has failed to spend money
11 previously allocated for tree trimming, and where
12 they have trimmed, have only trimmed to a 6 foot wide
13 by 8 foot height above lines envelope instead of the
14 recommended 10 feet wide by 15 feet above lines.
15 NYSEG is New York's only utility that is not on a 5
16 year tree trimming cycle. Forty-four percent of its
17 system lines have not been trimmed in 5 years.
18 Thousands of customers have suffered losses from
19 power outages from storms which are getting more
20 severe due to climate change.

21 The public who they deliver
22 electricity to deserve better. NYSEG is also asking
23 for 489 million dollars for smart meters for
24 electricity and natural gas without the pilot program
25 having proved any substantial benefits to the

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 customers. The smart meters should wait until after
3 another pilot project is done to prove that it would
4 provide benefits to customers and to the grid.

5 NYSEG should pay for the cost to catch
6 up on substation maintenance as well as other
7 maintenance, and on trimming of trees and vegetation.
8 And we need a watch dog to do better oversight with
9 targets and fines. We need a grid that is reliable
10 and ready to accommodate more renewable energy with
11 more energy storage to help us save a habitable
12 climate. And, again, thank you for allowing me to
13 speak. I'm speaking on behalf of hundreds of
14 thousands of customers that expect NYSEG to do a
15 better job and to foot the bill this time.

16 And it's time for the investors to
17 take a little bit of a hit here too as -- as well as
18 everybody else that's having to take a -- an economic
19 hit here. So please consider denying NYSEG's 25
20 percent rate increase. Thank you.

21 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Thank you. We have
22 2 additional people who have registered to speak. It
23 -- we don't know. It may be that they are on the
24 telephone so what we're going to do is call their
25 names. When we do we ask that they hit Star 3 which

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 will allow us to recognize you and unmute your line.

3 You will hear a message that your line has been
4 unmuted and then you'll be able to -- you would state
5 your name for the record and provide your statement.

6 The first person is Ann Mallozzi
7 [phonetic spelling]. And if you are on the line
8 please hit Star 3. Okay. We may come back to Ms.
9 Mallozzi. The other person we have is Henry
10 Grannison [phonetic spelling]. If you are on the
11 line please hit Star 3. We have a number of other
12 call-in users that have not registered but if you at
13 this time wish to give a statement, please hit Star 3
14 and we will call -- we will unmute your lines in
15 order and allow you to make statements.

16 Okay. We have no further speakers.
17 So what we're going to do is go off the record for
18 approximately -- it's close to 6:40 so around 6:55 we
19 will be back on the record to see if anybody else has
20 come forward that would like to make a statement. So
21 we're going to go off the record. And again we'll be
22 back at 6 --.

23 (Off the record 6:38 p.m.)

24 (On the record 6:55 p.m.)

25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 A.L.J. COSTELLO: We have a call in, a
3 phone call in person who has indicated that they
4 would like to give a comment. We will unmute your
5 line and you will hear a -- a message that you've
6 been unmuted at which time you should state your name
7 and give your statement. If you have yourself muted,
8 you would have to unmute your own line as well.
9 Hello?

10 MS. COLL: Hello.

11 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Are you going to
12 give a comment this evening?

13 MS. COLL: Yeah.

14 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Okay. Please state
15 your name for the record and then give your
16 statement.

17 MS. COLL: All right. My name is
18 Patricia Coll. It's C-O-L-L. I live at 11 Haddock
19 Road in Monticello, New York. I am not -- the office
20 in Liberty. I am very upset over NYSEG saying they
21 need such an increase, number 1, 25 percent is absurd
22 to begin with. Number 2, in pandemic it's
23 ridiculous. And, number 3, they don't give the
24 service that they claim to give.

25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 I remember being a child. I lived on
3 Cold Spring Road which is right next to my property.
4 My road is off of it. We never, very, very rarely
5 ever had a power outage. Since 2000 we -- I have had
6 and I am now -- I was married and I live on 11
7 Haddock Road. I have had numerous power outages that
8 amount from hours to 5 to 9 days, 10 days which is
9 not acceptable. And, of course I know their answer
10 is well there's not a lot of people that live on your
11 road.

12 True but I still am a paying customer.
13 And the people on my road are increasing. New
14 buildings are being put up. We have a lot of summer
15 people. It's ridiculous. So they claim that they
16 maintain a line and check everything and they're
17 cutting trees and stuff. What a joke. I -- either
18 last year or the year before we had a power outage
19 and they ended up changing a pole a little bit down
20 the road. And several days later when we had another
21 power outage, they had to change the same pole. What
22 gives?

23 They have not been around. They have
24 not cut anything down as far as trees or anything
25 since I've lived here. Even when I lived at my

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 parents' house on Cold Spring Road you never saw
3 them. You would see them only at a power outage
4 time. Now suddenly in the very frigid weather they
5 sent a crew out and start cutting trees across the
6 street from me. Yet you've had all spring, all
7 summer, early fall. You could have done it but wait
8 until it's so cold.

9 I felt so sorry for the men. I went
10 out and spoke with one of the guys and they said
11 don't worry we're going to be cutting everything
12 down. You won't even recognize this place. Well,
13 when they left they had only been here like maybe 3
14 days or so, and not 3 days in a row. They worked
15 sporadic. One day one week, one day another week.

16 They never came back. So I called the
17 superintendent of the highway of the town. The
18 question of what's going on with these trees because
19 when I look across the -- my road the trees are going
20 to hurt the electric lines. They're also going to
21 come across the street and hit my house and my car
22 which I will sue everybody about. So I was told by
23 the Town of Thompson that while they can't cut trees
24 within so many feet of the electric lines.

25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 So I then proceeded to call NYSEG.

3 NYSEG I was told would call me back in 10 to 14 days.

4 That was on 8/4. They still have not called me back.

5 I also in the process called the Assemblywoman Aileen

6 Gunther about another issue and spoke to her about

7 this issue of the trees. So we agreed we'd wait to

8 see if NYSEG would call me back and what they were

9 going to do. Well, of course, after the 2 weeks they

10 didn't bother to call or do anything.

11 So Gunther's office called me. I told

12 them they said they'd get back to me. They called me

13 back a week later and said they will be back and

14 they're going to cut trees. But they can only cut

15 around their lines. I said fine but there's 30 to 35

16 trees that are of concern. So needless to say, I

17 never got a phone call from NYSEG. Still have not

18 gotten a phone call from NYSEG.

19 But they showed up on Friday -- I'm

20 trying to think what day it was -- on I -- I want to

21 think it was the 21st and they cut some trees but a

22 lot of, again, the -- before -- like before they were

23 cutting the upper branches, the upper limbs and not

24 worrying about the trees that were dead that were

25 definitely going to fall and cause problems.

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 So the -- I went out and spoke to the
3 guys. It was 8/21 when 2 trucks showed up. I went
4 and spoke to them and we talked about the trees. And
5 they, again, said well, we only do what's within our
6 tree limit. And, you know, whatever. I said well
7 I'm telling you right now, somebody has to do
8 something because these trees are old, they're tall,
9 they're going to take the lines down.

10 So he says well, we're -- you're on
11 the list, we'll be back. So they worked that Friday
12 again. Just did a lot of branching, not a lot about
13 trees. Maybe one tree. And at the end of the day
14 spoke with a guy who said we'll be back either Monday
15 or Friday. Really? Why are we doing this on a day
16 basis and finishing a job right away?

17 So okay, Monday comes. Nobody shows.
18 Tuesday a truck shows up with 2 members. They cut
19 branches, maybe 1 small tree and that's it. That's
20 all they've done. I'm talking 30 to 35 trees that
21 are a problem. You can't even see the electric lines
22 from -- from my house which is across the street from
23 where it goes which between the 2 properties is the
24 major problem. Whenever there's a problem that's
25 where it happens.

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 They're not even addressing it. So
3 God knows what will happen tomorrow whether somebody
4 shows up. It's like they don't care. The whole
5 problem is they should have been doing this all these
6 years from 1977 when I moved in this house until like
7 2000, 2001. Never had problems with power outages or
8 nothing. But now we do because they've allowed the
9 trees to overgrow. They don't take care of them.
10 They don't check the wires. They don't check the
11 poles. And yet we're the people that have to suffer.

12 So and then you go out and you try to
13 talk to one of them, well, it is what it is. So you
14 know what? The next time it happens maybe what we
15 all should do is say okay you're not going to give us
16 the time, you're not going to do this in a timely
17 manner, we're going to a hotel and NYSEG needs to pay
18 the hotel and our meals that we have to pay. This is
19 ridiculous. They don't take care of what they need
20 to be taking care of. And it's absurd.

21 If I didn't do my job I'd be fired. I
22 don't know why this company is allowed to keep doing
23 what they do and then demand an increase. Really?
24 So now they were here on Tuesday and nobody's been
25 back since. And maybe they cut a tree and a half.

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 So you tell me what's going to happen this winter or
3 with this possible storm this weekend. They don't
4 care. It -- they just don't care anymore.

5 The other problem is with closing an
6 office in Liberty -- it was bad enough they closed
7 Monticello and I forgot that they had Liberty. You
8 call the number for service and talk and you tell
9 your problem and then you don't get a phone call
10 back. If I had realized about the office in Liberty,
11 I would have been up there raising cane about what's
12 going on with these trees. But I wasn't realized
13 about it.

14 I mean, I had to call Aileen Gunther,
15 our assemblywoman about these trees and finally they
16 came after she contacted them. Really? Now it is
17 their job and if they don't want to do it it's a
18 problem. It seems like in -- not -- I mean people
19 are saying NYSEG's pulled out to some firm in Canada.
20 That's their problem. We're still here. We need to
21 be taken care of. And if NYSEG can't do it alone
22 because the one guy said to me well NYSEG sometimes
23 contracts out with other people. Maybe they'll
24 contract out with the county. If that's what it
25 takes then do it. But why should we be without

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 electricity in winter months, frigid weather and
3 nobody seems to care?

4 Yet they're in their trucks, they're
5 warm, they're safe, we're not. I -- I'm just fed up
6 with this thing. I can't believe that anybody would
7 think that they should get an increase when they have
8 so many things that they don't do. And also in
9 regards to their office, you know, their bookkeeping
10 is horrible. They have in the past I used to be on
11 the budget plan and all of a sudden they charged me a
12 1,000 dollars. And I was like where did this come
13 from when my monthly bill was only usually between
14 like 100 and 130 dollars a month.

15 I wrote them and I got well we did an
16 estimate. Did an estimate. How did you do an
17 estimate if I've never gone above that price before?
18 Why would you do that? And then if you did go above
19 their budget or if you used more electricity because
20 it's cold or whatever and you tried to pay extra to
21 get that bill back to your budget, they put it on to
22 the taxes and everything else. And your bill kept
23 mounting.

24 So no longer will I get a budget plan
25 because I don't trust these people. So there's so

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 many things that NYSEG has done to the public that
3 needs to be stopped. And I believe if there was an
4 office where we can really go in and talk to somebody
5 and view it and they understand how angry and fed up
6 we're getting, maybe something would happen. So I
7 appreciate your time and effort and listening to
8 everything I have. I really do hope you cannot have
9 increase to NYSEG because they have a lot of things
10 they need to straighten out and come up to what they
11 need to be before they get an increase.

12 And as far as their office closing in
13 a rural area that's absolute asinine. It's just
14 evident right now. I call their number and three
15 weeks later I still haven't heard a phone call from
16 them. Where if I had an in-person office I would
17 have went and made a major complaint and confronted
18 somebody in -- in person. So thank you for listening
19 to me. Have a good night. Thank you so much. But
20 please do not close.

21 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Thank you. And I'd
22 ask you to please hit Star 3 again on your phone.
23 Our next speaker will be Irene Weiser.

24 MS. WEISER: Great. Thank you. I
25 appreciate this last opportunity to speak with you.

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 You know, I -- I've been listening to all of these
3 calls and thinking about what I'm hearing too. And,
4 you know, what I realize is this is a tough business.
5 Electric service is taken for granted when things are
6 going well. But when it's not it gets our attention
7 fast.

8 NYSEG has had a lot of times where
9 they've let the public down. And the impression that
10 gets left is that they don't care about the public
11 welfare. The problems with outages and storm
12 management are well known, but I -- I have an excerpt
13 here from comments from Martha Robertson regarding
14 our airport that were made at last year's August 2019
15 public statement hearing about reliability issues
16 during nonstorm times.

17 Commercial electric power issues at
18 the Ithaca Tompkins Regional Airport have been
19 ongoing. The airport has three electric feeds from
20 NYSEG. The northern feed through the Town of Lansing
21 is notoriously unreliable. This circuit powers
22 critical airport F.A.A. navigation aids like radios,
23 directing lights and related safety equipment which
24 have been subject to frequent outages. When power
25 failed, aircraft are placed at a risk of mishap.

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 We suspect poor quality fluctuations
3 on the NYSEG feed. This is a critical flight safety
4 issue. NYSEG is well aware of these service issues
5 particularly power quality problems in Lansing. This
6 issue is several years old. It's important to
7 understand that storms and accidents can cause power
8 problems that no one can prevent. The issue here is
9 power fluctuations during normal operation of which
10 there are too many.

11 There's been damage at the airport
12 caused by these power fluctuations including a
13 failure or burnout of a 15,000 dollar HVAC unit, a
14 power spike that fried the terminal fire alarm
15 system. Cost to replace it was 175,000 dollars.
16 We've actually been in the process and now completed
17 the process of renovating the airport. But it says
18 that had we not already been planning that project,
19 it would have been a completely unplanned for out of
20 pocket cost.

21 The time between when it failed and
22 when we plan to replace it was 6 months, and we had
23 to fire and stand a fire watch during that time.
24 NYSEG isn't interested in specific damages that they
25 have caused. Without a power recording device, it

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 would be difficult to prove the liability beyond a
3 reasonable doubt.

4 So -- so this is a pervasive kind of
5 problem and they've -- they've let the public down in
6 other ways too. They've failed to hook up our
7 renewable installations in a timely way which leave
8 developers, you know, having had solar arrays that
9 spent an entire summer not earning money for them.
10 And, of course, residents who were excited to tie
11 into renewables were left disappointed.

12 And then into the topic of tonight,
13 what bigger statement is there to the public that the
14 company doesn't hold concern for them than to close
15 customer service centers. I'm struck too at the
16 irony of their rationale in their COVID adjustments
17 that they would keep some customer service centers
18 open until 2021 because they recognize that it will
19 cause a hardship. Yeah, it does. And if it causes a
20 hardship now it causes a hardship period. This is
21 just, you know, this is not -- this is not some
22 manufacturing company whose sole job is to
23 manufacture widgets at the cheapest price. They are
24 in the business of providing service to the public.

25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 And -- and the -- the meager savings that they get by
3 closing customer service centers just is wrong.

4 Further and, you know, we've certainly
5 heard from any number of people over -- over the --
6 these four calls is that they seem tone deaf
7 regarding the economic hardships that people are
8 enduring. There are other problems, and I mentioned
9 this in -- in one of my earlier statements that they
10 failed to respond to I.R.s that are posed by D.P.S.
11 staff. Their performance has been so bad that
12 they've needed a watchdog for oversight of their
13 storm management. And now they need a watchdog for
14 vegetation management too.

15 And the repair of their distribution
16 line damage lags so far behind other companies that
17 they're now being required in -- in this J.P. to have
18 negative revenue adjustments if they don't meet the -
19 - the timelines. Their entire capital plan showed an
20 utter disrespect for our money in submitting a
21 capital plan that was so poorly justified.

22 And then as I delved into the history
23 of their vegetation management to learn that they
24 actually unauthorized, unsanctioned took shortcuts in
25 trimming the trees instead of trimming to the usual

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 10 foot by 15 foot clearance, they -- they took it
3 upon themselves to cut it back to 6 feet by 8 feet to
4 meet their target number of miles and wasted our
5 money for thousands of miles. I don't know how many
6 millions of dollars that that cost us for trees that
7 were not properly trimmed.

8 Bottom line, this is a company that
9 has been indifferent to our suffering and
10 disrespectful of our money. And here's the big
11 piece. They have lost the public trust. They cannot
12 be trusted with a complex project like A.M.I. Not
13 now. I was pleased actually to see that -- that
14 NYSEG's performance in the latest storm response in
15 Westchester was not as bad as other companies. Maybe
16 they are starting to get their act together.

17 But to rebuild trust with their
18 customers, they will have to improve reliability and
19 responsiveness on a consistent basis. Reliability
20 and trust go hand in hand. Please let this be the
21 rate case that finally gets NYSEG on a 5 year trim
22 cycle and D.P.S. reports and audits have recommended
23 since 2009. Develop a plan for when it will be
24 complete. Figure out the financing that NYSEG should
25 be responsible for after all the -- the screwing

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 around that they've done with our money over the
3 years. And not -- not being trustworthy and not
4 taking care of what they should have.

5 Give the watchdog teeth that hopefully
6 won't need to be used and repair the substation and
7 distribution lines. Repairing the grid is the only
8 thing that will repair NYSEG's relationship with
9 their customers. And hopefully by the next rate case
10 we will have the confidence to move forward together
11 towards the clean energy future that we need. Thank
12 you.

13 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Thank you. We have
14 another phone call-in user. We are going to unmute
15 your line. Once you hear that your line has been
16 unmuted please state your name for the record and
17 provide your statement. Also if you have your line
18 muted on your end, you would have to unmute that as
19 well. Is it me? I believe it is.

20 MR. SCHLATHER: Oh, okay. I couldn't
21 get -- it didn't come through in terms of saying that
22 my line was unmuted.

23 A.L.J. COSTELLO: It didn't tell you -
24 -. Okay. Sorry about that.

25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 MR. SCHLATHER: No problem. Hi. My
3 name -- my name is Ken Schlather. I'm a resident of
4 Ovid, New York and -- and I'd like to thank you --.

5 THE COURT REPORTER: Ken?

6 MR. SCHLATHER: Yes.

7 THE COURT REPORTER: This is the court
8 reporter. Could you just spell your last name for
9 me?

10 MR. SCHLATHER: Yes, it is S-C-H and
11 lather, L-A-T-H-E-R.

12 THE COURT REPORTER: Thank you.

13 MR. SCHLATHER: Sure. So I'd like to
14 first thank you for the opportunity to speak. And
15 thank you also for taking the time to listen. I hope
16 that like I have, you found that your time spent
17 listening over these past 4 -- past 2 days with these
18 4 public hearings have been well worth your time. I
19 hope you found the comments of some of the speakers
20 as compelling and as powerful as I have. It's been
21 really remarkable some of the comments that we've
22 heard. I hope they move you like they've moved me.
23 And some of the other people I've talked with since
24 then.

25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 So I'm speaking against the closure of
3 the walk-in service center. With this -- and I'm
4 going to talk about this from 2 -- sort of a from a
5 head and from my heart. From my head, you know, with
6 this proposal NYSEG and RG&E continue this long term
7 trend of decreasing customer service, decreasing
8 reliability and decreasing acceptability. First, I
9 can't imagine that the rationale for this move is a
10 means to reduce service. I mean, I'm sure they're
11 not talking about this as we want to reduce service.

12 But I'm also pretty sure that you have
13 to talk with a lot of people before you would find
14 one person who would find it credible that closing
15 these centers would lead to improved service. So I'm
16 led to believe that -- to the conclusion that it's a
17 cost cutting move. And in that case, I would like to
18 suggest that one place for money -- that one place to
19 actually do some cost cutting and say -- and divert
20 some of that cost cutting to keeping these walk-in
21 centers would be to divert a portion of that nearly
22 half billion dollars that's being sought for smart
23 meters, for A.M.I.s that that could be set aside for
24 customer service. And that it could be -- and -- and

25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 then the smart meter -- the smart meter roll out
3 could be put on hold.

4 Doing this would have two benefits.

5 First, obviously, it would keep the centers open.

6 Second, it would slow down or stop this massive waste
7 of nearly half billion dollars on the proposed smart
8 meter extension. So why do I say it's a waste? NYSEG
9 maintains that they've learned all the lessons they
10 need to learn from the pilot roll out of smart meters
11 in Tompkins County and are now ready to do -- to roll
12 these out across their entire territory. And RG&E as
13 well.

14 I would argue that much more is needed
15 to be learned before embarking on a territory wide
16 expansion. I would argue that the public good and
17 NYSEG and RG&E would be best served with a follow-up
18 pilot study on smart meters. My organization, I was
19 -- I was -- -- I've worked with an organization that
20 was involved in that pilot effort. And our role was
21 to help NYSEG engage with the community, help
22 facilitate community member input and feedback on
23 several of those variables that were being tested in
24 the pilot effort.

25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 And I can safely say that, A, there
3 were many questions that were raised at the beginning
4 of the study, both by NYSEG as well as by other
5 people who were involved in the -- in the -- in the
6 pilot study itself, in the design and in
7 implementation of the pilot study. Many questions
8 were raised at the beginning of that study that --
9 that went unanswered and are still unanswered. And,
10 B, the meters themselves at -- at the end of the day
11 for those members of -- those consumers who were in
12 the pilot were not particularly useful for them.

13 Not useful neither to help save them
14 energy nor to alter their energy wasting habits. Not
15 of their energy wasting behaviors. Furthermore, one
16 of the other driving motivators for the -- for the
17 implementation for the use of the -- the meters was
18 to encourage reduction of electricity use during peak
19 demand. But I should have taken that use to lower
20 demand time periods.

21 However, none of the pricing schemes
22 tested by NYSEG resulted in a level of savings for
23 consumers that -- that would -- that would require --
24 that would cause them to shift their usage from peak
25 time to nonpeak times. And therefore would not

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 actually induce other customers to do that either.

3 The only thing that they could find that would
4 actually induce a shift was to actually just increase
5 rates at peak times to such a level that people would
6 stop using it during peak times.

7 So essentially you're entertaining a
8 request from NYSEG and RG&E to ask rate payers to pay
9 a half billion dollars for technology that so far at
10 least will not help consumers save money, won't help
11 them reduce their energy use and will actually lead
12 to even higher rates for them. Now that -- that's
13 confusing to me so I can imagine it must be -- maybe
14 it's not confusing to you but it certainly is
15 confusing to me.

16 Why would we be asking rate payers to
17 -- to basically fork over a half billion dollars to
18 have their rates go up even higher and to -- and --
19 and not for them to achieve any of the kinds of
20 things that we're actually after in terms of public
21 good. And that's the point, we -- it -- it is
22 confusing and we do need more answers. We do need
23 more investigation into how best to use smart meters
24 to achieve the goals of reduced energy use and reduce
25 cost for consumers.

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 And if that's not done then why don't
3 we just ask the utilities themselves to ante up the
4 money for these meters rather than have rate payers
5 for them. If it's such an important thing for -- for
6 NYSEG and RG&E, have them do it. Take it out of that
7 eight point eight percent investment or return on
8 investment that -- that dividend, that -- that owners
9 of the company have. That's my head.

10 My heart says it -- it's -- I'll just
11 say that, you know, the past few months have
12 certainly been sort of foundation shifting for a lot
13 of people. I'm an old white guy, quote unquote, old
14 white guy and -- and I know as an old white guy I'm
15 along with a lot of other old white guys had fixed
16 views on a lot of things that probably need to shift.
17 And -- and I can say that some of them have shifted.

18 I can also say that, you know, all of
19 us I think are probably have at least a little bit
20 questioned our own immortality. In other words these
21 last few months with so much -- with so much -- with
22 so much mortality, with so much -- with so many
23 people having lost their lives I think all of us are
24 thinking about our own mortality a bit more. And I
25 would just ask the Public Service Commission members

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 who are here to speak to your colleagues on the
3 Public Service Commission and ask if, you know, if in
4 fact you were to pass relatively soon what would you
5 want one of your last decisions to be. To approve
6 this or to actually vote against it? Thank you.

7 A.L.J. COSTELLO: Thank you. At this
8 time we don't have any indication that anyone else
9 wants to speak. We will just give the phone in
10 callers one more opportunity to hit Star 3 if they
11 want to make a statement. And we'll wait a minute.
12 And after that we're going to close the hearing.

13 Okay. Nobody else has indicated that
14 they would like to make a statement. We want to
15 remind you that you can throughout the pendency of
16 these proceedings you can submit public comments by
17 other means that have been described earlier and in
18 the Notice of Public Statement Hearing issued on July
19 28th, 2020. If you are participating electronically,
20 the information is also available on the WebEx
21 screen. At this point Judge Clarke and I would like
22 to thank the commenters for their participation. We
23 also would like to thank Commissioners Burman and
24 Howard for their presence and attention to everyone's
25 comments. And our consumer services office for

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.
2 administering this session. And finally the court
3 reporter. The hearing is now concluded and we can go
4 off the record.

5 (Off the record 7:28 p.m.)
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1 19-E-0378,19-G-0379,19-E-0380,19-G-0381 - 8-27-20 - 6 P.M.

2 STATE OF NEW YORK

3 I, JANET WALLRAVIN, do hereby certify that the foregoing
4 was reported by me, in the cause, at the time and place,
5 as stated in the caption hereto, at Page 1 hereof; that
6 the foregoing typewritten transcription consisting of
7 pages 1 through 51, is a true record of all proceedings
8 had at the hearing.

9 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
10 subscribed my name, this the 3rd day of September, 2020.

11

12

13 JANET WALLRAVIN, Reporter

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25