

# ESCO Offers Savings Over Utility Tariffs

## Electric Variable Price Offer Savings - Total Market

The by-passable New York utility residential electric service rate minus the lowest clean ESCO variable price offer posted on the New York power to choose multiplied by total residential electric load

Year/Utility	Central Hudson Electric	ConEd Electric	NYSEG Electric	NIMMO Electric	O&R Electric	RGE Electric	Total - New York Market
2011	\$70,522,346.46	\$3,718,715,556.10	\$124,009,585.05	\$163,224,576.84	\$69,514,524.59	\$43,778,079.56	\$4,189,764,668.60
2012	\$64,594,218.63	\$2,362,347,179.73	\$159,155,056.11	\$221,220,746.21	\$60,035,316.32	\$59,147,189.44	\$2,926,499,706.45
2013	\$52,075,997.42	\$3,292,690,293.44	\$146,376,443.15	\$371,436,314.98	\$69,398,647.04	\$115,662,958.92	\$4,047,640,654.95
2014	\$66,753,613.35	\$3,817,763,059.83	\$203,797,485.98	\$365,216,666.72	\$65,088,669.76	\$82,889,285.04	\$4,601,508,780.68
2015	\$39,683,988.57	\$1,572,488,342.47	\$91,397,950.96	\$213,817,747.68	\$31,124,954.24	\$24,098,736.02	\$1,972,611,719.94
2016	\$8,722,763.32	\$335,019,028.17	\$16,243,573.63	\$38,473,405.18	\$18,208,276.63	\$6,432,828.53	\$423,099,875.45
<b>Total</b>	\$302,352,927.75	\$15,099,023,459.74	\$740,980,094.88	\$1,373,389,457.61	\$313,370,388.59	\$332,009,077.51	\$18,161,125,406.08

## Electric Variable Price Offer Savings - Typical Customer

The by-passable New York utility residential electric service rate minus the lowest ESCO variable offer posted on New York power to choose multiplied by the electric load of a typical residential customer

Year	Central Hudson	ConEd	NIMMO	NYSEG	O&R	RGE
2011	\$254.49	\$190.79	\$103.05	\$196.00	\$337.42	\$141.74
2012	\$263.62	\$121.98	\$107.74	\$200.07	\$215.21	\$168.51
2013	\$204.65	\$236.29	\$200.87	\$216.09	\$278.31	\$338.95
2014	\$245.69	\$321.58	\$190.25	\$272.71	\$267.99	\$232.70
2015	\$138.62	\$110.84	\$110.81	\$142.56	\$129.89	\$72.89
2016	\$62.39	\$31.16	\$28.90	\$41.68	\$46.71	\$27.20
<b>Total</b>	\$1,169.46	\$1,012.64	\$741.63	\$1,069.11	\$1,275.54	\$982.00
<b>Average</b>	\$194.91	\$168.77	\$123.61	\$178.19	\$212.59	\$163.67

## Electric 12-Month Fixed Price Offer Savings - Total Market

The by-passable New York utility residential electric service rate minus the lowest clean ESCO fixed price offer posted on the New York power to choose multiplied by total residential electric load

Year/Utility	Central Hudson Electric	ConEd Electric	NYSEG Electric	NIMMO Electric	O&R Electric	RGE Electric	Total - New York Market
2011	(\$6,601,235.46)	(\$313,132,757.39)	(\$15,641,446.99)	(\$57,512,077.53)	\$29,190,350.85	(\$4,029,125.09)	(\$367,726,291.62)
2012	\$1,287,135.12	(\$718,229,071.32)	(\$29,630,454.48)	(\$71,594,946.04)	\$15,295,530.37	(\$23,730,921.60)	(\$826,602,727.94)
2013	\$15,055,712.52	\$1,792,311,927.20	\$40,457,417.97	\$39,952,750.16	\$45,192,747.68	\$20,436,720.40	\$1,953,407,275.93
2014	\$30,788,595.48	\$2,290,683,324.57	\$85,059,144.06	\$123,487,629.07	\$55,237,335.40	\$49,107,445.96	\$2,634,363,474.55
2015	(\$9,507,260.21)	(\$810,256,902.26)	(\$35,034,186.62)	(\$118,857,238.01)	\$35,375,800.30	(\$21,113,674.40)	(\$959,393,461.21)
2016	(\$10,414,448.44)	(\$704,119,000.38)	(\$24,513,858.45)	(\$75,244,717.07)	\$1,833,462.22	(\$12,001,971.68)	(\$824,460,533.80)
<b>Total</b>	\$20,608,499.03	\$1,537,257,520.42	\$20,696,615.47	(\$159,768,599.42)	\$182,125,226.82	\$8,668,473.58	\$1,609,587,735.91

# Assumptions

## Electric Utility Bypassable Charges Used

Utility	Bypassable Charges
Central Hudson	Market Price Charge (MPC) Merchant Function Charge (MFC) - Supply Market Price Adjustment (MPA)
Con Edison	Market Supply Charge (MSC) Market Supply Charge Adjustment I (MSCA I) Market Supply Charge Adjustment II (MSCA II) Merchant Function Charge (MFC)
National Grid (NiMo)	Electric Supply Cost (ESCost) Merchant Function Charge (MFC) Electricity Supply Reconciliation Mechanism (ESRM) Customer Service Backout Credit Mechanism (CSBC) <sup>1</sup>
NYSE&G	Commodity Charge Merchant Function Charge (MFC)
Orange & Rockland (O&R)	Market Supply Charge (MSC) Market Supply Charge Adjustment (MSCA) Merchant Function Charge (MFC) Transition Adjustment for Competitive Services (TACS) <sup>2</sup>
Rochester Gas & Electric (RGE)	Commodity Charge Merchant Function Charge (MFC)

1. The CSBC expired 1/1/12

2. The TACS includes only the bypassable portion of the charge

## ESCO Offer Definitions

Variable Offer Definition	Offer Type classification of Variable on New York Power to Choose website Offer term is 2 months or less
Fixed Offer Definition	Offer Type classification of Fixed on New York Power to Choose website Offer term is 12 months or 1 year
ESCO Offer Applicable Month	Offers created on or before the 15th of each month will apply to the current month (Ex: 1/15/15 assumes Jan 2015) Offers created after the 15th of each month will apply to the prompt month (Ex: 1/16/15 assumes Feb 2015)
Variable Offers Excluded from Analysis	Duplicate Offers - Offers from the same ESCO, for the same price and during the same applicable month Offers with a term greater than 2 months
Fixed Offers Excluded from Analysis	Duplicate Offers - Offers from the same ESCO, for the same price and during the same applicable month Offers with a term less than 1 year or greater than 1 year Offers that are fixed for less than 12 months and become variable remainder of term Offers with intro prices applicable for less than 12 months Offers providing cash back, gift cards, or any monetary reward incentives Offers designated for only active duty military or veterans Offers designated for only ACN customers

**Aggregate Residential Load Derivation**

<b>Central Hudson</b>	Aggregate monthly residential load came from utility's response to IR DE-1, Question 4 Zonal load breakdown developed using customer statistics provided on utility's website.
<b>ConEd</b>	Aggregate monthly residential load for 8/1/2012 through 12/31/2016 came from utility's response to IR DE-1, Question 4 Aggregate monthly residential load from 1/1/2011 through 7/31/12 uses values from the 8/1/2012 through 7/31/2013 year provide by ConEd Zonal load breakdown developed using customer statistics provided on utility's website.
<b>NMPC</b>	Aggregate monthly residential load came from utility's response to IR DE-1, Question 4 Zonal load breakdown was developed using historical annual energy by zone found in NYISO's Gold Book
<b>NYSEG</b>	Aggregate monthly residential load came from utility's response to IR DE-1, Question 4 Zonal load breakdown was developed using historical annual energy by zone found in NYISO's Gold Book
<b>O&amp;R</b>	Aggregate monthly residential load for 1/1/2012 through 12/31/2016 came from utility's response to IR DE-1, Question 4
<b>RGE</b>	Aggregate monthly residential load from 1/1/2011 through 1/1/2012 uses values from the 1/1/2012 through 12/31/2013 year provide by O&R Aggregate monthly residential load came from utility's response to IR DE-1, Question 4

**Typical Residential Customer Load Derivation**

<b>Central Hudson</b>	Monthly volumes derived using Central Hudson's published RNH load profile
<b>ConEd</b>	Monthly volumes for NYC were derived running 2016 weather data against ConEd's published weather response function for the SC1-D load profile Monthly volumes for WC were derived running 2016 weather data against ConEd's published weather response function for the SC1-E load profile
<b>NMPC</b>	Monthly volumes were derived by first taking the shape of NMPC's published SC-1, SC1B load profile and applying this shape to the 2016 load of ConEd's SC1-E load profile
<b>NYSEG</b>	Monthly volumes derived using NYSEG's published SC1 load profile
<b>O&amp;R</b>	Monthly volumes were derived by first taking the 2016 shape of O&R's published 0001 load profile and applying this shape to the 2016 load of ConEd's SC1-E load profile
<b>RGE</b>	Monthly volumes derived using RGE's published 101 load profile

### Additional Notes

1. Historical ESCO offers obtained from New York PSC Matter 13-01029
2. There is a gap in the ESCO offer data provided by NY Power to Choose from 11/1/15 through 6/30/16
3. Utility tariff rates are applied according to the specified effective data published in the tariffs.

### Sources

New York Power to Choose website:	<a href="http://www.newyorkpowertochoose.com/index.cfm">http://www.newyorkpowertochoose.com/index.cfm</a>
New York PSC Matter 13-01029:	<a href="http://documents.dps.ny.gov/public/MatterManagement/CaseMaster.aspx?MatterCaseNo=13-01029&amp;submit=Search">http://documents.dps.ny.gov/public/MatterManagement/CaseMaster.aspx?MatterCaseNo=13-01029&amp;submit=Search</a>
Current and historical utility tariff rates from New York PSC:	<a href="https://www2.dps.ny.gov/ETS/search/presearch.cfm">https://www2.dps.ny.gov/ETS/search/presearch.cfm</a>
Tariff rates for Central Hudson	<a href="https://www.cenhud.com/rates">https://www.cenhud.com/rates</a>
Tariff rates for Consolidated Edison:	<a href="https://www.coned.com/en/rates-tariffs/rates">https://www.coned.com/en/rates-tariffs/rates</a>
Tariff rates for NYSEG:	<a href="http://www.nyseg.com/SuppliersAndPartners/pricingandtariffs/default.html">http://www.nyseg.com/SuppliersAndPartners/pricingandtariffs/default.html</a>
Tariff rates for NGRID NIMO:	<a href="https://www9.nationalgridus.com/niagaramohawk/home/rates/billing.asp">https://www9.nationalgridus.com/niagaramohawk/home/rates/billing.asp</a>
Tariff rates for Orange and Rockland:	<a href="https://www.oru.com/en/rates-tariffs">https://www.oru.com/en/rates-tariffs</a>
Tariff rates for Rochester Gas and Electric:	<a href="http://www.rge.com/SuppliersAndPartners/pricingandtariffs/default.html">http://www.rge.com/SuppliersAndPartners/pricingandtariffs/default.html</a>
FERC Form 1 annual load volumes:	<a href="https://elibrary.ferc.gov/idmws/search/fercadvsearch.asp">https://elibrary.ferc.gov/idmws/search/fercadvsearch.asp</a>
New York DPS utility monthly load volumes:	<a href="http://www3.dps.ny.gov/W/PSCWeb.nsf/All/441D4686DF065C5585257687006F396D?OpenDocument">http://www3.dps.ny.gov/W/PSCWeb.nsf/All/441D4686DF065C5585257687006F396D?OpenDocument</a>
ConEd number of customer statistics by zone:	<a href="https://www.coned.com/en/business-partners/service-territories">https://www.coned.com/en/business-partners/service-territories</a>
Central Hudson zonal load assumptions:	<a href="https://www.cenhud.com/static_files/cenhud/assets/cenhud/CHG&amp;E%20-%20LTP.pdf">https://www.cenhud.com/static_files/cenhud/assets/cenhud/CHG&amp;E%20-%20LTP.pdf</a>
ConEd average customer consumption by zone:	<a href="https://www.coned.com/en/about-us/corporate-facts">https://www.coned.com/en/about-us/corporate-facts</a>
NYISO 2017 Load & Capacity Data "Gold Book":	<a href="http://www.nyiso.com/public/markets_operations/services/planning/documents/index.jsp">http://www.nyiso.com/public/markets_operations/services/planning/documents/index.jsp</a>